

The Cross Party Group on Accident Prevention and Safety Awareness

Minutes of the Eleventh Meeting held on

Wednesday 18th November 2015

6.00pm till 8.00pm, Committee Room 4, Scottish Parliament

1. Welcome

Clare Adamson MSP, and Convenor of the group, welcomed everyone present to the Eleventh meeting of the Cross Party Group on Accident Prevention and Safety Awareness.

Ms Adamson went onto give a very special thank you to Lis Bardell and Kate Barclay, parliamentary assistants, for organising this Cross Party Group.

The group's attention was drawn to Clare Adamson, MSP's activities since the last meeting. Clare mentioned she had attended the Scottish Gas Network event in the Parliament which highlighted the dangers of Carbon Monoxide. She also attended the Keep Warm for Winter event and handed out SGN materials, special thanks were given to SGN for supplying these.

Ms Adamson gave congratulations to St Andrew's First Aid Training and Supplies who won the Social Enterprise of the Year Award

Ms Adamson went on to mention if anyone in the group has any events/awareness weeks in their areas to please let her know and she will do her best to raise awareness of the issues in Parliament.

Ms Adamson gave thanks to Michael Avril, RNLI, for sponsoring the evening's refreshments and requested that other members consider covering the cost of the next meeting in January.

Ms Adamson highlighted the January CPG meeting and mentioned it would be the last opportunity for the group to meet before the elections in May. She asked everyone to fill out the reflection survey and hand it back to RoSPA in time for the AGM. Clare asked members to think about what has worked/what hasn't and what can we do going forward?

Ms Adamson drew the group's attention new guests, Allister Atkinson and Martin Hunt from Bluerad, who work in the field of home safety, who have produced a [nozzle](#) which you attach to your radiator to fight fire and smoke. Leaflets and the nozzle were available to see at the meeting.

2. Present and Apologies

Please see attached list for attendees and apologies.

3. Minutes from previous meeting

a. Accuracy

The minutes were proposed as accurate by Brian Topping and seconded by Irene Miller.

b. Matters Arising

There were no matters arising.

4. Secretary's Report

Christie Burnett, RoSPA Scotland, made reference to the Secretary's report and highlighted the issue of falls which was discussed at the Tenth meeting on Child Safety. Ms Adamson went on to mention Lesley Nish, NHS GGC, is looking for information on children falling from windows. Ms Adamson mentioned she was unsure if a Freedom of Information request would bring back any data as she is unsure Accident and Emergency collect this information. Ms Adamson asked the group to look out for data on this issue as it may be an area of concern for the future.

Christie gave mention to RoSPA's Big Book of Accident prevention. The book outlines RoSPA's strategy for preventing accidents. The book is available [online](#) and hard copies are available on request to the RoSPA office (cburnett@rospa.com).

The group were reminded to fill out the reflection form for the AGM meeting in January and were advised the form would be sent out via email in the coming weeks.

5. Road Safety: Presentations

(i) Graham Thomson, Transport Scotland

The Road Safety Framework: Working in Partnership

M Adamson introduced Graham Thomson, Transport Scotland. Graham has worked in the Civil Service since 2002 spending 10 years in a variety of customer facing and management roles within Registers of Scotland. For the last 3 years he has worked in Transport Scotland with responsibility for Road Safety and Blue Badge Policy – a role that sees him manage Scotland's Road Safety Framework to 2020 which he will be talking about today.

Graham Thomson presented on the Road safety framework, his presentation can be viewed [here](#).

Ms Adamson thanked Graham for an interesting presentation and opened the floor to questions.

Brian Topping thanked Graham for his presentation and went on to mention the key priorities laid out for the next five years by Transport Scotland in the road safety framework.

Brian asked, and was surprised as to why mobile phone use was not a priority in the framework? He asked if it was not found as an accidental cause to car crashes.

Mr Thomson responded: The board discussed this issue, and in the topic of seatbelt use, mobile phone issues were studied here however numbers of accidents caused by mobile phones were relatively low.

Road information tracking systems were looked at and members of the public were asked what they actually do in their cars and how they use their cars, the issue of mobile phone use did not appear in here and therefore was not included in the priority framework for the next five years. We use police data to collect this information.

Kathy Jenkins asked: In your statistics what percentage of road related accidents are known to be work related?

Mr Thomson responds: I will have to come back to you with this at a later date as I do not know the figures off the top of my head, however we do actively support ScORSA through the road safety framework and whether occupational road safety is highlighted as a priority or not we will still continue to support the work that ScORSA does.

Alistair McNab added comment to Kathy Jenkins' question by mentioning there is a figure for this type of information, HSE and Police Scotland work in collaboration to detect this data but what is difficult is trying to tease out what is classed as commuting and what is not. Unfortunately the only data we have to look at is fatal accident enquiries.

Andrew Fraser, Falkirk council, asked a question about speed control: I wonder what progress is being made in terms of speed adaptations in Scotland? Andrew made reference to technology available to control the speed of a vehicle.

Mr Thomson responded: Intelligent Speed Adaptations use GPS signals to control the vehicle, this is currently a hot topic of technology. We (Transport Scotland) find it difficult to take the lead on this aspect as the market drives a lot of progress in this field. In Scotland we are reliant on the European car market to take a particular lead. The review group has been discussing it and we have two commitments towards ISA, we will take forward some of this work in order to understand what role we can really play at government level.

Mr Fraser then asked if this should be seen as a leadership issue?

Mr Thomson responded: The review group is talking about the ISA and they will give a full report to whether we can take any further actions.

Mr Fraser: Glad to see you are still pushing.

Ron Ewing asked a question on cyclists: There is a great concern for cyclists old and young, riding on pavements and disregarding traffic law. I have raised this with associated colleagues and they just shrugged their shoulders and told me it just happens. But is this really good enough?

Mr Ewing went on to mention: Cyclists are very vulnerable; they come side to side with cars, busses and lorries and go through red lights. What is going to be done about this problem? I know this is tricky but we need to stop burying our heads in the sand and sort this issue out.

Mr Thomson responded: I think that we have to broaden our views out to all road users' behaviours and map it out together. We need to ask, why are they choosing to go on the pavement in the first place? We want more and more people to travel by bike, increase this to 10% of the public travelling via bicycle but they need to have the ability to travel safely. I do not think this is a question of just mentioning cyclists as the problem but it's more a broader question for having a mutual respect for all road users.

Brian Topping: I think we are just dodging issues here; we are creating problems out of solving others. Pedestrians, mothers with pushchairs have to jump out of the way of these cyclists on the pavement. We can't turn around here and say it is road users' fault. We need to look at the behaviours of cyclists.

Mr Thomson responded: I am trying to say that all road users display behaviours that they shouldn't and cyclists are not alone in this. Road laws should be in place to enable to cycle safety on the roads.

Colin Baird asked whether the road safety review might take the opportunity to review the three Es. Going back on the last point about traffic law and enforcement, traffic drivers don't suffer the same consequences of misbehaving on the roads as they do in Europe.

Mr Thomson responded: This is not a key thing we are looking at and it would be difficult to do so. But this is a very good question.

Mr Baird added: If the framework relies on partnership working then we should know if one of the E's is not performing? We should be comparing previous performance with current performance and mapping out the issues.

Mr Thomson responded: Police Scotland uses fatality data that we could use to compare these however I am unsure this would necessarily give the best picture. It would be very challenging.

Clare Adamson, MSP asked: The DVLA released postcode convictions of road traffic offences. However this could be down to a more active police presence. Will the road safety review look at particular areas of concern where education hasn't been looked at the same in other areas?

Mr Thomson responded: It is difficult to look at these stats, they report on particular constituencies and which areas are the safest, there are great inconsistencies in data right across the country therefore we have to look at several different solutions to these problems. It is very difficult to translate data into a national cure.

Mr Baird added: The reason I asked the question is because we are spending money on the engineering measures when we should maybe be spending money on enforcement. How do we decide on this money here when other measures are more effective?

Irene Miller added: My point follows on from Colin's; there is a concern around education with children and young people. This could be the impact that engineering measures are having. Speed cushions in residential areas have been flagged up as a concern to me by colleagues. Cars slow down then speed up in between speed cushions and children are

having to judge and manage these difference in speed in order to cross the road safely. Has this been considered?

Mr Thomson responds: We need children to grow up being safe road users and the only way they can learn is by interacting with the traffic.

Ms Miller added: There is no evidence for this however it does concern me and I wonder if engineering has supplemented this.

Clare Adamson, MSP added: Before I was an MSP I was a councillor for North Lanarkshire Council, they were the first area to implement 20's Plenty in domestic areas. That might be an area to help with concern over speed cushions.

Ms Adamson went onto mention Bruce Crawford, MSP who promoted 20's Plenty in Stirling. At the time this scheme was introduced accident rates fell hugely.

Mr Thomson added: 20 mile per hour speed limit zones are a very effective way of slowing down vehicles. However no evidence was captured as to whether vehicles were speeding up in between speed cushions.

Andrew Fraser: I am uncomfortable with the question of personal responsibility. We should not be held responsible for something we do not know is going on. At a particular level crossing in my area, a number of drivers stated that they did not see the amber warning light. Nonetheless, they were charged and fined. There are very good reasons for their failure to see the amber light, and there is, therefore, a need to look at how the law is applied in such situations. This is why I do not support the use of red light cameras, in particular.

Mr Thomson responded: I have no particular comment here as you can't prove it the other way and we don't actually know.

Kathy Jenkins asked: As a cyclist I am wondering what measures or plans there are for an increase in separation between motor vehicles and bicycles.

Mr Thomson responded: If we had lots of money we would definitely look at this on a national level.

Clare Adamson, MSP mentioned she had recently attended her local mountain biking club and was utterly aghast at how much of the urban area you could use without going near a road. It is quite a revelation to see just how much space can be used.

Brian Topping pointed out an issue with roundabouts: There is a design problem with roundabouts, having lines painted on roundabouts would stop people cutting across lanes.

Mr Thomson responds: Every roundabout is different therefore this would be difficult to do.

Andrew Fraser, Falkirk council added: Have a look at [Turbo Roundabout](#); it's the next big thing.

Andy Cathro, Colleges Network Group: I am heavily involved in working with local schools and teaching them in cycling however the issue lies with the parents not following through with our education.

Clare Adamson, MSP took a moment to welcome colleague Rob Gibson MSP to the meeting.

(ii) Dr Sarah Jones, Public Health Wales

Graduated Driver Licensing

The Problem Young Driver or the Young Driver Problem?

Clare Adamson, MSP introduced Dr Sarah Jones. Dr Jones is a consultant in Environmental Health Protection and the injuries lead for Public Health Wales. Before joining Public Health training in 2005, Sarah spent eight years as an injury epidemiologist at Cardiff University, working mainly with Prof Ronan Lyons, now at Swansea University. Sarah looked after the All Wales Injuries Surveillance System (AWISS), as well as having specific interests in road traffic injuries, sports injuries and the links between injuries and deprivation.

In 2004, Sarah completed a PhD on child pedestrian injuries and deprivation. For the past five years, Sarah has been advocating for the introduction of Graduated Driver Licensing to reduce road traffic crash injuries and fatalities associated with young drivers.

Dr Jones' presentation can be viewed [here](#).

Clare Adamson, MSP thanked Dr Jones for her fascinating presentation and opened the floor to questions.

Ms Adamson asked: I am interested in the difference between girls and boys in the stats you mentioned; are girls learning to drive later than boys?

Dr Jones responds: It is difficult to tell because of the analysis I work with I can only focus on 17-19 year olds and it doesn't tell us when people pass their driving tests. I think from the girls it is interesting and I wonder if girls are trying to emulate boys in driving behaviour.

Ms Adamson added: One thing that strikes me over all the years is that boys pose a higher risk over all areas.

Dr Jones adds: Generally boys are at greater risk, crash rates are still 1.5% higher than girls.

Brian Topping commented: I am probably one of the 39% you mentioned who are against GDL but willing to be convinced. Aberdeenshire is one of the worst areas for car accidents. We are working on Safe Drive Stay Alive which is targeted at young people and danger. We give grants to learners to go through the Pass Plus scheme. The ones going through Pass Plus feel more confident, parents feel more confident and fewer accidents happen. Why don't we just make it mandatory that learners between 17-25 have to go through advanced driving such as Pass Plus?

There is one big problem I see with GDL and that is myself being from a rural area, the kids need their cars for university and work, I can see that being a big problem.

Dr Jones responded: Pass Plus is a good example however there is no evidence that passing this scheme decreases crashes. Going back to my toddler idea, think how long it takes for a

child to be able to fully walk on their own. Six hours in the Pass Plus scheme is insufficient in all the areas that they need to learn about.

Young people tend to be very confident; adding further to that confidence through Pass Plus actually presents a crash risk.

Kenneth MacDermid added: With Pass Plus there is no financial benefit to those who are living in deprived areas. If we were to propose a scheme such as Pass Plus there would have to be a benefit of cheaper insurance to entice those living in more deprived areas to pay for the scheme.

Ms Adamson added: This is the same idea with the black boxes fitted in cars- it poses an inequality issue.

Dr Jones responds: I spoke to car insurers and they are desperate to reduce premiums however they have no evidence that Pass Plus reduces car crashes.

Daniel Docherty: I am in favour of GDL to enhance the skills and educate young drivers. It has been highlighted that young drivers don't have hazard perception skills but GDL looks to limit this? And finally you speak of limited night time driving, in Scotland six months of the year it is in darkness, how would this help with driving experience?

Dr Jones responded: GDL works, if you are under the supervision of a person over the age of 25 you can drive at night and with passengers, giving young drivers the opportunity to gain experience without the pressure of being out on their own. Passenger restrictions help reduce fatalities.

Colin Baird asked: Is it true 17 year olds haven't developed physically to understand risk?

Dr Jones responds: Yes the frontal lobe does not fully develop until the age of 25.

Ron Ewing asked: In terms of restrictions, how long will these be in place for young drivers?

Dr Jones responds: That is variable, some last 3-6 months, in Australia they learn to drive at around 16 and a half and won't have their full driving licences until they are 22.

6. Dates of future meetings

- 20th Jan 2016- AGM and Reflection

(Provisional dates have been set for 8th June 2016, 16th November 2016 and January 18th 2017.)

7. Close

Clare Adamson, MSP thanked the speakers for their fascinating presentations and asked anyone who had any pressing business to feed it into the next CPG meeting in January.

Ms Adamson went on to thank everyone for their attendance and wished them a safe journey home.

Appendix A

CPG 18th November

Attending

Clare Adamson	Convenor
Sandy Allan	RoSPA
Allister Atkinson	Bluerad
Robert Atkinson	Healthy Working Lives
Michael Avril	RNLI
Austin Baird	IOSH
Colin Baird	SCOTS Traffic and Road Safety (TaRS) group.
Vince Bowles	Scottish Autism
Claire Burnett	RCPCH
Andy Cathro	H & S Colleges Network Group
Scott Coull	SGN
Daniel Doherty	Sprinkler Safe Europe Ltd
Jim Dorman	St Andrews First Aid
Ron Ewing	CSI Safety
Dave Forrester	SELECT
Andrew Fraser	Falkirk Council
Mike Garfitt	RNLI
Rob Gibson	MSP
Martin Hunt	Bluerad
Kathy Jenkins	Scottish Hazards
Kenneth MacDermid	RLSS
Gill MacGregor	Institute of Advanced Motorists

Lisa McCann	REHIS (on behalf of Gwyneth Kerwin)
Neil McNicol	John McNicol and Co
Martin Millar	Scottish Fire and Rescue Service
Irene Miller	Health Scotland
Nicola Philp	Fife Council
Andrew Price	Scottish Community Safety Network
Dave Roy	Kingdom Housing
Grant Taylor	SGN
Insp Andrew Thomson	Police Scotland
Laura Thomson	Fife Council
Brian Topping	Safety Advocate
Alistair McNab	HSE

In attendance

Christie Burnett	Secretary (RoSPA)
Sarah Jones	Cardiff University (Speaker)
Graham Thomson	Transport Scotland (Speaker)
Kate Barclay	Parliamentary Assisstant

Apologies

Cherie Morgan	Play Scotland
Lesley Nish	NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde
Caroline Wilson	The Risk Factory
Bryan Finlay	RLSS
Tom Beattie	Safety Advocate

Cheryl Smith	Aberdeenshire Council
Christopher Bell	Trading Standards
Jean Brown	Aberlour
John Cairns	Safety Groups UK
Janet Castro	SAPC
Margaret Dekker	SCID
Gena Falconer	Highland Council
Peter Kirwan	Neighbourhood Watch Scotland
John Johnston	FMC
Rachel Jones	Totseat
Peter Kirwan	Neighbourhood Watch Scotland
Elizabeth Lumsden	RoSPA
Peter Martin	Gas Safe Register
Karen McDonnell	RoSPA Scotland
Sylvia McKay	Hopscotch Nursery
Jill Mulholland	Transport Scotland
Martine Nolan	Exodus Group
Carol Raeburn	RLNI
Michelle Harrity	Scottish Government
Wayne Mackay	Electrical Safety First
Martine Nolan	Exodus Group
Dr Richard Simpson	MSP
Cheryl Smith	Aberdeenshire Community Safety
Allan Thomson	Central Training Services