

SUBMISSION FROM THE SCOTTISH WOMEN'S DEVELOPMENT FORUM

This report details the current position, the significant progress made and areas for improvement in relation to occupational segregation in the Police Service of Scotland as expressed by the Scottish Women's Development Forum committee.

The Association of Chief Police Officers of Scotland (ACPOS) and new Police Scotland Executive are committed to providing the public with a modern police service where men, women and transgender people are treated fairly and equally. As a public service provider, the police service as a whole has a responsibility to provide gender equality, rather than expecting individuals to challenge inequality.

1. Background

In 2003 women accounted for less than 18% of police officer numbers and fewer than 8% of promoted posts in Scotland. Discussions therefore began about setting up an organisation for Scotland and initially a working group was setup across Central Scotland Police, Tayside Police and Fife Constabulary to discuss this further.

1.1 Establishing the Scottish Women's Development Forum

The decision was quickly reached that all forces and agencies across Scotland should be invited to participate in discussions. The initial members started work on the Gender Agenda Scotland¹ which required a considerable amount of research, data collection, time and commitment to complete. The Gender Agenda Scotland is an action plan to take forward specific activities in relation to gender equality in employment within the Scottish police service. The Scottish Women's Development Forum (SWDF) was established in 2003 as a group that advises and influences ACPOS in matters relating to the Gender Agenda.

The progress made as a result of the Gender Agenda, launched in 2004, and the subsequent Gender Agenda 2008-2011, has played a significant role in compliance by Forces regarding the Gender Equality Duty. A great deal of progress has been made by the SWDF since its inception in 2003. The ACPOS Gender Agenda Scotland Action Plans were the conduit for driving activity and measuring progress in relation to the five key business areas:

- Recruitment and Selection
- Retention and Fair Employment Practice
- Training and Career Development
- Work Life Balance
- Communication

It would be reasonable to suggest that working together with the Scottish Police Service the SWDF have made a significant contribution to the progress, but it is also clear that further work is required. Feedback from events and conferences has been very positive and it is apparent that the work carried out by the SWDF is very highly regarded within the Scottish police service.

¹ Gender Agenda Scotland 2004-2008 & Gender Agenda Scotland 2008-2011 available upon request.

The table below shows the progress made in regards to the percentage of females in each rank/employee type².

Rank/Employee Type	2003	2008	2012	2013*
Female Police Officers	18.8%	23.1%	27.8%	28.5%
Females in Promoted Posts	8%	13.2%	18.3%	19.5%
Female Police Staff	65%	62%	65.7%	62.8%
Female Special Constables	Not available	Not available	36.8%	36.8%

1.2 Aim of the Scottish Women's Development Forum

Our aim is to assist and support the Scottish police service to provide a positive working environment which enables everyone to reach their full potential, thereby improving the quality of service delivery to our communities.

1.3 Objectives of the Scottish Women's Development Forum

We act as a consultative body on behalf of the Scottish police service in relation to gender equality issues.

Our committee will consider equality impact issues developing within ACPOS or Force policy annually.

We seek solutions to ensure that there are no barriers to the personal and professional development of all staff and take action to remove barriers, which may prevent female police officers from entering specialist roles and promoted ranks.

We monitor current organisational change within the Scottish Police Service in context of any risk to fair and equal opportunities.

1.3 Commitment to our staff

We will continue to provide regular reports to both ACPOS and the Scottish Government on progress made.

We will provide a mentoring scheme accessible to all our staff.

We will challenge performance in relation to the under representation of females in specialist posts.

We will continue to provide personal & professional development days and of course we will continue to consult on National reform.

2. Occupational Segregation within the Police Service

² Based at 31st March each year apart from * which was taken at 28th February 2013.

2.1 Police Officers

Police forces in the United Kingdom have in recent years been striving to achieve gender equality in the service. Although progress is being made research has shown that there remains an under representation of female officers, particularly within roles such as Road Policing, some roles within CID and Firearms.

Although substantial effort and significant progress has been made within the police service occupational segregation still occurs both on a horizontal and vertical basis. It is clear that further work is required in this area and this will be reviewed and addressed in partnership with the Police Scotland, Scottish Policing Authority, HR staff within the police service, Staff Associations including the Scottish Police Federation and the SWDF.

Female police officers are under-represented in both and promoted ranks and in some roles as identified above which generally attract additional payments. Vertical and horizontal segregation are linked for police officers as many posts attract training and development which provide skills and knowledge which may benefit individuals going for promotion.

Although women now account for 28.5% of police officers they are underrepresented within promoted posts, accounting for 19.5%.

The table below show the percentage of male and female officers at each rank³.

Police Officers	Female (%)	Male (%)
Constable	30.6	69.4
Sergeant	20.0	80.0
Inspector	18.4	81.6
Chief Inspector	14.5	85.5
Superintendent	12.0	88.0
Chief Superintendent	14.5	85.5
ACC, DCC & CC	8.8	91.2
Total	27.9	72.1

It is the belief of the SWDF that if the new Police Service of Scotland is going to continue the excellent progress made in increasing the numbers of females in promoted posts it has to maintain a positive attitude towards Flexible Working and encourage and promote both male and female staff to make use of it. The police service has made considerable progress in developing Flexible Working principles, guidance and policies and has senior management support for this. However it should clearly demonstrate that flexible working is an option for police staff and police officers at all levels of the organisation, not just the lower-paid roles. The lack of understanding and support for flexible working from a minority of managers in certain departments further increases occupational segregation within the police service and minimises potential opportunities for progression and access to additional payments that some roles attract which has an impact on equal pay.

On a national level difficulties have historically arisen in being able to identify horizontal segregation among police officers due to the variations in job titles and department structures across the legacy forces in Scotland. Legacy forces have been able to carry

³ Taken at 31st March 2013.

out this analysis and have undertaken considerable work within their own areas to identify and address any areas of concern or good practice, which has then be shared on a national basis. Significant work is being undertaken to review this to allow future reporting on a national basis. However, broadly speaking, across the country females have been under-represented in some areas of CID, Roads Policing and Firearms.

Research Project; Gender Representation in Fife Constabulary's Specialist Posts (2010)

The Home Office have identified in their 'Assessment of Women in Policing' (HMSO 2010), action plan that:

"Further research is to be undertaken into female representation in specialist roles, to identify barriers to women's entry into specialist roles, strategies that have increased female representation in CID, and opportunities to further tackle these barriers".

In relation to the above, members of the SWDF Performance Monitoring Sub-Group, working in conjunction with HR Equality & Diversity Practitioners, examined statistics regarding the gender breakdown of Road Policing Units and Authorised Firearms Officers (AFO's), these being areas where there was general acceptance that females were under represented in an effort to identify best practice. In this regard, Fife Constabulary instigated a short term working group in an effort to address the identified gender imbalance in some specialist posts (Firearms, Road Policing and Crime Management – CID) and research was carried out accordingly.

The aim of the research project, carried out in 2010, was *"To identify potential barriers to gender equality within specialist roles in Fife Constabulary"*.⁴ In order to achieve the aim, the author examined officer opinions to barriers to entry in specialist posts from Communities Policing Division (CPD). The author also carried out a literature review of relevant material on initiatives that formed best practice within UK police forces to tackle gender balance in particular posts.

At the time the research was undertaken anecdotal information suggests that the profile within Fife Constabulary, and the breakdown in the identified posts, was not too dissimilar in the other police forces.

The research evidenced some key themes, comments and suggestions on how not only Fife Constabulary but the wider Scottish police service could encourage a gender balance in specialist roles. The police officer survey undertaken highlighted existing anecdotal evidence including issues surrounding flexible working, perceptions about the culture of the specified departments, lack of confidence amongst female police officers, inconsistent line management approach and awareness of specialist posts.

The research made various recommendations including:

- Work with external partners to change the perception of the Police service as a male dominated environment.
- Review and adjust the focus of personal development to achieve proportionate female representation across specialist roles in line with the gender balance, the

⁴ The full report 'Gender Representation in Fife Constabulary's Specialist Posts (2010)' is available on request.

force must focus on progression, development and highlight the profile of successful women as role models.

- Implement a process of cultural change within the organisation to embed an environment in which diversity will thrive
- Review Flexible working practices to seek greater opportunities for the police and the individual;
- Educate Managers to develop understanding and improve conditions to create a more dynamic work-life balance.
- Establish Specialist Role Open Days annually to promote the work of departments
- Create Specialist Role Advocates to utilise experienced officers within each specialist department to act as advocates and SPOCs during application periods, providing information to interested parties and undertaking familiarisation presentations.
- Acquire gender specific uniform and equipment for specialist roles such as firearms and search teams.

At the time this research was carried out most legacy forces, if not all of them, were undertaking some or all of the above recommendations and this will continue to be case in the future.

2.2 Police Staff

Around 40% of women currently work in the public sector in Scotland compared to 20% of men. Local government represents 53% of Scotland's total public sector workforce and women make up 67% of that workforce. Public sector employment is significantly higher in Scotland 25.1% than England 20.3 %.⁵

61.9% of police staff roles are currently undertaken by women which means that men are under-represented however female police staff are more likely to be within admin type posts.

The ration of male and female police staff is very similar to that throughout the public sector and is attributable to the types of roles which are commonplace. There are also similar types of gender segregation within the wider jobs market.

The table below show the percentage of male and female staff at each salary group.⁶

Staff	Female (%)	Male (%)
< 15k	87.0	13.0
15 - < 25k	65.8	34.2
25 - < 35k	50.9	49.1
35 - < 45k	44.2	55.8
45 - < 55k	44.4	55.6
55 - < 65k	45.2	54.8
65 - < 75k	22.2	77.8
> 75k	38.5	61.5
Total	61.9	38.1

⁵ Source Office of National Statistics 2010

⁶ Taken at 31st March 2013

As is clearly demonstrated in the above table most of the female Police Staff are in the lower graded/paid roles. There are few options for progression and promotion for staff within the police service and the police service mirrors the issues faced by wider society in relation to under-representation in management/higher graded and paid roles.

The police service is currently unable to identify horizontal segregation among police staff due to the current variations in job titles and department structures across Scotland. Work is being done to review this to allow future reporting on a national basis. Also due to budget restraints placed upon the force, there has been very little external recruitment, which has had an impact upon the diversity of the police staff workforce profile. This also means that there has been very little improvement in relation to gender segregation within certain posts such as administrators, cleaners, HR and finance having statistically more female staff whereas drivers, mechanics and CCTV Operators have statistically more male staff.

This highlights the importance of ensuring that when any re-structuring is undertaken or when filling gaps created by the Voluntary Redundancy/Voluntary Retirement Scheme, consideration is given to the skill sets of police staff within the force and that equality Impact Assessments are undertaken from the onset of any change either in a review or structural capacity.

2.3 The Impact of the National Police Reform Programme

As the eight legacy forces, SPSA and SCDEA transition into the Police Service of Scotland it is vitally important that the SWDF ensure that female police staff and police officers do not miss out on opportunities and development moving forwards into the future, particularly as females generally have more caring responsibilities and geographical relocations or opportunities may again disproportionately disadvantage women. Concerns over the impact of police reform and barriers towards progressing gender equality within the police staff workforce were raised during the EQIA consultation process.

Although police officers have been transferred across to the new Police Service of Scotland on their current pay, conditions and location, the security of location ceases to exist upon promotion and possibly when accepting certain posts. The SWDF committee reached a consensus that safeguards and restrictions require to be put in place, as there is a strong likelihood that such a decision would disproportionately affect women, particularly those with caring responsibilities. In the opinion of the SWDF, this will pose a barrier to women applying for promotion or specialist posts, potentially eroding the excellent progress made in relation to these areas in recent years. The group acknowledged that many male officers face similar issues and would also see this as a barrier.

With 62.8% of police staff being female, most in lower graded/paid roles, they are likely to be the most affected by the move to one force. It appears to be the case that some staff may be forced into choosing between their role or their location. With many members of police staff having very specific knowledge/roles/qualifications this could potentially have a huge impact on a large amount of females. Centralisation of police staff posts is likely to lead to job cuts or relocations, which will have more of a detrimental impact on female staff, particularly those with caring responsibilities (which statistically more women have) who are less able to relocate for work.

Substantial progress in gender equality has been made by the police service and the SWDF since it was established in 2003, however, there is more to do and the SWDF must ensure that the Police Service of Scotland does not take a backwards step as a result of the national police reform programme and if it becomes apparent that the reform process is having a negative effect the SWDF must be there to provide solutions to any barriers causing this.

3. SWDF Contribution to Occupational Segregation

Although there is no direct evidence to link the ongoing work of the SWDF to the progress made, it would be reasonable to suggest that they have made a significant contribution during the 10 years it has been established. The SWDF have contributed towards tackling occupational segregation in particular in a numbers of ways;-

- The provision of an annual conference and regular development events and programmes
- Training opportunities for police officers, police staff and special constables at all levels of the service
- Networking opportunities
- Positive action initiatives
- Achieving demonstrable outcomes for the benefit of all within the Scottish Police Service such as development of the ACPOS Joint Mentoring Scheme.
- Practical solutions to issues impacting upon women in particular such as work in relation to flexible working and research into the gender imbalance in some identified specialist posts.

3.1 National Police Reform Programme

The reform process continues to be the major priority for the Scottish Women's Development Forum currently and we continue to consult on the National Police Reform Programme and, in particular, with the development of HR Standard Operating Procedures. SWDF members continue to express concerns over the reform process including the potential impact on recruitment, promotion, selection, flexible working, redeployment and potential redundancies of police staff.

It is vitally important that the SWDF ensure that female staff and officers do not miss out on opportunities and development moving forward and that any barriers, real or perceived, are mitigated against to avoid taking backwards steps in regards to gender equality within the service. It is essential therefore that the SWDF continue to be involved in the police reform process to ensure that policies and practise do not discriminate against or disproportionately disadvantage females within the service.

To date the SWDF have been consulted on Disciplinary Procedure; Equality Impact Assessments Toolkits; Disability in Employment; Transgender People in Employment; Promotion; Adoption, Maternity and Paternity; Flexible Working; Equality, Diversity & Dignity at Work; Pay Protection; Accelerated Career Development Programme; Attendance Management; Postings and Transfers; Relocations; Redundancy; Match-in Ring Fenced Recruitment; Recruitment of Police Officers and Special Constables; Equality & Diversity Outcomes. The SWDF have held meetings with those responsible for the reform of Police Officer and Special Constable Recruitment and attended a workshop

on Officer Postings and Transfers. The SWDF have also attended meetings with the Scottish Government Police Division regarding the EQIA of the suite of Police Workforce Regulations.

3.2 Performance Monitoring Sub-Group

As a result of the research undertaken on Gender Representation in Specialist Posts, mentioned earlier, the SWDF Performance Monitoring Sub-Group are designing an event(s) to be held during 2013 to 'showcase' females who have been successful in specialist departments with the objective of inspiring others in anticipation of the opportunities the new PSoS may offer.

There is concern that specialist posts, which are already under-represented by females, will become even more so under relocations of those posts within the new PSoS. The aim of this is to be to be pro-active and demonstrate what opportunities are available, remove some of the myths associated with certain specialist posts, address some of the concerns and barriers surrounding them and showcase females who are doing the roles who can tell staff what the reality of working in these posts is. The title of the event will be 'Broaden Your Horizons' and this group will be working with the National Police Reform Team and the new Police Scotland Executive on this.

3.3 Personal & Professional Development Sub-Group

The SWDF PPD Sub-Group has continued to provide an extensive programme of personal development events based on survey feedback from women across the service. Since 2003 this group has organized 7 annual conferences and over 40 development programmes and events.

Hundreds, if not thousands, of staff in the Scottish police service have benefited from these courses which have been provided to the legacy forces at best possible value.

2012-2013 Programme:

Preparing For Selection for Police Staff Only - 25th April 2012

Management Programme - 02nd May, 19th June, 02nd August 2012

Preparing For Selection - 29th August 2012

Springboard Winter 2012- 19th September, 17th October, 14th November and 5th December 2012

SWDF Annual Conference - 07th November 2012

Springboard Spring 2013 - 27th February, 20th March, 17th April, 16th May 2013

SWDF Personal & Professional Development Days are both well attended and very highly evaluated by delegates as is evidenced in the tables below:

Preparing For Selection Jan 2010- Jan 2013

On a scale of 1 (low) to 10 (high) how would this event rate in terms of:

<i>Question</i>	<i>Mean</i>
Its value to your personal development as a whole?	8.8
Its potential value to your future career success?	8.8

Springboard 2011 & 2012

On a scale of 1 (low) to 10 (high) how would this event rate in terms of:

<i>Question</i>	<i>Mean</i>
Its value to your personal development as a whole?	9.2
Its potential value to your future career success?	8.9
In assisting you achieve your work-life balance?	8.3

SWDF Annual Conference November 2012

The Scottish Women's Development Forum Annual Conference was held on the 07th November 2012 at the Scottish Police College. The event was attended by over 150 delegates with representation from police and partners agencies. During this event the SWDF Annual Awards 2012 were also presented which recognise the contributions and achievements of staff from within the Scottish police service.

The conference comprised a series of workshops as well as a number of speakers addressing a variety of topics. At the conclusion of the conference delegates were provided with a questionnaire asking for their opinions on the event as a whole, the workshops and speakers.

The event as a whole:

The mean is based on a five point scale where 'Very satisfied' = 1 and 'Very dissatisfied' = 5.

	<i>No of respondents</i>	<i>Very satisfied %</i>	<i>Satisfied %</i>	<i>Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied %</i>	<i>Dissatisfied %</i>	<i>Very dissatisfied %</i>	<i>Mean *</i>
The event met your expectations	47	62	38	0	0	0	1.4
You learned something of value	47	57	41	2	0	0	1.5
The event has been of benefit to you	47	64	34	2	0	0	1.4

*The **lower** the mean score, the more positive the response to the statement

3.4 Coaching & Mentoring Sub Group

As part of the work of the Scottish Women's Development Forum (SWDF) in identifying and removing any real or perceived barriers to the progression of women in Scottish policing, a sub group was convened to examine the potential for some development in coaching and mentoring.

A key outcome of this examination was the design, development and launch in 2009 of the ACPOS Joint Mentor Scheme. The Scheme was initially piloted in three Forces (Fife Constabulary, Grampian Police and Tayside Police) with common briefings and training delivered to all participants.

The fundamental premise of the Scheme is that it offers a confidential, learner-led development route for performance improvement, based on non-directive support from a colleague with a greater experience or skills level.

Following endorsement by SWDF the Scheme was re-advertised and has now had 4 cohorts, with over 100 pairings working together to improve performance.

Evaluation of the pilot Scheme demonstrated a very high satisfaction level, with 76% of mentees stating that they had achieved all or part of their stated development objectives. Mentees also commented that they felt they had improved communications skills and decision making skills, and increased confidence. They also commented on an increased awareness of policing in general and of work done in other Departments and / or Forces. Mentors stated that they had increased communication skills and improved personal awareness.

Under "any further comments", the following are typical of the responses received:

"This was a great help to me professionally and personally"

"I think every new supervisor should be offered a mentor – great help"

"I like the fact that anything I say is in total confidence – and is not reported to my boss."

"I have finally been able to say to someone in confidence – I am struggling with this"

While initially conceived as a mechanism to support at least one minority group, the Scheme was advertised and opened to all Officers and members of staff in each of the participating Forces. Applications have been received from a wide range of Departments and career stages. Feedback suggests that the Scheme is seen as a learner focused, confidential personal development route.

The benefits gained by both mentors and mentees within the Scheme demonstrate its effectiveness; the minimal resources required to maintain a Scheme demonstrate this to be an efficient development intervention.

Comment from Senior Officers within the Scheme suggest that there is a further benefit to the organisation as a whole from its participation in mentoring, through 'cross-pollination' of ideas, sharing of best practice and general awareness raising amongst different parts of the organisation.

In January 2013 the Sub-Group sought and gained the approval of the Chair and committee of the SWDF to request the continuance and development of the Scheme under the auspices of the Police Service of Scotland. As such this Sub-Group have submitted a proposal to Police Scotland asking them to considering mainstreaming this scheme under the training division.

British Association of Women in Policing Silver Anniversary Award

The SWDF Coaching & Mentoring Sub-Group was recognised for establishing the ACPOS Joint Mentoring Scheme at a national awards ceremony. The British Association of Women in Policing decided to recognise the work this group had undertaken, progressing mentoring within the Scottish police service, by presenting them with an award. As it did not fit within the existing categories they designed a unique award to celebrate the BAWP 25th Anniversary, the BAWP Silver Anniversary Award, which was presented to the members of this group at a luncheon at the George Hotel in Edinburgh on the 06th November 2012. In the evening numerous members of the SWDF also attended an evening reception hosted at the Scottish Parliament.

Mr Kenny MacAskill MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Justice said when speaking at the SWDF Annual Conference the following day

'I must start by congratulating you on receiving the British Association of Women in Policing Silver Anniversary Award for your successful mentoring scheme. I was impressed to hear that since it was launched in 2010, over 200 members of police staff, and officers of all ranks, have taken part. This award demonstrates that your hard work is not only recognised here in Scotland, but nationally across the UK. It is an achievement that you should be very proud of.'

This Sub-Group also agreed that coaching skills are an essential element of effective management were therefore also responsible for designing and running a number of joint Critical Skills for Critical Times events and each participating Force is currently still undertaking some activity in this area.

In times of accelerated change, and reduced resources, coaching and mentoring skills could become even more critically important and so the work of this Sub-Group is even more important.

Yes, it's important to celebrate what we've achieved in the police service but the reason the SWDF exists isn't about the past and isn't even about the present. The reason the SWDF exists is to try to shape a better future for the Police Service of Scotland and the long term objective for the Forum is actually to cease to exist because gender equality has been embedded into all our working practices – but we are not there yet.

Sarah Wood
Scottish Women's Development Forum
15 April 2013