

Education and Culture Committee

Scotland's Educational and Cultural Future

On behalf of the RSA Fellows' Media, Creative Industries, Culture and Heritage Network

(See formal governance note below)

1. Background and overview

The RSA Fellows' Media, Creative Industries, Culture and Heritage Network is a Thematic Network approved by the Trustees of the Royal Society of Arts [www.theRSA.org]. It convened two debates to consider the call for a written response re Scotland's Educational and Cultural Future. This paper distils these discussions into a commentary that addresses two of the enquiry themes: Further & Higher Education; and particularly Broadcasting and Culture.

It is submitted in the name of the **RSA Fellows' MCICH Network** and has been seen in draft by delegated Trustee authority prior to submission.

It is however important that, as a matter of formal governance, it is a submission exclusively distilling the views of those listed below who attended these two specific debates and in no way whatsoever constitutes a formal policy reply on behalf of the RSA as a whole, a charity registered in England and Wales (212424) and Scotland (SC037784).

The two groups of attendees demonstrate a wide variety of expertise and experience, with, intentionally, attendance and perspectives from beyond Scotland being brought into play, if only for the purposes of comparison of approach.

Preliminary Meeting:

Venue: Danish Cultural Institute on the 12th February 2014:

Dr Kim Minke

Director, Danish Cultural Institute and former Director, School of Journalism, Aarhus

Dr Debbie Mays FRSA HonFRIAS

Assistant Secretary, Royal Incorporation of Architects in Scotland;
MCICH Steering Group Member

Consul Kristín Hannesdóttir, Consulate of Iceland

And practicing Architect in Edinburgh

Consul John Clifford FRSA

Focus Scotland; Austrian Consul for Scotland,
Member, Business Committee, General Council, University of Edinburgh

Mr Diarmid Hearn
Head of Policy, The National Trust for Scotland

Mr Euan Leitch
Advocacy & Communications Officer - Historic Environment, Built Environment Forum
Scotland

Mr Andrew Ormston FRSA
Director of Drew Wylie Ltd.
Creative Europe Programme Expert and Council of Europe Cultural Policy Expert

Professor Emeritus Merylyn Smith FRSA
Professor of Fine Art, Liverpool John Moores University

David Stevenson FRSA
Programme leader, Arts Management programme, Queen Margaret University;
who also researches cultural participation and participation policies

Joanne Orr
Chief Executive Museums Galleries Scotland and Member, UNESCO Scotland Committee

Mrs Ann Packard FRSA HonFRIAS
Chairman, Steering Group, RSA Fellows' Media, Creative Industries, Culture & Heritage
Network and one-time member (i) Advisory Committee for Scotland, Independent Broadcasting
Authority, (ii) Access Committee and its Education Sub-Committee, Royal Opera House and
(ii) Scottish Arts Council Capital Lottery Committee

Meeting on 17th February 2014:

Venue: Edinburgh office of Anderson Strathern LLP

Mrs Ann Packard FRSA HonFRIAS
Chairman, Steering Group, RSA Fellows' Media, Creative Industries, Culture & Heritage Net-
work (see fuller information above)

Mr Alun Thomas FRSA
Partner, Anderson Strathern LLP

Mrs Mollie Marcellino
Trustee and a Past President, Scottish Arts Club and one time British School in Rome Scholar

Federico Lubrani
Researcher and conservation management professional

Tricia Illsley MA BEd
Perth and Kinross Council Education & Children's Services. Associate Assessor with Education
Scotland and is a Board Member, Community Learning & Development Managers Scotland

Charles Lovatt FRSA
Music professional and Fellow at the University of St Andrews and Member, Board of Trustees,
National Library of Scotland and former Board Member, Creative Scotland

Ruthanne Baxter MA BMus PGCE FRSA
Attending in capacity of freelance learning consultant

Dr Lynn Whitaker
Lecturer in Cultural Industries & Cultural Policy (Theatre, Film and TV Studies), University of Glasgow, and Trustee, Voice of the Listener and Viewer

Rhona Brankin HonFRIBA
MSP 1999-2011 (Labour/Midlothian) and one time Cabinet Secretary

Wendy Law FRSA
Director, Turning Point West Midlands and formerly of Scottish Arts Council

Lorraine Fannin OBE BA DipEd
Member of the Board of Trustees at the National Library of Scotland, and Chairman of the Edinburgh UNESCO City of Literature Council.

Alexander Close
Public Relations, Media and Press Manager, Museums Galleries Scotland

Stella Garcia Moreno
Law Graduate (University of Murcia, Spain); in Edinburgh studying at Basil Paterson College of English

Tania Czajka
Artistic director / performer / maker , Le Petit Monde

Pam Wardell
Books Alive (and formerly of BBC)

Consul John Clifford FRSA
Focus Scotland; Austrian Consul for Scotland;
Member, Business Committee, General Council, University of Edinburgh

Isabel Moura Mendes
Arts, Festivals & Cultural Manager;
Film Programmer

Juliet Wood, Creative Industries Lecturer, Edinburgh College

2. Overview

The two meetings were called to provide an opportunity for RSA Fellows in Scotland and other interested parties to discuss the questions raised by the enquiry in a forum that allowed them to respond as individuals and **NOT** as representatives of their employer or institution. Attendees, as indicated, came from a wide variety of disciplines, sectors and career points.

The discussions ended up focusing on four key points. The first two points apply regardless of the result of the Referendum on potential independence.

- a. There is a need to focus on supporting and increasing production across the cultural and creative industries. The issues of quality and critical mass are central to the future success of Scottish culture.

- b. Prioritising education and training that responds to industry developments and best practice is key, and this approach needs to embrace the full scope of education and training provision.
- c. Leadership is needed to create and maintain vision, continuity and confidence. A daunting amount of practical, detailed work and negotiation is required for a successful transition to any independent Scotland. This needs to be well resourced and co-ordinated in the context of a unifying vision.
- d. The opportunity further to further the sector will be successful if built on the development and maintenance of strong international relationships at every level of the sector, from practitioner to SME, producer to Government.

3. Commentary

The commentary focuses on the third theme of the enquiry with some initial and related comments on the first theme. The issue of education and training in the creative and cultural sectors did, however, form a substantial part of the discussion in both meetings.

Theme 1, Further and Higher Education

Q. The social, cultural and financial contribution made by international students

The primary purpose of the meetings were to consider **Theme 3** of the consultation, but there was also discussion of some issues relating to Theme 1 in so much that education, training, skills and employability were considered as key to the future of broadcasting and cultural production in Scotland.

The importance of early years learning and child care (**Theme 2**) were deemed self-evidently important.

There are distinct advantages and disadvantages to the current 4 year degree in Scotland. Graduates do have a more developed and 'industry ready' education and skill set after four years. However, Scottish providers are less competitive in an international marketplace where 3 year degrees are the norm. Furthermore partnerships with institutions in other countries are made more difficult. International students and research collaborations make a valuable social and economic contribution to the country and the current system is in need of review to ensure opportunities are not lost.

Theme 3, Broadcasting and Culture

Q. The current capacity of Scottish producers, and whether any planning and investment would be required to increase opportunities for this sector.

There is a need to focus on supporting and stimulating production across the culture, creative and broadcasting sectors. This means reversing a decline in broadcasting production as identified in the White Paper, 'Scotland's Future'. Scotland should be ambitious in sub-sectors where

knowledge exchange and research are at a premium. The need to encourage high quality production across the sectors was emphasised, along with the interdependence of different creative and cultural sub-sectors on one another. There is a need for a critical mass of employment and production opportunities to attract and retain a skilled workforce.

An example of the need to support risk taking in the field of Scottish Literature was offered to illustrate how creative investment stimulates and sustains the associated industry. Both the economic and social benefits of cultural investment are not fully developed in Scotland and require attention which complements a commitment to the intrinsic value of culture.

A renewal of support and funds for FE is also needed to improve overall levels of employability. Ensuring different agencies working in skills development and education integrate and coordinate their work is a role of Government. Closing the future educational attainment gap and the contribution of developing literacy skills from pre-school age should also be priorities. This is an area where learning from the example of other countries could be very useful, including wider approaches to play, creativity and informal learning. A focus on the child rather than results is likely to be most effective along with supporting the role of the family.

Skills shortages have been identified in specific sub-sectors, including broadcasting and the performing arts, and there have been a variety of responses including apprenticeships. A review of the various potential entry points for careers in the sector could support options for future interventions and developments, such as an increase in foundation education and training. Furthermore the provision of expert training and education and up to date facilities to support it appears to be less co-ordinated and strategic than desirable.

The challenge of connecting education, training and the related industry skills and knowledge requirement is paramount. The sector changes and develops rapidly, particularly concerning technological and digital innovations, and an effective mechanism to translate industry trends into training delivery would be likely to enhance the performance of the sector as a whole.

Theme 3, Broadcasting and Culture

Q. How Scottish cultural bodies currently work together with their counterpart bodies in the rest of the UK, and whether this relationship may change;

Q. The likely future role for UK bodies that have some cultural or creative function in Scotland.

The impact of independence on Lottery funding post future Lottery Licence renewals *et cetera* will be important, particularly in sectors like heritage where Scottish levels of investment have to date outperformed demographics. The need to ensure continuity of funding and support is essential as many projects, programmes and organisations depend on UK Lottery and NGO investment and advice.

There will also be an impact on sub-sectors where UK NGOs still operate, like film and heritage. Scotland's heritage sector is world class with sufficient expertise to ensure strategic ambitions and standards of practice do not reduce in the event of independence. It is likely that the

newly created Scottish Film Hub can create an effective vehicle to look after the interests of Scottish audiences. The bigger questions lie in the field of production in the creation of a new SBS in the case of independence.

There are, however, a range of **interdependencies across the cultural sector**, from touring companies to National Galleries to the National Library of Scotland and a well resourced and co-ordinated response across the sector will be required. The case for investing in more international dialogue and collaboration is made later in this response, but also applies to these questions.

Theme 3, Broadcasting and Culture

Q. The practical, legislative, technical and financial arrangements that would be required to establish an SBS;

Q. The impact on other broadcasters of establishing an SBS;

Q. How broadcasting would be regulated in the event of Scotland becoming an independent country.

The White Paper proposes a new Scottish Broadcasting System.

There are, inevitably, a range of issues on which technical, detailed, objective and independent evidence is required before cogent comments may be made:

These include very specific and as yet unclarified questions such as:

- What style of Charter (determined by whom) is proposed?
- What style of governance will be enshrined by Charter to ensure full independence of government?

(The White Paper is too “broad brush”. It is thought to lack substance on Charter, Board Structure and Board appointment Procedures, as also appropriate objective detail on almost all fundamental Issues including funding/viability, regulation and Licence levies in the long term)

- What would be any SBS/BBC World Service relationship basis given the 2014 funding transition and what would be any SBS/BBC Worldwide relationships and at what costs?
- What continuation of lease is possible on the BBC Scotland buildings (Glasgow, The Tun, Inverness, Aberdeen etc etc) and at what operational and insurance costs and on what conditions?
- On what basis and timescale and relationship would any SBS link with/to BBC i-player?
- What damage would be done to Scottish broadcasting if BBC economies of scale are lost?
- On what basis/costs/timescale would the existing transmission and distribution costs be assumed, given that these are managed by a commercial company and not the BBC?
- What will be legal and operation situation be as regards scheduling?
- What safeguards will there be to ensure diversity in any Audience Council (by e.g. ethnicity, gender, age and geography)?
- Will the technical and engineering regulation be contracted by negotiation to the existing regulator (at what cost) or by what process would any appointment be made to ensure both expertise, due powers and “teeth” and full independence of government?
- What is the detail of content regulation and by whom on what basis will it be regulated?
- What would the relationship be between any two such regulators?
- What are the Licensing Authority proposals?
- How and from what date would any within Scotland levied Licence Fees be ringfenced (from 2016?) and precisely what categories and numbers of people will be subsidized?

- What specific account has been taken of the costs which would necessarily be incurred in respect of Licence Fee collection, evasion and subsidy e.g. for those aged seventy five and over given future demographic issues.
- If any SBS is established (**and many deem this not viable**) would it constitute a “Foreign broadcaster” to be a “carrier” and would BBC allow transmission (and on what basis) of current affairs programmes which will remain of interest to residents throughout the UK?
- What, precisely, will be the position of ALBA in any new separate state and will it receive the same levels of funding and will these be (i) index linked and (ii) exclusively within the control of the Scottish Government

All this requires the co-operation and resources of the existing BBC infrastructure and identifying the position of the BBC concerning these proposals will be important to future planning. There are a wide range of practical issues to consider (see some sample questions above), including: the use of BBC assets; access to BBC i-player; continuity of services and third party contracts; future licence income; overall financial implications; governance and regulation. The impact of the proposals on STV, BBC ALBA and other producers involved in on-line and community television distribution needs to be understood. An examination of comparators such as RTÉ in Ireland and regionalisation in Spain should support an understanding of the impact of different approaches to employment and growth. Examples like C4 may throw light on future opportunities to support high quality production and the associated distribution partnerships. This deeper understanding could then inform how best to incentivise production, including the application of tax breaks.

Scotland needs a production base and infrastructure for television and film and the needs of the latter should not be overshadowed by the SBS debate. Impact and competitiveness will result from developing a multiplicity of platforms, not from the creation of the new institution. The defining issues of investment, commissioning and quality will need commitment from all concerned. The question of whether this can be best achieved with a new SBS or through redefining the BBC relationship is pertinent. There are similar issues to consider in areas where UK relationships may work well for Scotland. For example the work of the V&A, Contemporary Art Society, NESTA, British Library and BFI all provide support where renegotiation rather than duplication may be the best way forward.

Theme 3, Broadcasting and Culture

Q. The benefits that could derive to Scotland if its cultural and creative output were promoted more widely;

Q. How new powers over the economy and an overseas diplomatic and trade network could encourage the Scottish cultural and creative sectors.

Looking outwards to other countries for co-production, inward investment and market opportunities is important. This will be effective if it builds on the existing international profile of

‘product’ and is framed in a commitment to international cultural exchange, dialogue and knowledge exchange. Providing Scottish professionals with the tools and profile to develop their promotional activities at home and abroad is likely to be effective.

Scotland should invest in building and sustaining international relationships across the sector, and in a continuing process of exploring and learning from best practice around the world. Existing Trade Mission models may not represent the most effective use of investment and there is a need to ensure the best outcomes for Scotland from the British Council and BBC World Service are still delivered. Transnational hubs and networks are increasingly important in the creative and cultural spheres. When it comes to European investment this will be more effective if the Scottish Government is not overly prescriptive in how it is applied, allowing practitioners and other stakeholders to influence strategy and directly access investment. Scottish cultural diplomacy will be particularly useful in creating future international relationships that benefit the economy as a whole.

Regulation and governance will be important. An independent Scotland will have a written constitution which will protect institutions from inappropriate political interference and would anchor the charter for a new Scottish Broadcasting Service, whatever governance model is adopted. While there is a need to enshrine diversity and access, legislation should be ‘light touch’, learning from the approach taken by the National Library of Scotland in managing its change process. Ofcom may still have a contribution to make. The constitutional and policy issues raised in the Leveson Enquiry will need to be addressed in a Scottish regulatory framework, along with alignments with the European Union on these matters.

A Scottish cultural policy which directly addresses the right of access to culture is a priority. The policy should promote an integrated approach across the cultural and creative industries. It should also rest on a clear outcomes framework that does not threaten, but positively supports artistic freedom. The current consultation is an opportunity to seek the views of a wide range of stakeholders and participants in the cultural and creative industries concerning their vision for the future. This work could underpin both the principles of a Scottish cultural policy and an associated narrative that could involve people from all parts of Scottish society.