

MEETING

**WEDNESDAY 20th FEBRUARY 2019, 5.30PM TO 7PM
IN COMMITTEE ROOM 4 OF THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT**

DRAFT MINUTE

PRESENT

MSPs

Kenneth Gibson MSP	co-Convener, and Convener for today's meeting
Brian Whittle MSP	co-Convener
Monica Lennon MSP	

Invited Guests

Dr Nathan Critchlow	Institute for Social Marketing, University of Stirling
Vivienne MacLaren	Chair, Scottish Women's Football
Louise Feenie	Scottish Government
Christopher Whyte	Scottish Government

Non MSP Group Members

Linda Alexander	Children's Health Scotland
Annie Anderson	Scottish Cancer Foundation
Christina Buckton	The Institute of Health & Wellbeing, University of Glasgow
Eric Carlin	Scottish Health Action on Alcohol Problems (SHAAP)
Elena Dimova	Glasgow Caledonian University
Alison Douglas	Alcohol Focus Scotland
Sheila Duffy	ASH Scotland
Nadia Fanous	University of Glasgow
Paul Gillen	The Royal College of Physicians of Edinburgh
Laurence Gruer	Individual
Anna Gryka-Macphail	Obesity Action Scotland
Kenny Harrison	Local Licensing Forum, Argyll & Bute Council
Elizabeth Hurst	Mentor UK
Colwyn Jones	Individual
Mike Lean	University of Glasgow
Andy Macgregor	ScotCen Social Research
Elspeth Malony	NHS Health Scotland
Gary Meek	Glasgow Council on Alcohol
Nicola Merrin	Alcohol Focus Scotland
Muriel Mowat	Befriending Networks
Lindsay Paterson	The Royal College of Physicians of Edinburgh
Jamie Pearce	The University of Edinburgh
Debbie Provan	British Dietetics Association
Peter Rice	Individual member
Bruce Ritson	Scottish Health Action on Alcohol Problems (SHAAP)
Christina Sabbagh	Obesity Action Scotland

Simon Shepherd	University of Dundee
Jonathan Sher	Queen's Nursing Institute Scotland
Rebecca Sibbett	Alcohol Focus Scotland
Valerie Smith	ASH Scotland
Robert Steele	Scottish Cancer Foundation
Abbey Trippel	ASH Scotland
Lorraine Tulloch	Obesity Action Scotland
Lauren White	MRC/CSO Social and Public Health Sciences Unit
Laura Wilson	Food Standards Scotland

APOLOGIES

David Stewart MSP	
Miles Briggs MSP	
Alex Cole-Hamilton MSP	
Alison Whiteman MSP	
Anas Sarwar MSP	
Kenneth Anderson	Individual member
Sarah Atherton	Royal College of Nursing
Ruth Balmer	British Dietetic Association
Julie Breslin	Addaction
Iain Broom	Individual Member
Aileen Bryson	Royal Pharmaceutical Society
Graeme Callander	Addaction
Emma Crawshaw	Crew 2000 (Scotland)
Tara Cooper	Royal College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists
Lucia D'Ambruoso	Centre for Global Development, University of Aberdeen
Hilary Davidson	Alcohol Focus Scotland
Ian Findlay	Paths For All
Andrew Fraser	NHS Health Scotland
Shona Hilton	The Institute of Health & Wellbeing, University of Glasgow
Daniel Jones	British Heart Foundation Scotland
Mathis Heydtmann	NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde
Laurence Moore	Individual Member
Justina Murray	Scottish Families Affected by Alcohol & Drugs
Brian Pringle	WLDAS
Helen Reilly	Royal Pharmaceutical Society
Debbie Sigerson	NHS Health Scotland
Louise Slorance	Royal College of Paediatrics & Child Health Scotland
Claire Stevens	Voluntary Health Scotland
Drew Walker	NHS Tayside

PART ONE

		Action
<p>1.</p>	<p>Welcome by the Convener, Kenneth Gibson MSP</p> <p>The Convener welcomed everyone to the meeting and in particular welcomed the guest speakers, Dr Nathan Critchlow from the University of Stirling and Ms Vivienne Maclaren from Scottish Women’s Football.</p> <p>A summary was provided of the last meeting which was the Group’s second AGM in October, where the Minister for Public Health, Sport and Wellbeing, Joe FitzPatrick MSP updated the Group on the five new Government health action plans and strategies, and the new public health priorities and body.</p> <p>The Convener noted that since the AGM, the Scottish Government’s Alcohol Prevention Framework and alcohol and drugs strategy, Rights, Respect and Recovery, were published, in November. These sit alongside the Tobacco Control Action Plan, the Diet and Healthy Weight Delivery Plan, and the Public Health Priorities for Scotland to create a full complement of plans and strategies in relation to public health in Scotland.</p> <p>The Group was reminded that the AGM saw the appointment of David Stewart MSP, Brian Whittle MSP and Kenneth Gibson MSP as co-conveners for the year, who will chair the group on a rotational basis going forward. The joint secretariat of ASH Scotland and Alcohol Focus Scotland were reappointed for a further year.</p>	
<p>2.</p>	<p>Declaration of Interests (Standing Item)</p> <p>Members were asked to declare any updates to their original declared interests, and to highlight any conflicts of interest specific to today’s meeting.</p> <p>There were no declarations.</p>	
<p>3.</p>	<p>Topic Discussion: Marketing unmasked: dispelling the myths and taking a stand</p> <p>The Convener introduced the guest speakers, and it was noted questions and discussion would follow.</p> <p><u>Dr Nathan Critchlow</u></p> <p>Dr Critchlow started his presentation by going through the different types of marketing, from traditional forms such as TV advertising, product design, price offers and event sponsorship to the newer digital forms, which often involve user-generated content. Digital marketing can be viewed as more powerful and less controllable. The effects of marketing come from cumulative exposure to all types of marketing, which is why companies have broad marketing strategies.</p> <p>The research began in 2017 and focused on young people aged 11-19 years old (demographically representative of the UK) and their recall of nine forms of alcohol marketing. The research also looked at the association between recall of alcohol marketing and behaviours.</p>	

Other studies have conducted focus groups with young people, finding that they are aware of alcohol marketing, they are able to interpret the messages in the marketing (e.g. gendered, etc.) and know that it influences their consumption.

Dr Critchlow highlighted that marketing is one of the biggest platforms on which to communicate health messages. Most forms of marketing include these (in the form of responsible drinking messages or industry websites), except sports sponsorship on which there are no health messages.

The policy context within which alcohol marketing sits was discussed. The last UK strategy acknowledged that young people see alcohol marketing and that it impacts on their consumption, but were happy to continue with self-regulation. Scotland has been more progressive and positive. Reference was made to the AFS report, 'Promoting good health from childhood', which provides an accurate summary of the evidence and recommendations for action. These include looking at outdoor marketing, sports sponsorship, the print media and the content of marketing. The Scottish Government's Alcohol Framework contains a commitments on alcohol marketing, a progressive approach going forward. Ireland introduced legislation recently with arrange of measure to control marketing. There is a need for evaluation to allow pre- and post- comparisons (which did not take place in France).

Vivienne MacLaren, Scottish Women's Football

The presentation began with an overview of Scottish Women's Football, with Ms MacLaren highlighting that SWF owns and manages all of the domestic competitions in women's and girls' football across Scotland. They are recognised only as an Affiliated National Association (ANA), meaning they receive no public funding (all funding comes from registered clubs and players, and commercial partners). SWF are based in Hampden and now have 5 full time equivalent staff members.

They have nearly 8000 players registered, the highest it has ever been. 80% of the players registered are under 18 years old. SWF tries to promote health and wellbeing. For example, coaches go with players and parents to GPs to discuss issues, such as mental health, which is a huge area of concern.

Ms MacLaren is a marketing and digital professional with 23 years' experience in working with both clients and agencies. She joined Scottish Women's Football board as the Media and Communications Director in 2014, and has been the chair of the Board since 2016. The SWF re-branded all competitions across all marketing channels, and introduced a marketing and commercial strategy.

SWF wanted to ensure that they had an identity, that people know who they are and that players have pride in the brand they are representing. They have 3 commercial partners: SSE, Scottish Building Society and BBC Alba. They want to partner with positive brands to help create a 'clean sport'. It is common sense – why have a partner that's pushing alcohol to children?

Reactions to this decision have been generally positive. The board believes that they will get bigger commercial sponsors in time, and want to continue with partners who are very involved rather than only interested in short-term investment. They will be announcing a new partner soon.

It costs a substantial amount of money to go professional – 200-250 thousand a year for each team, with 8 teams. SWF had £3k of income in 2013, now at around £130k. They need to make sure that any move to professional is sustainable and robust.

The fact that SFW work with girls has been a huge influence on their decision. Feedback on the girls on issues drives their approach. The need for positive role models for the players is also important for SWF. Feedback from the younger players is that they don't want to drink alcohol because they want to be the best, which means a healthy lifestyle. They have a responsibility to their members, which is why are delighted to try and formulate a message around alcohol and gambling sponsorship in sport. They have a duty to help and encourage women and girls to play football and understand how to enjoy and live healthy lives.

The Convener opened up to questions from Group members:

Laurence Gruer (individual member) highlighted that when he was watching sport on TV, a French commentator had pointed out the Guinness logo, and was astonished that England has alcohol advertising in sport. How widespread is this in the rest of Europe? **Dr Critchlow** talked of the French legislation, the Loi Evin, which has issues of enforcement and has seen a creeping influence of alcohol sponsorship in sport in the last ten years. For example, 5/6 years ago the Champions League in France saw Heineken adverts because the adverts only featured their logo and 'enjoy responsibly' rather than the brand name. Dr Critchlow conducted research into the 2016 Euros in France. They were surprised that Carlsberg was announced as the main sponsor, and saw pitchside borders of their motto. This was 'alibi marketing' in which the marketing is distilled to very core principles (e.g. colours, taglines). Carlsberg commented that they 'didn't link to alcohol at any stage'. The ban on sports sponsorship in France was taken to the European Commission in advance of the World Cup in 1998. The Commission said that it was up to France to set the legislation. You can talk to the individual clubs about sponsors, but UEFA and FIFA etc. are very powerful. Brazil for example had the 'Budweiser Bill' which saw a weakening in the legislation.

Brian Whittle MSP mentioned a running club that was sponsored by a gin company, and that has half a million euros budget, meaning that they win quite often, although other countries are worse. There was some discussion that recall of adverts on TV may be better than other forms of marketing because they are more obvious. Other types of marketing may be submerged below conscious awareness. In New Zealand, the Kids Cam study used cameras to measure how often children were exposed to marketing, and found that sports sponsorship featured most heavily.

Annie Anderson (Scottish Cancer Foundation) asked whether health promotion bodies could step in, as in other areas such as Western Australia where the Healthways Foundation provided sponsorship. **Vivienne MacLaren** said that SWF

will be announcing a partnership that fits with this. It makes sense to try to promote health messages and they want their partners to do the same thing. **Dr Critchlow** highlighted Barcelona's partnership with Unicef and Heart of Midlothian's partnership with Save the Children at one point, so these kinds of relationships are always possible.

Peter Rice (SHAAP) has recently noticed Heineken Zero adverts during sports ad breaks. Does this reduce the consumption of regular alcohol or is this alibi marketing? **Dr Critchlow** said that we don't know as the evidence is not there yet as to the impact of such advertising. We need to look at research in other areas such as obesity, to see whether such products are a gateway to consumption of the main product. Dr rice asked Vivienne MacLaren whether SWF they would accept sponsorship if approach by a no alcohol beer. **Vivienne MacLaren** answered emphatically that SWF would not accept funding from alcohol companies, whether for low alcohol products or not.

Sheila Duffy (ASH Scotland) applauded the presentations and that they were about people. She noted that multinational corporations say they are about people but they are all about profit. Cigarettes were in club colours in the past, and now you have coloured e-cigarettes, which is all about getting the new generation into using their products. Sheila highlighted the consultation on regulations of e-cigarette advertising which is expected in April/May – the secretariat will ensure Group members are advised of this when published and encourages members to respond.

Jonathan Sher (Queen's Nursing Institute Scotland) asked what good social marketing promoting health messages around alcohol looks like. Previously messaging has been well intentioned but not effective. **Dr Critchlow** said that you have to think like a marketer, talk to marketers and talk to the people you are trying to reach with the marketing in order for this to be effective. A good example of social marketing is the Hello Sunday Morning campaign in Australia, which focuses on the positive aspects of moderating consumption. The social marketing should focus less on the behaviour and more on the positive connotations.

Elizabeth Hurst (Mentor UK) asked whether any protective factors have been identified in relation to alcohol marketing. What is the relationship between exposure and how different demographics respond to advertising? **Dr Critchlow** explained that more research is needed this area, such as exploration into the separation of mediating processes (the literature looks mostly at facilitating factors). They know that peers and parents consuming less and have low approval results in young people being less likely to be influenced by the marketing. But people are complex and we need to move away from primitive models.

Eric Carlin (SHAAP) asked whether Scottish Women's Football would accept sponsorship from unhealthy food. **Vivienne MacLaren** said that she personally wouldn't and believes that the board also would not accept this. Accepting such sponsorship wouldn't fit with the aspiration to be a clean sport and try to increase understanding of how to be healthy overall.

	<p>Laurence Gruer (individual member) highlighted that in the 1990s the chair of the FS was also chair of the Health Education Board to Scotland, which sponsored the Scottish Cup Final. But Health Boards now have low budgets and can't compete.</p> <p>Vivienne MacLaren said that they could compete in the women's game, as it is quite different.</p> <p>Alison Douglas (AFS) raised the alcohol marketing pledge that was signed by a range of organisations and the majority of MSPs. Given the Scottish Government commitments on alcohol marketing, Alison suggested that it is now a good time to revisit this, asking willing members to sign this.</p>	
--	---	--

PART TWO

<p>4.</p>	<p>Welcome to new members and apologies for absence</p> <p>The meeting welcomed three new member organisations to the Group: Befriending Networks (joined in October 2018), Breast Cancer Now (joined October 2018) and British Dietetic Association (joined November 2018).</p> <p>The number of apologies received (as detailed above) was 5 MPS and 24 non-MSP group members.</p>	
<p>5.</p>	<p>Minute of Meeting – 3rd October 2018</p> <p>The minutes were approved as correct, and there were no matters arising.</p>	
<p>6.</p>	<p>Any Other Business</p> <p>The Convener asked that members feed into the secretariat any ideas for future discussions.</p> <p>The Convener highlighted his intention to submit a motion on this meeting, which provides an overview of the presentations and highlights the alcohol marketing pledge. It would be best that this motion is lodged to generate support with the possibility of lodging motions for debate considered for the future.</p> <p>Draft motion:</p> <p><i>That the Parliament commends the work of the Cross Party Group on Improving Scotland's Health: 2021 and Beyond on raising the issue of the role of marketing in driving consumption of health-harming products by holding a meeting on 20th February 2019; notes the evidence presented by Dr Nathan Critchlow from the Institute of Social Marketing at the University of Stirling on how young people in the UK recall examples of alcohol marketing and can identify alcohol brands, and that exposure to alcohol marketing is associated with increased consumption, higher-risk drinking, susceptibility to drink, and brand knowledge amongst young people; notes the stance taken by Scottish Women's Football against alcohol sponsorship as part of their aspiration to be a 'clean sport', as outlined by their Chair Vivienne MacLaren; recognises the unanimous agreement of those represented at the meeting that alcohol marketing has no place in childhood and</i></p>	

	<p><i>all children should play, learn and socialise in places that are healthy and safe, protected from exposure to alcohol advertising and sponsorship; and welcomes the commitment within the Scottish Government’s Alcohol Framework to consult and engage on a range of potential measures to protect children and young people from alcohol marketing in Scotland.</i></p> <p>Sheila Duffy noted that Claire Stevens from Voluntary Health Scotland (VHS) had asked that the Group to be made aware that the European office of the World Health Organization was running a health equity initiative focused on health inequalities in Europe and was compiling a report about this. WHO had approached VHS to include a case study about the work of the CPG on health inequalities in the report. The full WHO report will be published in June 2019.</p> <p>Sheila also highlighted to the Group that No Smoking Day takes place on 30th March 2019.</p>	
<p>7.</p>	<p>Further Meetings 2019</p> <p>Wednesday 12th June 2019 – 5.30pm to 7pm, in Committee Room 4 of the Scottish Parliament – Chair Brian Whittle MSP</p> <p>Wednesday 18th September 2019 – 5.30pm to 7pm, in Committee Room 5 of the Scottish Parliament – Chair David Stewart MSP. This is the AGM meeting.</p>	

The Convener thanked everyone for coming and closed the meeting.