

CROSS PARTY GROUP ON MUSIC

Committee Room 6, Scottish Parliament

19 June, 2018

Present:

George Adam MSP	Gayle Martin-Brown (HITS)
Tom Arthur MSP (Chair)	Luke McCullough (BBC Scotland)
Adam Behr (Newcastle Univ./ Live Music Exchange)	Yvonne McLellan (Lost Art Agency)
Jo Buckley (Dunedin Consort)	Alan Morrison (Creative Scotland)
Morag Campbell (NYCOS)	Mae Murray (MEPG)
Kenny Christie (HITS)	Dougal Perman (SMIA)
Tam Coyle (SMIA)	Ralph Riddiough (#changethetune)
Cindy Douglas (Musicians Union)	Douglas Robertson (Soundhouse)
Lois Fitch (RCS)	Davy Scott (West of Scotland Univ.)
David Francis (Traditional Music Forum)	Jane Stanley (Glasgow Univ.)
Rachael Hamilton MSP	Nick Stewart (Sneaky Pete's)
Robert Kilpatrick (SMIA)	Emma Swift (Lewis MacDonald MSP)
Richard Knowles (EIS)	John Wallace (MEPG)
Gordon Lindhurst MSP	Lisa Whytock (Active/ Showcase Scotland)
Gordon MacDonald MSP	Andy Wightman MSP
Carol Main (Live Music Now Scotland)	Nick Zekulin (NYOS)
Jenna Main (ABRSM)	Plus others unidentified

Key: NYCOS = National Youth Choir of Scotland; HITS = Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland; SMIA = Scottish Music Industry Association; RCS = Royal Conservatoire of Scotland; EIS = Educational Institute of Scotland; ABRSM = Associated Boards of the Royal Schools of Music; MEPG = Music Education Partnership Group; NYOS = National Youth Orchestra of Scotland

1. Approval of Minutes of Last Meeting

Approved as an accurate record

2. Matters Arising

3. Appointment of Secretariat

The Traditional Music Forum and the SMIA had both expressed an interest in taking on the Secretariat of the CPG. After both parties had pitched it was agreed that the TMF would take on the role for one year, after which the position would be reviewed.

4. Decision on Agenda Forming Process

An agenda forming sub-committee was proposed, membership of which would represent a wide range of interests. Gordon Adam suggested that two topics from the floor should be sought at each meeting and considered by the sub-committee.

Richard Knowles, Carol Main, Lois Fitch, Robert Kilpatrick, Nick Stewart, Adam Behr, John Wallace, Kenny Christie, Jo Buckley, Lisa Whytock and Cindy Douglas would make up the membership of the sub-committee.

5. Mike Russell Update on Brexit

Mike Russell outlined the three Brexit issues that were important for the music industry.

- Free movement
Describing the current atmosphere around free movement as 'poisonous', MR felt that there was a very restrictive view in prospect after December 2020 (or possibly sooner). The question is a notable difficulty for the current negotiations, with no resolution in place. MR's experience of the UK Government's attitude to immigration is negative. The 'pull factor' for people wishing to come to the UK will be diminished. A White Paper is due, but MR had no intelligence on what it might say.
- Money
The EU provides significant resources for cultural support. MR has no answers for how that is likely to continue, other than the shared Prosperity Fund, but again there was no detail on what that might look like. There is a complex web of funding yet to be teased out.
- Who we think we are – Scotland and the World
Scotland sees itself as a European nation. MR compared the Scotland's situation with Ireland's, and the lack of control Scotland has over future direction. This is a defining moment. How we effectively represent ourselves to the outside world speaks to an important role for culture. Culture is not neutral.

In summary MR is pessimistic about what lies ahead: do we accept an imposed Brexit, or is there another view of where Scotland can go?

Ralph Riddiough cited the power of music as a force for **peace**.

Lisa Whytock: artists must be able to travel freely. **Showcase Scotland** has shown that international touring is vital to musicians' ability to make a living. She cited the success of the Scottish presence at the **Lorient Festival** in 2017 as evidence of cultural tourism opportunities, and echoed MR's point about the bridging role of culture. MR invited her to email him with her concerns.

Nick Stewart: **fees** for musicians in the UK are on the whole much poorer than in Europe.

Alan Morrison reiterated LW's point that our own borders are not enough for a sustainable career, and agreed about the intangible benefits of music. He felt that there was solidarity with Scotland across Europe, and a recognition of our outward-looking attitude. He proposed that there should be a **Culture or Music Export Office** to enable opportunities post-Brexit, backed up by an **Expo Fund**.

LW: endorsed that suggestion, citing a 349% **Return on Investment** as evidence of the benefits of support for international touring. Again, there is a need for a post-Brexit strategy to manage challenges.

Morag Campbell enquired about the prospects for UK involvement in the **Erasmus** programme. MR said that it may continue.

Cindy Douglas: the concern is also about people coming in to Scotland, who bring the benefits of the cross-fertilisation of ideas. Co-operative projects need to continue.

Carol Main expressed a concern for the **national companies**. 17% of orchestral players come from Europe. She also was concerned about international students coming here to study.

Lois Fitch: 25% of the student body at **RCS** are European. Classical music is so steeped in a European tradition that it seems perverse to discourage European students. MR said that the Scottish Government was committed to maintaining access for European students for as long as possible.

Dougal Perman asked MR for his thoughts on **intellectual property**. MR said that there were large issues with alignment of regulatory frameworks. Keeping alignment with European frameworks will be a difficulty, as will enforcement of regulations. Without mutually agreed enforcement it is hard to see how alignment can be sustained. The UK Government has completely failed to understand that the EU is a legally based system.

The Chair thanked Mike Russell and reminded the Group that they could email him with specific concerns.

ACTION: The Chair also proposed that the Group write formally to the Minister, identifying possible solutions as well as problems. **Gordon Lindhurst** seconded that view.

6. Update from John Wallace on MEPG

Citing the success of the **'Singing to Learn, Learning to Sing'** programme developed by MEPG and Education Scotland, **John Wallace** announced that it would be followed up by **'Playing to Learn, Learning to Play'** in 2019, possibly on a proposed **National Music Day**, at the Glasgow Royal Concert Hall. The hall will be filled by young people playing a new commission on every conceivable instrument. JW also noted the success of the recently instigated **Music Leader** qualification for young musicians.

The **What's Going On Now** research is currently mapping music education across Scotland, and its report will be launched at the Scottish Parliament in January, 2019. There will be a second survey in the early autumn which will aim to capture trends in participation levels following revised charging regimes and changes in local authority policies.

Change the Tune: JW expressed a widespread belief in the sector that the writing is on the wall for **Instrumental Music Services** unless we take action. MEPG has proposed an agreement between Scottish Government and the local authorities that will protect, maintain and sustain music services. The **Education and Skills Committee** has looked at this topic, which has been the focus of a noisy media campaign. The strategy is to publicise the What's Going On Now results and recommendations in 2019 with a view to influencing parties to include statutory action in their **manifestos** in 2020 and in their 2021 election campaigns.

Richard Knowles: there are now 458 fewer staff in instrumental music services than ten years ago, and 45,000 fewer students. This has an impact on the RCS and music organisations of every kind. The risk is the dilution of a qualified workforce, with the cheapest options (invariably not salaried staff) being brought in.

Kenny Christie: the system is there – don't dismantle it. Quality of service delivery is central: it aligns with Scottish Government priorities, and is essential for the success of the proposed

Regional Improvement Collaboratives. The campaign for Instrumental Music Services offers the opportunity to put music at the forefront of Scottish education, bringing together many disparate elements to take music forward.

RK: 50 years of work has brought us to the present situation. He referred to the paradox of music being treated as discretionary when playing an instrument is 60% of **SQA** exams *within the curriculum*.

KC advised that 'free' does not always mean 'accessible'. The campaign needs to take account of the health and well-being of music educators. Contracts being offered on a six-month to six-month basis offers nothing but uncertainty for individuals and no stability for the sector.

Ralph Riddiough: instrumental music should not be treated as discretionary, but as central to music education. He questioned a recent **SPICE** (Scottish Parliamentary Information Centre) briefing that maintained numbers have held up. Those figures mask a major injustice. Less well-off children will be penalised by a fee system. It is wrong for some children to be priced out. The campaign should not just be about maintaining music services.

JW: if the growth of Scotland's economy is to be dependent on the creativity of young people, music is the best way of fostering that.

Carol Main cited the importance of young people playing together, as well as access to good instruments, transport, good tuition and rehearsal spaces.

Gayle Martin-Brown: if charging is removed, then staff will be lost, as there is no other source of funding. At present there is no charge for students receiving free school meals, or taking SQA music exams.

Yvonne McLellan pointed out the weakness of a system where children experience music free through the **Youth Music Initiative**, after which access is limited or has to be paid for.

KC: YMI is a tool, used in 32 different ways by each local authority.

Luke McCullough: the free school meals criterion locks out a large number of people suffering from **mortgage poverty**, for example. How would the proposed agreement between SG and COSLA affect those authorities which do not currently charge?

RK: Clackmannan currently charges £524 with no discount for siblings. Even with the free school meals discount the charge is £117. Many students do not claim free school meals at secondary school, as there can be a stigma.

The Chair asked what the CPG could do. For example, could it address the persistent view in local authorities that music is a soft subject. Could the CPG make a statement on the value of music?

RR: Scottish Government has already made a statement.

G M-B: As long as music is non-statutory it will always be targeted when budgets are being cut.

Dougal Perman: will the forthcoming research try to evaluate the impact of the cuts in social and economic terms?

JW: the CPG should be making arguments about economic and cultural exports. New arguments are required.

DP: there is a twin threat of cuts to instrumental music tuition and free movement. The resources are there to make good arguments.

Lisa Whytock: the CPG can advocate to Scottish Government about how the music sector and the music industry can be supported to thrive.

Nick Stewart: we need to think big, and not be afraid to advocate for more money.

Cindy Douglas: the CPG's contribution should be to take a different perspective – take an industry view: what is it that the music business requires? As far as instrumental music teaching is concerned there should be consistency across local authorities.

KC: equity is the long-term aim. If music education is to be free, are we ready for that within the current frameworks?

Davy Scott: the 'softness' of music is cultural. Parents will still value other subjects as having better employment prospects. We need some impact case studies.

Alan Morrison: echoed the previous remarks with a point about the difficulty of getting music coverage in newspapers, which often take the view that music is only about entertainment.

Adam Behr: there is plenty of research on the economic and cultural value of music. It only needs to be collated.

The Chair drew attention to the interdependence of the many aspects of music from initial teaching to the music industry. It is a feature of the sector that is not appreciated more widely.

ACTION POINT: *A Parliamentary event in the autumn, preceded by a grand narrative on the value of music and its interconnected aspects, which will publicised, disseminated and debated in Parliament.*

Other questions for the CPG and its role?

RK: would like to see support from the CPG for **statutory status** for music education

LW: what can Scottish Government do to support the music industry when **Brexit** comes?

7. AOCB

Music Tourism in Glasgow

Dougal Perman: there was to be a debate the following day on **music tourism** in Glasgow.

Glasgow School of Art

Chair: expressed the CPG's sadness about the effects of the **Glasgow School of Art** fire.

Although attention will be on the GSA, we should also acknowledge the effects of the loss of the **ABC** as a music venue.

Group Membership

Kenny Christie: It would be useful if MSPs were able to stay and catch all the nuances of the arguments.

Agent of Change

Nick Stewart: there is some prospect for the **Agent of Change** principle to be adopted in the **Planning Bill**. Could the Minister, **Kevin Stewart**, be invited to the next CPG? The Scottish Government has declared its commitment to the principle.

Scottish Planning Policy

NS: A Scottish Planning Policy document has proposed that green space should be audited in support of the idea that, should space be lost to developers, there should be provision for its replacement, if possible to the same dimensions. Should a similar policy apply to **cultural spaces**? If it did, then an **audit of music provision** might be the starting point.

8. Date of Next Meeting

23rd October, 2018.