

SUBMISSION FROM EAST LoTHIAN COUNCIL

Thank you for your email of 18 December seeking evidence for the Committee's inquiry into Women and Work. I am replying on behalf of the Council's Chief Executive, Angela Leitch. I set out below material dealing with the topics you raise.

1. Details of any specific education initiatives aimed at addressing gender segregation in the labour market – for instance, encouraging schoolgirls towards typically male-dominated sectors like science, engineering, technology and mathematics.

1.1 Our schools are conscious of the scope for promoting traditionally "male" occupations to girls.

1.2 All our secondary schools have links with LEAPS – the Lothian Equal Access Programme for Schools – which is a consortium of universities / higher education institutions in the Lothians that works together to promote and support young people in secondary schools to consider a university place. It includes Edinburgh, Napier, Heriot Watt and Queen Margaret universities as well as the Scottish Agricultural College and Edinburgh Art College. They do emphasize the opportunities for girls to follow 'non traditional' career paths.

1.3 The East Lothian Skill Centre runs a course for girls in their fourth year at school, called "Girls Allowed". It takes place weekly over a period of 12 weeks and is designed to support girls in making a successful transition from school to work, further education or training. The course covers life skills, employability skills, career information, job-seeking skills and personal presentation, and uses a system of goal-setting and mentoring.

1.4 Many of our secondary schools bring in speakers to talk about a range of occupations, including those that girls might not normally consider, for example trainee apprentices at Torness nuclear power station.

1.5 Our primary and secondary schools also take part in mathematics challenges and engineering challenges run by national organisations.

1.6 The Council's Community Learning and Development Services (with input from partners) runs six-month courses entitled New Opportunities for Women in East Lothian (NOWEL). These courses are aimed at women with no or low qualifications to help them gain more confidence, learn new skills and develop a support network that enables them to make informed decisions about their life choices as well as progressing into to education, training or employment. Post-course support is continued with staff from Guideline, East Lothian Council's Adult Guidance Service, who follow up students in order to monitor and track progression. The course has evolved over the four years it has been offered, building on evaluation results to become as student-centred as possible, with work-experience placements setup for those who would benefit, integrated literacy support, IT training and basic accredited training in First Aid and Elementary Food Hygiene (these last two are seen to be desirable qualifications by many employers). Transport costs are reimbursed and free childcare is available on-site. The course is open to women only, in order to create the supportive safe environment necessary for women of low self esteem to grow in

confidence and return to learning. The course is open to women of all races, religions and ages, including women who have had health or mental health problems in the past and women whose first language is not English.

2. Information on how our authority promotes equal pay and how our authority's pay, broken down by gender, reflects that.

2.1 The Council has implemented Equal Pay (through Single Status) and also introduced the Living Wage for Council employees.

2.2 Best practice outlined by the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) recommends that equal pay reviews are the most appropriate method of delivering a pay system free from gender bias. East Lothian Council has begun to carry out annual audits on the Single Status Local Government Employee (LGE) Pay and Grading Structure including all relevant contractual pay elements in line with best practice outlined by the EHRC. (In recognition of the equality protected characteristics enshrined in the Equalities Act 2010, analysis will be extended to include ethnicity, disability, age with effect from 2012/13 and religion/belief and sexual orientation from 2013/14.)

2.3 We plan to report the results of the pay audit carried out in 2012 in the Council's Mainstreaming Equality report (expected to be published on 30th April 2013 as required under the Equality Act).

2.4 I attach for information a copy of the Council's Equal Pay Statement published in 2007 and the report to the Council's Management Team of the pay audit carried out in 2011.

3. Good-practice examples from within our organisation relating to gender equalities.

3.1 The Council has developed flexible working practices to support a family friendly workplace, including childcare vouchers and parental leave.

3.2 The Council has included women's health issues as a core part of the Healthy Working Lives programme for our staff.

3.3 Through the Fairer East Lothian Fund, the Council has funded the 'New Opportunities for Women in East Lothian' project mentioned under paragraph 1.6 above to support and encourage vulnerable women into employment, and the 'Supporting Vulnerable Parents' project which works mainly with women.

3.4 The Council has established the Violence Against Women Partnership to tackle the issue of violence against women, including the development of a Domestic Abuse Workplace Policy, launch of 'Home not a safe place' website and resource and support for the White Ribbon Campaign.

3.5 The Council celebrates International Women's Day each year through film screenings, community days, coffee mornings and celebrating local suffragettes.

3.6 East Lothian's "Support from the Start" initiative, designed as part of the "Equally Well" initiative to tackle health inequalities, has a strong focus on supporting positive parenting. Working with women is a core part of this.

Angela Leitch
Chief Executive
East Lothian Council
5 February 2013

REPORT TO: Corporate Management Team

MEETING DATE: 21 April 2011

BY: Head of Human Resources

SUBJECT: Single Status Local Government Employee Equal Pay Audit 2010

1 PURPOSE

- 1.1 East Lothian Council implemented the Single Status Agreement for the Scottish Joint Councils' Local Government Employees (LGE) on 1 June 2008. This harmonised the pay and grading and terms and conditions of former APT&C and Manual Workers, including Residential and Nursery employees, bringing them into one pay and grading structure. The structure complies with the legal principles of equal pay for work of equal value and the purpose of the LGE Equal Pay Audit is to ensure that we have addressed as many inequality issues which existed prior to 1 June 2008 as possible and to reaffirm that our LGE pay structure continues to meet the requirements of the Equal Pay Act.
- 1.2 Best practice outlined by the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) recommends that equal pay reviews are the most appropriate method of delivering a pay system free from gender bias. An equal pay audit involves comparing the pay of protected groups who are doing equal work, investigating the causes of any pay gaps by gender and planning to close any gaps that cannot be justified. As a general rule, any differences of 5% or more will require exploration and explanation. An equal pay audit may highlight an important aspect of potential discrimination in employment – unequal pay for equal work. It is not simply a data collection exercise. It entails a commitment to put right any unjustified pay inequalities and this means that the audit must have the involvement and support of management with the authority and commitment to deliver the necessary changes.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 Corporate Management Team are asked to:
- Agree that the Council continues to carry out and publish annual audits on the Single Status LGE Pay and Grading Structure including all relevant contractual pay elements in line with best practice outlined by the EHRC.

- Agree that analysis of other employee groups i.e. Teaching, Craft and Chief Official, are included in future audits from 2011/12.
- Agree, in recognition of the equality protected characteristics enshrined in the equalities Act 2010, that analysis is extended to include ethnicity, disability, age with effect from 2011/12 and religion/belief and sexual orientation from 2012/13.
- Agree overtime payments continue to be monitored in future audits and the findings reported to Corporate Management Team as part of the annual equal pay audit.
- Agree any accelerated increments continue to be monitored in future audits and the findings reported to Corporate Management Team as part of the annual pay audit.
- That following the approval of Corporate Management Team, this report will be submitted to the Local Government Employees Conditions of Service Review Group for their information.
- That any Department-specific areas of concern identified in the body of this report will be remitted to Executive Directors to ensure that appropriate action is taken.

3 BACKGROUND

- 3.1 The Equal Pay Act 1970 and the Equal Pay (Amendment) Regulations (1983) require that employees doing equal work in the same employment must receive equal pay. Equal work is work that is the same or broadly similar, work that has been rated as equivalent or work that is of equal value.
- 3.2 The independent Equalities Impact Assessment carried out prior to implementation of the Single Status Pay and Grading Structure recommended that East Lothian Council carry out regular pay audits to monitor the new grade structure and to ensure that pay equality is addressed over the full cycle of implementation.
- 3.3 Whilst equal pay audits are not mandatory, the EHRC does have the power to investigate sectors which have a poor record on equal pay. Therefore, as best practice, the Council is carrying out annual equal pay audits on the LGE group.
- 3.4 East Lothian Council's current monitoring arrangements meet the current proposals of the Equalities Act 2010 which sets out a requirement that public bodies with more than 150 employees report annually on gender pay issues. The Council's plan to extend equal pay monitoring to include other equality strands is also in line with these proposals.

4 METHODOLOGY

- 4.1 An analysis of the Single Status pay and grading structure by gender has been carried out using the Northgate Arinso Equal Pay Reviewer software to determine the

gender impact on the workforce. Pay data as at 31 May 2008 was used to allow us to compare and contrast pre-Single Status data with post-Single Status data produced as at 31 May 2010. This involved the marrying together of employee and job data from a variety of information systems, initially importing the information into the Northgate Arinso Pay Modeller and thereafter importing the information into the new Equal Pay Reviewer software. This information was then analysed to establish any gender pay issues. It has taken a considerable amount of time to complete the first equal pay audit as prior to undertaking the task, officers had to be trained in using the new Equal Pay Reviewer software and before collating the required data they had to export information from several information sources and import this into the new software. Thereafter they were required to carry out system testing as well as learn how to do the equality modelling! Future Equal Pay Audits will be faster and we are aiming to have the 2011 data reported by Christmas 2011 and annually thereafter.

4.2 The gender analysis focused on:

- Full time employees within each of the 13 grade bands analysing average basic and total salaries (with and without preservation) to identify any pay gaps. These comparisons are attached as Appendix 1 to Appendix 4.
- Part time employees within each of the 13 grade bands analysing average basic and total salaries (with and without preservation) to identify any pay gaps. These comparisons are attached as Appendix 5 to Appendix 8.
- Full time male and part time female employees within each of the 13 grade bands analysing average basic and total salaries (with and without preservation). These comparisons are attached as Appendix 9 to Appendix 12.

4.3 When carrying out an Equal Pay Audit, the EHRC recommends that any equal pay gaps of 5% or more should be investigated and action taken to seek to resolve these. The Reports attached at Appendices 2A, 4A, 6A, 7A, 8A, 10A, 10B, 11A, 12A and 12B highlight the 5%+ pay gaps that still exist. Some equal pay gaps, however, are justifiable and these are explained at Paragraph 6.5.

4.4 Analysis included the following pay elements in addition to basic salary:

- Night Allowance
- Overtime/part time additional hours
- Call Out
- Premium Payments for Public Holiday Working
- Stand By Payments
- Acting Up Allowance
- Protection Payments
- Sleep In Allowance

4.5 All employees with existing salaries above the new Single Status LGE grade salary maximum had their salary protected on a cash conserved basis for three years. At

the end of the three year period (31 May 2011) employees remaining on a protected salary will be assimilated to the maximum spinal column point of the new grade for the post.

5 GENERAL FINDINGS – PAY GAP 2008 TO 2010

- 5.1 In terms of the overall analysis, Single Status LGE Job Evaluation outcomes affect 3,267 contracts of employment as at 31 May 2010:
- Females hold 2,392 of the contracts and 875 contracts are held by male employees, i.e. 73% females and 27% males.
 - The number of employees included in this audit that have more than one contract is 160 (152 females and 8 males) or 95% and 5% respectively.
- 5.2 The workforce distribution by grade and gender is contained in Appendix 13A (as at 31 May 2010) and Appendix 13B (as at 31 May 2008).
- 5.3 The analysis focused on males and females in each of the grade bands to identify any significant differences between average basic and total salaries of men and women performing equal work. The key findings are summarised in Appendices 1 to 12.
- 5.4 The analysis of the 2008 pay data against the 2010 pay data shows that the equal pay gap is improving. In 2008 the gender pay gap focused around allowances, bonus, premium payments, etc. The work carried out through the implementation of the new pay structure on 01 June 2008 shows that this gender pay gap has improved significantly. In 2008 there were 67 instances of gender pay gaps of 5% or more, many of them unjustified as they related to the payment of bonus to males and not to females. The 2010 figures show a marked decrease to 25 instances of pay gaps and that the gaps identified are as a result of job segregation and life choices, i.e. women often have to work in areas where they can work part-time in order to fit in with their caring responsibilities and, as such, are unable to take advantage of full-time employment. In addition, overtime is predominantly linked to jobs which are historically filled by men, for example, Roadworkers, Janitors, Street Sweepers, Loaders, Gardeners, Drivers, etc.
- 5.5 Overall, the findings of the pay audit are positive and there is no evidence of gender discrimination within the Single Status LGE Pay and Grading Structure. Having identified pay gaps, the differences can be explained for reasons other than gender namely length of service, access to overtime and salary protection.
- 5.6 By the end of the 3-year protection period (31 May 2011) it is projected that pay gaps within each grade will improve and come within the EHRC guidelines.
- 5.7 Analysis on overtime indicated a bias in favour of males over females and access to overtime working and overtime payments should continue to be monitored to ensure gender equality.

6 ANALYSIS OF THE PAY GAP 2010

6.1 On implementation of Single Status, employees were assimilated into the new pay structure; the placing on the new pay grade was determined by the employee's pre Single Status spinal column point and contractual pay.

6.2 In accordance with the national agreement, where an employee's new grade maximum was lower than their pre Single Status salary, a 3 year cash conservation applied.

6.3 On analysing the 2010 pay gaps, a number of similar reasons were identified within each of the grades. The reasons identified are:

- Length of Service
- Pre Single Status Salary Protection
- Payment of Allowances, e.g. overtime
- Gender Segregation
- Red Circling Protection

Length of Service

6.4 Due to length of service, some employees were near or at the top of their grade prior to implementation of Single Status which has resulted in a pay gap within some grades. Due to assimilation of posts into the new pay structure employees were placed onto the nearest spinal column point matching their pre Single Status grade.

6.5 As other employees progress through the incremental scales in these grades, the average pay gap will decrease. However, length of service will continue to be a factor as new employees are normally placed on the bottom spinal column point on the grade and then progress until they reach the top.

Pre Single Status Salary Protection

6.6 As a result of previous reorganisations and service reviews, a number of employees, both male and female, were in receipt of historic detriment or cash conserved payments. This means that their jobs had previously been regraded from a higher to a lower grade or that they had been matched into a lower graded post and a personal salary protection was already in place. These payments were removed on the implementation of Single Status on 1 June 2008 and Red Circle protection was subsequently applied for up to three years.

Payment of Allowances, e.g. Overtime

6.7 On implementation of Single Status, all pay allowances were removed, other than those listed at para 4.4. Of these allowances, overtime has the most significant impact on the gender pay gap.

- 6.8 The trend of working overtime has remained similar across Services pre and post Single Status implementation.
- 6.9 A higher proportion of males (53%) had access to overtime than females (43%) across the pay and grading structure overall. However, further analysis revealed that a higher number of females actually worked overtime, 1,027 compared to 468 males. See Appendix 14. In addition, females were, in the main, paid overtime at plain time as they were part-time workers.
- 6.10 At post level, anomalies arise where posts are predominantly populated by males or females, e.g. Roadworkers or Cooks, or where posts may have historically attracted overtime. As identified in Appendix 14, males consistently earn approximately twice as much in overtime as females in all but grades 2 and 3 of the Council's 13 grade pay structure.

6.11 **Recommended Action**

Through the Management of Overtime Policy implemented in June 2008 we are managing down the use of overtime which will have an impact on reducing the gender pay gap. It should be noted that this in turn will reduce the earnings of males, particularly those posts which historically have earned high levels of overtime, for example, Roadworkers, Janitors, Street Sweepers, Recycling Centre Attendants, Refuse Loaders, Gardeners/ Foresters/Gravediggers/Greenkeepers, Drivers, etc. However, by continuing to pay overtime to males in these jobs we are perpetuating the gender pay gap. Initiatives within the Council such as the Efficient Workforce Management Plan will also reduce the amount of overtime worked and subsequently reduce the possibility of gender inequality. This may require specific services, in consultation with representative trades unions, to review the configuration of their workforce to recruit more workers and / or make use of atypical workers at plain time rates of pay instead of perpetuating the pattern of full-time male workers having access to and gaining greatest pay advantage through overtime working.

Gender Segregation

- 6.13 More detailed analysis at post level identified that where a post has been traditionally populated with males or females, the average salary of the post resulted in a pay gap for the employees of the minority gender, for example, occupations such as refuse collection/street sweeping or social care.
- 6.14 The biggest gender pay gaps have been highlighted in Grades 4, 5, 6 and 8 (see Appendices 2A, 4A, 6A, 8A, 10A, 11A and 12 A). Analysis of the jobs in these grades points to traditional gender segregation, i.e. jobs which are predominantly filled by females working part-time. Examples of these are:-
- Grade 4 – Classroom Assistants, School Auxiliaries, Creche Workers, Catering/ Cafeteria Assistants, Senior Cleaners, Library Assistants;
 - Grade 5 – Social Care Workers (Unqualified), Cooks, Additional Support Needs Auxiliaries;

- Grade 6 – Social Care Workers (Qualified), Domiciliary Care Workers
- Grade 8 – Senior Social Care Workers, Family Support Workers, Residential Childcare Support Workers.

6.15 **Recommended Action**

Consultation with the Equalities Policy Officer should take place to identify any specific actions required to address gender segregation in the longer term.

Discussion should also take place with schools, career guidance and others who can seek to tackle the reasons behind gender segregation in the workplace. The new Employee Equalities Forum could be another way to begin to understand more about the impact of gender segregation in the workplace. We need to identify what we can do to positively address the issues of gender segregation. An example of this would include the future review of policies, such as the Recruitment and Selection Policy, to include the need to promote and raise awareness by encouraging females into traditionally held male jobs such as Gardener. West Lothian Council are about to begin a project considering gender segregation and perhaps we can learn from their approach.

Red Circling Protection

- 6.16 The impact of salary protection over the 3 year protection period continues to be monitored until 31 May 2011 (i.e. 3 years after implementation of Single Status).
- 6.17 In line with the national Single Status Agreement, East Lothian Council agreed that all employees with existing salaries above the new Single Status salary maximum would have their salary protected on a cash conserved basis for three years. At the end of the three year period, employees remaining on a protected salary will be assimilated to the maximum spinal column point of the new grade for the post.
- 6.18 Employees on protection and subsequently placed at the top of a grade, show as a pay gap in the analysis. However, at the end of the 3 year salary protection period and as employees progress through the incremental scales, the average pay gap between males and females within each grade will reduce. On implementation the number of employees on protection was 342 (113 male and 229 female). As at January 2011, 116 employees remain on salary protection of which 30 are male and 86 are female.
- 6.19 At the end of the 3 year salary protection period and as employees progress through the incremental scales, analysis shows the average pay gap between males and females within each of the pay grades for basic pay continues to be less than 5% in all but a few instances.

7 EQUAL PAY AUDITING PROPOSALS

- 7.1 The Council will continue to monitor and audit the LGE pay and grading structure and report findings to the Corporate Management Team on an annual basis (planned for December each year) to ensure that pay equity is being addressed.
- 7.2 Future audits will explore the legislation framework across all of the new Equality Act 2010 equality strands to determine whether or not they should include the analysis of ethnicity, disability, age, religion/belief, sexual orientation. Advice will be taken from the Equalities Policy Officer in this regard.
- 7.3 Future audits will explore best practice to determine whether or not to include analysis of other employee groups, e.g. Teachers, Craft Workers and Chief Officials. There is currently no legal obligation to include this information and to do so would incur significant resources.
- 7.4 Future audits will continue to monitor access to overtime.

8 CONSULTATION

- 8.1 Subject to the agreement of the Corporate Management Team, the findings of this audit will be shared with the relevant Trades Unions for information. Further consultation on the proposed actions will be discussed with the Equalities Officer in due course.

9 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

To address the issues of gender segregation, future reviews of policies, for example the Recruitment and Selection Policy, should include the need to promote and raise awareness of encouraging females into traditionally held male jobs such as Gardener.

10 EQUALITIES IMPACT ASSESSMENT

- 10.1 An Equality Impact Assessment was carried out on the new Single Status Pay and Grading Structure prior to the implementation of Single Status on 1 June 2008. To ensure that the structure remains robust and fit for purpose:-

- East Lothian Council will carry out annual audits on the Single Status LGE Pay and Grading Structure including all relevant contractual pay elements. Further actions will depend on the findings.
- East Lothian Council will carry out annual audits to include other employee groups.
- Future analysis will be developed to include other equality strands.

11 RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

- 11.1 Financial – Executive Directors and Business Group Managers in conjunction with Human Resources may be required to allocate resources within existing budgets if specific issues are identified to ensure the recommendations within the report are achieved. Actions in relation to Equal Pay should be included within the Equalities in Employment action plan.
- 11.2 Personnel – Resources will require to be allocated on an ongoing and annual basis to ensure the effective monitoring, review and analysis of the LGE pay and grading structure and relevant policies together with the recommended actions contained within this report.

12 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 12.1 Appendices 1-12 – as outlined at Paragraph 4.2

Appendix 13 – Workforce Distribution as at 31 May 2008 and 31 May 2010

Appendix 14 - Analysis of Overtime between Males and Females

INDEX OF APPENDICES

Appendix 1:

- A. Basic Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (Without Preservation) 2010
- B. Basic Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (Without Preservation) 2010
- C. Basic Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (Without Preservation) 2008
- D. Basic Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (Without Preservation) 2008

Appendix 2:

- A. Total Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (Without Preservation) 2010
- B. Total Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (Without Preservation) 2010
- C. Total Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (Without Preservation) 2008
- D. Total Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (Without Preservation) 2008

Appendix 3:

- A. Basic Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (With Preservation) 2010
- B. Basic Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (With Preservation) 2010
- C. Basic Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (With Preservation) 2008
- D. Basic Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (With Preservation) 2008

Appendix 4:

- A. Total Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (With Preservation) 2010
- B. Total Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (With Preservation) 2010
- C. Total Pay Comparison of All Females against All Males (With Preservation) 2008
- D. Total Pay Comparison of All Males against All Females (With Preservation) 2008

Appendix 5:

- A. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- B. Basic Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- C. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (Without Preservation) 2008
- D. Basic Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2008

Appendix 6:

- A. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- B. Total Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- C. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (Without Preservation) 2008
- D. Total Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2008

Appendix 7:

- A. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (With Preservation) 2010
- B. Basic Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2010
- C. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (With Preservation) 2008
- D. Basic Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2008

Appendix 8:

- A. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (With Preservation) 2010
- B. Total Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2010
- C. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Part-time (With Preservation) 2008
- D. Total Pay Comparison Males Part-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2008

Appendix 9:

- A. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- B. Basic Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- C. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (Without Preservation) 2008
- D. Basic Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2008

Appendix 10:

- A. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- B. Total Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2010
- C. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (Without Preservation) 2008
- D. Total Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (Without Preservation) 2008

Appendix 11:

- A. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (With Preservation) 2010
- B. Basic Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2010
- C. Basic Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (With Preservation) 2008
- D. Basic Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2008

Appendix 12:

- A. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (With Preservation) 2010
- B. Total Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2010
- C. Total Pay Comparison Females Part-time against Males Full-time (With Preservation) 2008
- D. Total Pay Comparison Males Full-time against Females Part-time (With Preservation) 2008

Appendix 13:

- A. Workforce Distribution by Grade and Gender as at 31 May 2010
- B. Workforce Distribution by Grade and Gender as at 31 May 2008

Appendix 14:

Overtime Earned by Grade and Gender as at 31 May 2010

KEY: **Basic Pay without Preservation = Basic Pay plus Bonus Consolidated only**
Total Pay without Preservation = Total Pay including all allowances except Red Circle Protection
Basic Pay with Preservation = Basic Pay plus Bonus Consolidated including Red Circle Protection
Total Pay with Preservation = Total Pay including all allowances plus Red Circle Protection