

Justice Committee

Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Scotland) Bill

Written submission from Abolition Scotland

Summary

1. Abolition Scotland believes that whilst there is much to be commended in the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Scotland) Bill which will improve prosecution for these crimes, the Bill misses a key opportunity to create a strong deterrent to trafficking for sexual exploitation. We believe that the support structures for victims, both adults and children, within the Bill should be strengthened.

2. “Abolition Scotland” is a campaign group established to raise awareness and call for action to end of human trafficking and sexual exploitation in Scotland. We seek to work in partnership with churches in Scotland to raise awareness of, encourage prayer about and inspire individuals to action in order to combat human trafficking. We encouraged our supporters to submit evidence to Rhoda Grant MSP’s consultation on a Bill to criminalise the purchase of sexual services and also to Jenny Marra MSP’s proposal for a Human Trafficking Bill. We submitted evidence also to the Joint Committee on the Draft Modern Slavery Bill at Westminster.

Addressing demand for commercial sexual exploitation

3. Abolition Scotland believes that a reduction in human trafficking in Scotland will never be achieved unless we address the “demand” factors that underpin this trade in human beings.¹ Addressing demand is a fundamental part of preventing trafficking. It is one of the internationally recognised “three ps” (prevention, prosecution of perpetrators and protection of victims) of the fight against this terrible crime which has been recognised by several international treaties, including the EU Directive and Council of Europe Convention on combatting trafficking.ⁱ

4. In 2014, resolutions from both the European Union and the Council of Europe recommended laws to address the demand for commercial sexual services as among the most effective in combatting trafficking for sexual exploitation.

5. In February 2014 following an extensive report by the Women’s Rights and Gender Equality (FEMM) Committee the European Parliament passed a resolution highlighting that European Commission data shows that in the EU “*a majority of victims (62 %) are trafficked for sexual exploitation, with women and under-age females accounting for 96 % of identified and presumed victims*”.ⁱⁱ The report goes on to stress that “*there are several links between prostitution and trafficking, and [...] that prostitution – both globally and across Europe – feeds the trafficking of vulnerable women and under-age females*” and recommends models of law that make the purchase of sexual services as criminal act as a way of “*combating the trafficking of women and under-age females for sexual exploitation and improving gender equality*”.

¹ All views expressed by Abolition Scotland represent the views of the Abolition Scotland Coalition and do not necessarily represent the individual views of all coalition members. Please email info@abolitionscotland.org for more information.

6. The Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly resolution, 'Prostitution, trafficking and modern slavery in Europe,' passed in April 2014 similarly recommended "*criminalising the purchase of sexual services, based on the Swedish model, as the most effective tool for preventing and combating trafficking in human beings*" saying "*legislation and policies on prostitution are indispensable anti-trafficking tools*".ⁱⁱⁱ

7. As the European resolutions indicate, laws that make the purchase of sex a criminal offence which enacted in Sweden in 1999 followed by Norway and Iceland in 2009 have been found to have an impact on the levels of human trafficking and prostitution in those countries.^{iv} An independent evaluation of the law for the Swedish Government concluded that the number of persons, mainly women, exploited in street prostitution in Sweden had been halved since 1999.^v The Swedish Police has reported that "*it is clear that the prohibition against buying sexual services, known as the sex purchase law... is still functioning as a barrier that is preventing human traffickers and pimps from becoming established in Sweden.*"^{vi} An independent evaluation for the Norwegian Government produced in 2014 found that "*the ban on purchasing sexual services has reduced demand for sex and thus contribute[d] to reduce the extent of prostitution in Norway*"^{vii} and "*reduced the extent of human trafficking in Norway in comparison to a situation without a law.*"^{viii}

8. Like the wider data from the EU sexual exploitation in a context of paid-for sexual services is a major component of human trafficking in Scotland as recorded in the NRM statistics, Police Scotland intelligence and other official inquiries and research.^{ix} The Gangmasters Licensing Authority and the new Transparency in Company Supply chains measures introduced in the Modern Slavery Bill at Westminster seek to address the many of the contexts where labour exploitation takes place. Similar efforts are needed to address the context of sexual exploitation – paid for sexual services. Abolition Scotland is disappointed that such a landmark piece of legislation as the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Scotland) Bill makes no provision to address the demand for paid-for sexual services.

9. Abolition Scotland urges the Scottish Parliament to follow the example of the Northern Ireland Assembly and the Canadian Government which introduced laws to criminalise the purchase of sexual services in 2014.^x The French Parliament is considering a Bill with the same effect and the Government in the Republic of Ireland has announced that it will bring forward similar laws.^{xi}

10. Introducing laws to criminalise the purchase of sexual services have already received emphatic public support in Scotland. 80 per cent of the respondents to a public consultation brought forward by Rhoda Grant MSP supported a proposal for such laws.^{xii} It is noteworthy that in Sweden the level of public support for the law rose after the law was introduced from 45 per cent of women and 20 per cent of men in favour in 1996 to 81 per cent of women and 70 per cent of men in favour in 1999 after the law changed.^{xiii}

Provision of support for victims

11. Abolition Scotland welcomes clause 8 of the Bill which establishes a duty on Scottish Ministers to provide support to victims. In particular we are very glad to see

that the Bill sets out the primary areas from the European Convention in which that assistance should be offered.^{xiv}

12. We are disappointed that certain aspects of the “survivors service” proposed by Jenny Marra MSP in her consultation for a Human Trafficking (Scotland) Bill have not been adopted in relation to the support provided to victims. Ms Marra’s consultation proposed the development of national “survivor standards” for the provision of assistance to victims based on core principles from international law. Abolition Scotland recommends the addition to clause 8 of measures allowing for the development of statutory standards for care provided to victims. In addition we would like to see more of those core principles relating to support for victims added directly to the clause.

13. Among the core principles from the European Convention set out in the Marra proposal is that “*assistance shall not be conditional on victims’ willingness to cooperate in any criminal investigations, prosecutions, or any proceedings not concerned with the trafficking situation*” which we are pleased has been included in clause 8(5).^{xv} However, the clause does not incorporate others of those principles which recommend support should be provided with the “*understanding the inherent vulnerability of survivors of human trafficking*” and proposes that support should be provided following an individual assessment, taking special account of the victim’s safety and security needs and any special needs they may have as a result of, for example, disability, pregnancy or ill-health.^{xvi} We recommend that these factors should be added to clause 8(5)

14. Abolition Scotland believes that Scotland should be a world leader when it comes to support for victims of human trafficking and we would encourage the committee to consider examples of international best practice when examining the provision of survivor services contained within the Bill. We would like to highlight the work done in this area by International Justice Mission in many nations across the world. Further details and case studies may be found in Appendix A.

Statutory basis for the Scottish Guardianship Service

15. The Scottish Guardianship Service has been at the forefront of providing specialist advocacy support for children who have been trafficked. Evidence demonstrates that trafficked children in Scotland are some of the most vulnerable of all victims of trafficking, and indeed of all children in Scotland and that they need special support to help overcome these challenges.^{xvii} The Scottish Guardianship Service provides trafficked children with a specialist guardian to accompany them as they make their way through among other things immigration, care and criminal investigative processes. The guardians both support the child and also speak up for their best interests, helping to protect children against the risk of re-trafficking.

16. Until recently the Scottish Guardianship Service was the only state funded specialist support for trafficked children in the UK and the positive impact of the service we are sure had an influence in the development of child trafficking advocates trials in England and Wales and the Independent Guardian scheme in Northern Ireland being introduced under the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Criminal Justice and Support for Victims) (Northern Ireland) Act 2015.

17. Since the Modern Slavery Bill in England and Wales now contains a clause to underpin the child trafficking advocate scheme (which will be strengthened further by Government amendments tabled on 17 February) and Northern Ireland has created statutory Independent Guardians, it seems a missed opportunity not to provide the Scottish Guardianship Service with a statutory foundation.^{xviii}

18. A statutory foundation for the Guardianship Service would protect it from any changes in Government policy or budgetary concerns. It will also strengthen the authority of the guardians giving them a basis in law for their work and ensuring that public bodies and other professionals will take account of their role and expertise when making decisions about a particular child. This will be particularly beneficial when the guardians need to engage with individual professionals or local authorities who work with trafficked children less frequently and may be less familiar with the Guardianship Service.

19. Abolition Scotland recommends that a new clause establishing the Guardianship Service should be added to the Bill including full details of the powers and functions of the guardian. The powers and functions should be informed by international guidance including the EU Fundamental Rights Agency handbook and UNICEF guidelines.^{xix} We recommend that section 21 of the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Criminal Justice and Support for Victims) (Northern Ireland) Act 2015 should be used as a model.

Conclusion

20. Abolition Scotland welcomes the opportunity presented by the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Scotland) Bill to set a strong foundation for action against trafficking and exploitation in the decades to come. However we believe that key additions are needed to ensure the Bill will accomplish these aims. Abolition Scotland would be pleased to oral evidence to the Justice Committee as it considers the Bill.

Appendix A

IJM Aftercare- Commercial Sexual Exploitation and Bonded Labour Slavery

Overview

International Justice Mission is a human rights organisation that secures justice for victims of slavery, sex trafficking and other forms of violent oppression throughout the developing world. IJM partners with local authorities to rescue victims of violence, bring criminals to justice, restore survivors and strengthen justice systems. In 2014, IJM rescued 4,376 people from violence and restrained 372 violent criminals. More than 3,700 survivors of violence and their family members are currently receiving aftercare from IJM teams.

We have developed a comprehensive aftercare programme designed to decrease vulnerability and increase general well-being in the lives of the survivors we serve. Our aftercare programme focuses on recovery, rehabilitation and reintegration. Critical factors the recovery process include the survivors' age, physical and psychological health, background, family life, culture, and the duration of exploitation. Effects of trauma are magnified when the survivor has been trafficked for sexual exploitation. The long-term aftercare of recovery, rehabilitation, and reintegration of trafficking survivors will extended psycho-social care, including Trauma-Focused Cognitive Behavioural Therapy, as well as educational and vocational training.

IJM's aftercare participants receive care until they have achieved restoration. We define restoration as a participant's ability to function satisfactorily in society and avoid re-victimisation. In order to assess a client's level of restoration, we have developed an unprecedented measurement tool in the social work field, the IJM Aftercare Successful Outcomes Form (ASO).² Using defined priority and standard domains of care, such as health, trauma-informed recovery and economic empowerment, we created distinct ASO Forms for each type of violence. The ASO Form enables us to evaluate the aftercare participant's functioning within each of the relevant domains at multiple points of time. ASO Forms produce an overall score that allows us to measure whether the aftercare participant has achieved restoration and can end the treatment plan. One year after the conclusion of the treatment plan, IJM contacts the former participant to complete the ASO Form again in order to assess their 'sustained restoration'

Minimum Standards of IJM Aftercare- Commercial Sexual Exploitation

a. Intake- Immediately

- Provide basic education on commercial sexual exploitation
 - That the victim is not the accused, and how they're being treated differently
 - That laws have been broken against them
 - That the police are not the "enemy", and they do not need to be scared of the police

² For more information please see: International Justice Mission. 'The Aftercare Successful Outcomes Form: A New Tool for Assessing Restoration of Survivors of Violent Abuse' *Justice Review: A Journal on Protection and Justice for the Poor*. 2014-2015 ed., Web. <<https://www.ijm.org/justice-review>>, pp. 50-55.

- Give them information as to what to expect the next few days
- Provide crisis mental health support and basic first aid and/or referral for emergency medical services
- Provide a kit of essential toiletries, a set of clothes, a set of undergarments, bath towel, and food and drink as needed
- Provide safety and security post operation
- If requested, ensure that the Primary Aftercare Participant has a social worker present during forensic interview with police, as allowed by the police.
- Complete Needs Assessment and Aftercare Successful Outcomes before drafting the Treatment plan within 45 days of rescue.
- Formulate psychosocial treatment plan and review quarterly. This is a plan drawn up by IJM Aftercare workers so as to have an object measurable and time bound plan to work by.
- Provide case management for the duration of the case

b. Recovery/Rehabilitation

MEDICAL CARE- within 30 days of rescue

- Ensure that an aftercare worker accompanies clients to initial post-traumatic medical exam, age verification and lab tests
- Facilitate HIV/STI testing and appropriate treatment, when possible and if the Primary Aftercare Participant consents
- If able, facilitate follow-up medical treatment as needed
- If client is pregnant, provide crisis pregnancy counseling and facilitate neo-natal care

PLACEMENT

- Refer clients for temporary shelter and custody in government or non-government aftercare homes. We take into account the location of the safe house as well as the victim's background and age when requesting placement into a particular Home.
- If a client has a baby, whenever possible facilitate placement where client and child may remain together. Placing a pregnant girl at a home where there are other pregnant girls is desirable.
- Facilitate repatriation efforts, including safe transportation, for Primary Aftercare Participant's return to state/country of origin, as needed.

PSYCHO-SOCIAL SUPPORT

- Within 60 days of rescue, complete Treatment Plan and review as needed; at minimum twice annually. The treatment plan should remain open as long as the Primary Aftercare Participant is a minor, and should include Participant's transition to a safe and sustainable living environment.
- Facilitate the provision of trauma-focused counseling within 90 days of assessed needs
- Monitor and document progress of client through visits or reports from aftercare home staff. Building trust is critical to her testimony in court and rehabilitation both during and after the trial.

ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT- within 90 days of assessed needs

- Facilitate basic literacy training as needed
- Facilitate life skills/soft skills training as needed
- Facilitate the delivery of vocational training, ensuring that training will result in sustainable income, as needed. Clients are vulnerable to re-trafficking unless there is another opportunity to earn a living. These opportunities can only come through education and training.

LEGAL ASSISTANCE

- Provide information to Primary Aftercare Participant about legal proceedings and possible outcomes
- Assess Primary Aftercare Participant's willingness to participate in court proceedings and facilitate court preparation and support during legal proceedings.

c. Reintegration

- Begin drafting individualized reintegration plan with each client within six months of rescue. This ensures that a client-specific plan is in place and that the Primary Aftercare Participant is moving forward. Follow-up sessions with service beneficiaries should be thought through carefully and intentional with specific goals in mind.
- Within 180 days of rescue, facilitate the identification of safe housing outside aftercare home, as needed.
- Facilitate Primary Aftercare Participant's transition from aftercare home to safe and sustainable living environment as needed.

d. Criteria for closing aftercare:

- i. A case is closed based on termination of the legal proceedings, the client's age and the completion of the treatment plan.
 - Primary Aftercare Participant has completed treatment plan
 - Provide quarterly follow-up visits or phone contacts for one year from completion of the Treatment Plan to monitor if Primary Aftercare Participant sustains achieved progress
 - Upon completion of one year of follow-up, complete final ASO Form.
- ii. The primary Aftercare Participant has been repatriated to their home country
 - Attempt to follow up with them at home or in aftercare home facility quarterly for one year, if possible
 - If Treatment Plan is not complete, transition responsibly of follow up to aftercare home partners, if possible.

iii. The primary Aftercare Participant has returned home and declines further aftercare services

e. Preferable standards:

- Provide information and services in a language understood by the client
- Facilitate drug rehabilitation, as needed, within 30 days of assessed need
- Facilitate inpatient/outpatient psychiatric care and provision of prescribed medication, as needed within 30 days of assessed need

- Escort Primary Aftercare Participant to home of origin during repatriation process, as needed
- Liaise with NGOs for reintegration and follow-up in home of origin for Primary Aftercare Participants being repatriated to another country.
- Facilitate enrollment in Self-Help/Savings Group, if client is earning an income

Client Story

Julita's Story

CEBU, THE PHILIPPINES – Julita* grew up in a boisterous, one-room home, the oldest of five children.

Her mother and father worked a small farm to supplement the salary her father earned working in the Philippines army. Though her parents struggled at times to make ends meet, they were determined to support their daughter's education. Julita worked hard and graduated from high school. Eager to help support her family, she moved to Cebu City in search of work.

For two years, Julita worked two jobs. By day, she cleaned houses. At night, she worked at an internet café. Despite the long hours and her hard work, the pay was low and Julita was discouraged. "My body would grow so tired," Julita recalls. "I could not stand it anymore."

A local paper was advertising jobs at a spa. Eager for an opportunity to earn more money, Julita applied and was offered a job as a masseuse. But the job was not an opportunity – it was a trap. She was regularly sexually assaulted by the male customers, who could pay a little extra to rape Julita.

The owner of the spa preyed on girls like Julita – vulnerable young women who were desperate for money and lacked a support system. Like the patrons who frequented his spa, the owner started sexually assaulting Julita.

In 2007, less than a month after she arrived at the spa, the National Bureau of Investigation (NBI) staged an operation to rescue Julita and the other young women who were being sexually exploited – raped for profit. Five of the victims were underage. The NBI immediately called IJM to intervene in the legal case. This case was one of the first for IJM Cebu, established in 2006 to combat commercial sexual exploitation of children.

The owner was arrested and charged with child abuse and qualified trafficking in persons – for profiting from the commercial sexual exploitation he promoted at his spa. At the beginning of the trial, the trafficking charge was inexplicably dropped. IJM appealed the downgraded charges and won, but the battle was just beginning.

Julita was free from the daily abuse she had endured in the spa, but she was deeply affected by the shame and effects of trauma. Though she was safe in a secure aftercare home, she slipped into a deep depression, struggling with thoughts of suicide. The spa owner began intimidating the girls he had once ruled over with impunity – including Julita. The owner successfully bribed another girl from the spa, who ran away from the aftercare home and started calling Julita to try and persuade her to do the same.

Julita resisted the pressure to run away or give up the case – and eventually the other young woman also returned to the safety of the aftercare home. At the recommendation of her IJM social workers, Julita moved to a new aftercare home. For her safety, she moved back and forth between homes, to block the suspect from contacting her and further intimidating her. Even in the midst of the turmoil moving

between homes, Julita decided to testify in court against the perpetrator, to ensure the man would face consequences for his abusive actions.

Although the owner now faces charges of child abuse and qualified trafficking in persons – a crime carrying a sentence of 20 years to life in prison – he has filed numerous motions in court to stall the trial. IJM refuses to give up, urging the court to resolve the motions filed by the owner so Julita can take the stand – and receive justice she deserves.

Supported by IJM and the social workers in the aftercare home, Julita started to believe that she could start over – that the abuse did not define her. She regained her eagerness to learn, and she signed up for a skills training class at the shelter where she learned how to sew. Then she applied for and received a scholarship to earn a college degree. She enrolled in a two-year college course to study Hotel and Restaurant Management. When she received her diploma in March 2010, Julita's mother traveled from their rural village, proud to witness her daughter's success from the audience.

On her own initiative – and just three days after graduation – Julita found a job at a local hotel where she was hired to prepare the rooms. She was soon promoted to a position at the front desk. Julita encountered new challenges, including an employer who, at first, did not pay her the legal minimum wage. But Julita had confidence to stand up for herself. She proved herself a reliable worker and her salary and benefits both increased.

Today, Julita lives at a boarding house with other young women who are trafficking survivors. She sends part of her earnings home to her family. She speaks confidently when she answers the phones at the front desk of the hotel and greets guests with a smile.

**A pseudonym has been used for the protection of this IJM client.*

Useful Articles:

- [‘Trafficking Survivors Attend School Outside Aftercare Home’. IJMUK. 12 November 2012 . Web. <https://www.ijmuk.org/node/296>.](https://www.ijmuk.org/node/296)
- [“Trafficking Survivors Inspire: ‘Now We Can Help Other Girls’”. IJM. 27 September 2012. Web. < https://www.ijm.org/news/trafficking-survivors-inspire-now-we-can-help-other-girls>.](https://www.ijm.org/news/trafficking-survivors-inspire-now-we-can-help-other-girls)
- [‘IJM Cebu: Trafficking Survivor Returns to her Hometown to Help Rebuild After Typhoon’, IJM. 10 April 2014. Web. https://www.ijm.org/articles/ijm-cebu-trafficking-survivor-returns-her-hometown-help-rebuild-after-typhoon.](https://www.ijm.org/articles/ijm-cebu-trafficking-survivor-returns-her-hometown-help-rebuild-after-typhoon)

Minimum Standards of IJM Aftercare- Bonded Labour Slavery

a. Intake- Immediately

- Provide crisis mental health support and basic first aid and/or referral for emergency medical services
- Provide basic education on bonded labour and enquiry process
- Provide a kit of essential toiletries, a set of clothes, a set of undergarments, bath towel, and food and drink as needed
- Ensure provision of temporary accommodation, if needed
- Facilitate provision of immediate hygiene needs
- Complete Needs Assessment and Aftercare Successful Outcomes before drafting the Treatment plan within 30 days of rescue.

b. Recovery/Rehabilitation

MEDICAL CARE- within 30 days of rescue

- Facilitate medical screening, including screening for TB and HIV within 60 days of rescue
- Facilitate follow-up medical treatment, as needed within 30 days of assessed need.

PLACEMENT

- Facilitate transportation of families back to their native village or place of choice within 14 days of rescue.
- Facilitate provision of Basic Food Necessities Kit. Family Kit (utensils, clothes, toiletries, etc.) and Tool Kits as needed within 14 days of rescue.
- If a client has a baby, whenever possible facilitate placement where client and child may remain together. Placing a pregnant girl at a home where there are other pregnant girls is desirable.
- Facilitate repatriation efforts, including safe transportation, for Primary Aftercare Participant's return to state/country of origin, as needed.

PSYCHO-SOCIAL SUPPORT

- Facilitate Freedom Training within 60 days of rescue
IJM's Freedom Training is a three-day course at the beginning of IJM's two-year aftercare programme and equips former forced labourers with basic skills they will need to thrive in freedom. Becoming a free person means re-learning how to make decisions and learning again what it is like to be in control of yourself. The families learn about their citizenship rights, budgeting and employment opportunities and have the opportunity to learn about each other's struggles and how they plan to overcome them.
- Apply for Government Benefits, such as rehabilitation monies and bonded labour pensions, within 60 days of rescue
- Complete Treatment Plan within 120 days of rescue
- Facilitate Brief Recovery Programme for victims of sexual violence and/or severe domestic violence within 90 days of assessed need
- Facilitate monthly meetings for 2 years
- Provide 6 follow-up home visits (quarterly for 1st year, biannually for 2nd year) to include discussion of relevant topics, including addiction, sexual trauma, education, employment, housing, legal rights, etc.
- Complete ASO Form 2 years after rescue
- Provide leadership training, per assessed need

ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT

- Facilitate school enrollment for all children age 14 and under
- Monitor school attendance
- Ensure that bank accounts are opened
- Ensure that any employed minor is in a non-abusive work environment
- Ensure at least one adult member of each family is earning income within 30 days of rescue
- Monitor employment of adult Aftercare Participant.

- Facilitate vocational training to one capable adult or child over the age of 14, ensuring that training will result in sustainable income, as needed within 90 days of assessed need

LEGAL ASSISTANCE

- Facilitate court preparation
- Facilitate support during legal proceedings
- Facilitate post-trial de-briefing

c. **Criteria for closing aftercare:**

- i. A case is closed based on termination of the legal proceedings, the client's age and the completion of the treatment plan.
 - Primary Aftercare Participant has completed treatment plan
 - Provide quarterly follow-up visits or phone contacts for one year from completion of the Treatment Plan to monitor if Primary Aftercare Participant sustains achieved progress
 - Upon completion of one year of follow-up, complete final ASO Form.
- ii. The primary Aftercare Participant has been repatriated to their home country
 - Attempt to follow up with them at home or in aftercare home facility quarterly for one year, if possible
 - If Treatment Plan is not complete, transition responsibly of follow up to aftercare home partners, if possible.
- iii. The primary Aftercare Participant has returned home and declines further aftercare services

d. **Preferable standards:**

- Facilitate the provision of a Release Certificate³ within two years of rescue
- Facilitate school enrollment for all minor dependents of Primary Aftercare Participants (ages 15-17) within 90 days of rescue
- Facilitate enrollment in a Self-Help/Savings Group within 30 days of assessed need
- Facilitate the provision of income generation programmes, as needed
- Provide kitchen garden seeds, as needed within 30 days of assessed need
- Provide bicycles for transportation to employment as needed

Useful Articles:

- Hawksley, Humphreys. "Lose My Life, My Leg or My Hand?: Modern-day Slavery in India". *BBC News*. 14 July 2014. Web. <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-asia-india-28256973>>.
- [Kapur, Mallika. "More than 500 slaves rescued from brick kilns". *The CNN Freedom Project*. 20 July 2011. Web. <http://thecnnfreedomproject.blogs.cnn.com/2011/06/29/more-than-500-slaves-rescued-from-brick-kilns/>.](http://thecnnfreedomproject.blogs.cnn.com/2011/06/29/more-than-500-slaves-rescued-from-brick-kilns/)

³ Roseann Rajan, IJM, explains Release Certificates: Hawksley, Humphreys. "Pushed by axe: Bonded labour in India's brick kilns" *BBC News*. 11 July 2014. Web. <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/magazine-27486450>>

- Timothy, Pranitha, “Supporting Former Slave Laborers in Building New Lives”. *Huffington Post*. 25 April 2012. Web. <<http://www.huffingtonpost.com/pranitha-timothy/supporting-former-slave-l b 3142396.html>>.
- [Saju, M T. “Exploited labourers tell tales of torture”. *The Times of India*. 22 May 2012. Web. <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/chennai/Exploited-labourers-tell-tales-of-torture/articleshow/13370544.cms>.](http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/chennai/Exploited-labourers-tell-tales-of-torture/articleshow/13370544.cms)

-
- i Article 18 of Directive 2011/36/EU on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Human Beings and Protecting its Victims; Article 6 Council of Europe Convention on Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings 2005
 - ii European Parliament resolution of 26 February 2014 on sexual exploitation and prostitution and its impact on gender equality (2013/2103(INI))
 - iii Resolution 1983 (2014), 8 April 2014, paragraphs 12.1.1 and 12.1.5
<http://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/X2H-Xref-ViewPDF.asp?FileID=20716>
 - iv Niklas Jakobsson and Andreas Kotsadam, The Law and Economics of International Sex Slavery: Prostitution laws and trafficking for sexual exploitation, Working Papers in Economics No 458, University of Gothenburg, June 2010, Revised May 2013, page 15, page 17
 - v Swedish Government Report SOU 2010:49 The Ban against the Purchase of Sexual Services. An evaluation 1999-2008, English Summary.
 - vi Swedish National Criminal Police, Trafficking in human beings for sexual and other purposes, Situation Report 9, 2009 covering data for 2006, page 9, section 3.1.2
http://www.regjeringen.no/pages/38780386/Evaluering_sexkjoesloven_2014.pdf page 11
 - vii *Ibid*, page 13
 - viii NCA Strategic Assessment The Nature and Scale of Human Trafficking in 2013, September 2014, Second Report of the Interdepartmental Ministerial Group on Human Trafficking, October 2013 paragraphs 1.17, 1.25, 3.9, 3.16; Equality and Human Rights Commission Inquiry into Human Trafficking in Scotland August 2011 p36
 - ix Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Criminal Justice and Support for Victims) (Northern Ireland) Act 2015 section 15; Parliament of Canada Bill C-36 Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act 2014;
<http://uk.reuters.com/article/2013/12/04/uk-france-prostitution-idUKBRE9B30R220131204>;
<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-30242641>
 - x Rhoda Grant Summary of consultation responses Proposed Criminalisation of the Purchase of Sex (Scotland) Bill (2) 2013
 - xi Sven-Axel Månsson (2000). Commercial Sexuality. In Bo Lewin (Ed.), *Sex in Sweden: On the Swedish sexual life 1996* (pp. 235–263) cited in Sweden’s prohibition of purchase of sex: the law’s reasons, impact and potential, *Women’s Studies International Forum* 34, 2011
 - xii European Convention on Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings 2005;
 - xiii Human Trafficking (Scotland) Bill Consultation by Jenny Marra MSP Member for North East Scotland September 2013 Page 33
 - xiv *Ibid*. pages 33-34
 - xv Scotland’s Commissioner for Children and Young People (SCCYP), Scotland: A safe place for child traffickers? 2011, guardians are recommended in many international research studies including by UNICEF and the European Convention and EU Directive.
 - xvi Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Criminal Justice and Support for Victims) (Northern Ireland) Act 2015 section 21; Modern Slavery Bill HL Bill 69 2014-15 as amended at Committee 10 Dec 2014, clause 48
 - xvii European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, Guardianship for children deprived of parental care - A handbook to reinforce guardianship systems to cater for the specific needs of child victims of trafficking, June 2014, page 27; Guidelines on the Protection of Child Victims of Trafficking, UNICEF technical notes, September 2006, section 4.2, page 17 and Reference Guide on Protecting the Rights of Child Victims of Trafficking in Europe, UNICEF, 2006, section 5.2, page 51 and pages 117-8, Check List for Guardians: Roles and Responsibilities