

**Cross Party Working Group on Men's Violence
Against Women & Children
2nd October 2013, 5.30pm-7pm
Committee Room 4, Scottish Parliament**

Present/Apologies:	
<p>Present: Christina McKelvie MSP (Chairing) Nadine Jassat (SWA, Minutes) Lily Greenan (SWA) Malcolm Chisholm MSP Jenny Kemp (Zero Tolerance) Isy Hart (Student) Megan Bastick (WILPF) Amrita Ahluwalia (Roshni) Rosie Greig (University of Strathclyde) Stacey Devine (NUS Scotland) Marsha Scott (West Lothian Council) Miranda Pio (West Lothian Council) Ruth Bittern (Office of Malcolm Chisholm MSP) April Cumming (Scottish Parliament)</p> <p>Apologies: Ann Hayne (NHS Lanarkshire) Claudia Beamish MSP Dr Melanie McCarry (University of Central Lancashire) Michelle Corcoran (Edinburgh WA) Dr Nancy Lombard (Glasgow Caledonian University) Ann Henderson (STUC) Anne Salter (Stirling and Clackmannanshire Child Protection) Sandie Barton (Rape Crisis Scotland) Kate Higgins (Children 1st) Stephen Madill (Working With Men Project) Graeme Richards (Circle Scotland) Ann Meikle (Stirling Council) Callum Hendry (White Ribbon Scotland) Alison Johnstone MSP Mhairi McGowan (ASSIST)</p>	
2 Minutes of the last meeting and matters arising	Action:
The minutes of the last meeting were read and approved.	
There were no matters arising.	
3. Prosecuting Domestic Abuse: Are We Getting It Right? Discussion Introduced by Lily Greenan, SWA	Action:
Lily Greenan introduced this item, which has been brought to CPG following the recent Bill Walker case. Lily's introduction touched on the following:	

- The presence of physical violence as part of domestic abuse in public discourse. The 23 assaults committed by Bill Walker were met with shock by the public, and Lily reflects if – in our efforts to draw attention on to the range of behaviours within domestic abuse – we have taken the focus off physical violence.
- Bill Walker’s case is an example of ‘coercive control’. Lily reflected on the use of this understanding of coercive control in domestic abuse courts, and raises the question of why domestic abuse courts are located in summary courts. DA is predominantly prosecuted in summary courts as the incident alone is focused on, not coercive control or patterns of behaviour. Bill Walker’s case went to a specialist sheriff, which is positive but the sheriff’s powers are limited in a summary setting with regards to length of sentence.

Lily opened up the discussion with the question: Are we taking the right approach to prosecuting DA, or do we need a new one?

Points from the discussion included:

- Stacey Devine and Christina McKelvie MSP met with equalities minister and updated strategy.
- Lily Greenan and Jenny Kemp attended National Group to Address VAW meeting, now chaired by Shona Robison, Minister for Commonwealth Games and Sport. The strategy and action plan may come out next year. The NGVAW included an update on the Police Scotland strategy and the roll out of MATACS in each of the 3 police federations. Police Scotland want to see a greater push in engaging men in tackling domestic abuse and focusing spotlight on perpetrators. Lily concluded that there was a need for a strategy on VAW that reflected all dynamics.
- Christina McKelvie MSP raised that corroboration isn’t based solely on eye witnesses, but is interconnected with forensic findings.
- April Cumming raised the question as to who decides what indicators are that go into a DA/SA risk assessment. Lily Greenan responded that the CAADA/ DASH checklist assesses the risk of death or serious injury. This encompasses the domestic violence risk assessment, with experience of rape being just one of many questions. If the risk assessment scores above a certain level it is automatically referred to a MARAC. Ideally the woman’s interests are represented through having a dedicated support/advocacy worker at this meeting. It is an action orientated police led approach.

Marsha Scott and Miranda Pio enter at this point.

- Stacey Devine cited the rising number of women contacting NUS Scotland and students’ associations with regards to domestic abuse. If a woman discloses to their students’ association, Stacey asked if that students’ association could become a third party reporting site where women could report.
- Stacey Devine also highlighted the public perception of those NUS work with of domestic abuse often being viewed as just physical abuse – this is worrying as it lacks focus on mental health and issues post domestic abuse. Malcolm Chisholm MSP added to this by reflecting on the importance of the term “Domestic Abuse” as opposed to “Domestic Violence” in Scotland.
- Jenny Kemp asked what the ideal scenario of changes in relation to prosecuting DA was for SWA? Lily Greenan said that there will be a roundtable discussion at the end of October on what can and should be done. SWA want to have a discussion to examine alternatives – do we need a new law or a new approach? Lily said incremental progress is already happening, perhaps now we can look at more radical

**LG to keep
CPG update
on roundtable**

<p>legislative changes. Lily talked about how we use language: 'patterns of behaviour' and 'course of conduct' are more easily understood than 'coercive control'. Lily will keep CPGMVAWC update on the outcomes of the round table discussion.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Marsha Scott proposed that as a next step to this matter the CPGMVAWC should hold a discussion on this and invite justice minister to talk with CPGMVAWC on this. Marsha later added that if we did invite Kenny McAskill (Justice Minister) we should talk about wider VAW Law also. Christina McKelvie MSP is meeting Kenny McAskill next week. • Megan Bastick asked about research on responses to male victims of domestic abuse, and asked if Scottish policy had thought about whether or not appropriate services or responses were available. Lily Greenan highlighted a number of services for men including AMIS and Men's Advice Line (who are supported by the Scottish Government). Malcolm Chisholm MSP said this had come up in parliamentary debate. Malcolm highlighted that male victims of DA sometimes differ in scale and severity to female victims. Marsha Scott talked about an American report which said that the likelihood of male victims to report is equal to female victims, with Hispanic men more likely to report. • Child protection and domestic abuse: on an operational level, Scotland is not good at addressing the link between the two. April Cumming asked Lily Greenan if risk assessment could be taken with CP also – Lily referred to a 1991 study in her answer in which 100% of child protection cases had DA also, despite this there is no RA for this in place. Marsha Scott added that studies in West Lothian show DA in 70% of CP cases; however interventions focus on substance misuse which occurs in 35% of cases. 	<p>outcomes.</p> <p>CM to invite Justice Minister Kenny McAskill to the CPG.</p>
<p>4. Prostitution Policy: Where Next? Discussed Introduced by Jenny Kemp, ZT</p>	<p>Action:</p>
<p>Jenny Kemp introduced the discussion, focusing on where next now that Rhoda Grant MSP bill on criminalising demand did not progress. In her introduction, Jenny touched on the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women involved in prostitution are often the most vulnerable women with complex needs. Only a tiny minority of women working in prostitution are making positive public statements about this; for the rest it is survival behaviour. • Prostitution contrasts with wider messages about respecting women. • Looking forward to where next, JK highlighted a proposal with regards to licensing sexual entertainment venues, which closed on the 24th, a proposal on human trafficking, and the invisible men project. <p>Following Jenny's introduction, there was some discussion on why there was not more support from politicians (raised by Marsha Scott, answered by Malcolm Chisholm MSP and Christina McKelvie MSP). There was also a discussion about the lack of an equal representation of women involved in prostitution on the issue. Lily Greenan reflected on the timing of Rhoda Grant's bill, and suggests that the route to tackling legislation may be long haul, and be led by education first. The group also discussed lessons from other countries' approaches to prostitution policies – Stacey Devine highlighted the Welsh government's 3 year research on the subject which included speaking to women affected by it. Christina McKelvie MSP introduced the topic of the reasons why women may enter into prostitution, including poverty and the impact that the welfare cuts will have on this. Jenny Kemp highlighted that Zero Tolerance are refocusing their 'Under Pressure' training to target more young people at high risk of sexual exploitation'. Marsha Scott considered if we should also look not just at why women enter, but question why there is a male entitlement to buy sex.</p>	
<p>5. The Year Ahead – Parliamentary work on VAW – Introduced by Malcolm Chisholm MSP</p>	<p>Action:</p>

and Christina McKelvie MSP	
<p>Christina McKelvie MSP and Malcolm Chisholm MSP gave an update on parliamentary work on VAW, which touched on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kenny McAskill to be invited to the next CPG, could also inform Criminal Justice Bill. • Rape Crisis and Women’s Aid – Civil Court reforms. • Child Protection Bill, Rhoda Grant MSP members’ bill, Jenny Marra proposal on human trafficking. <p>Following this, Marsha Scott proposed inviting Jenny Marra to talk to the CPG, however the debate on trafficking takes place at the same time as the next meeting.</p>	
6. Information Sharing	Action:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Marsha Scott – Marsha proposed sharing 16 days activities before next meeting. Also asked if we could organize how we organize the work of the CPG, moving to a model of consistent communication and support, making us more of an advocacy group than information sharing one. • Stacey Devine – Reclaim the night marches will be held in October (Edinburgh) and November (Glasgow, Aberdeen). • Megan Bastick – Edinburgh Justice festival, on the 17th October there will be a session on Scottish Women in conflict. • Marsha Scott – CPFR event, review of performance of international criminal court. • Marsha Scott – Evan Stark will speak in West Lothian on 10th October. 	
7. AOCB	Action:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Callum Hendry asked for a note to be read in his absence, as the CPG was running over time, it was agreed this note will be circulated to the group with the minutes. <i>Update: the information which Callum Hendry wished to share was to make the CPGMVAWC aware of the upcoming 'Side by Side' event, for more information visit White Ribbon Scotland's website.</i> 	NJ
7. Date of Next Meeting	Action:
4 th December, 17.30 – 19.00, Q1.03, Scottish Parliament.	