

CROSS PARTY GROUP ON MUSIC

Committee Room 4, Scottish Parliament

3 December 2019

Tom Arthur, MSP (Chair)	Hilary Brooks (SWIM)
David Francis (TMF)	Alan Morrison (Creative Scotland)
Dougal Perman (SMIA)	Mark Pemberton (ABO)
Nick Stewart (Sneaky Pete's)	Matthew Whiteside (The Night With)
Mae Murray (MEPG)	Ed Milner (NYCOS)
John Wallace (MEPG)	Jenny Jamison (Scottish Ensemble)
Kenneth Taylor (St Mary's Music School)	Carol Main (LMN Scotland)
Kirk Richardson (EIS)	Gordon Munro (RCS)
Morag Macdonald (Creative Scotland)	Andy Wightman, MSP
Shonagh Stevenson (HITS)	Rick Bamford (Drake Music)
Jamie Munn (Nevis Ensemble)	Alison Reeves (Making Music)
Stuart Fleming (PRS for Music)	

Abbreviations: TMF = Traditional Music Forum, SMIA = Scottish Music Industries Association, MEPG = Music Education Partnership Group, EIS = Educational Institute of Scotland, HITS = Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland, ABO = Association of British Orchestras, LMN = Live Music Now, RCS = Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, SWIM = Scottish Women Inventing Music,

1. Apologies

Adam Behr, Gordon Lindhurst, MSP, Rab Noakes, Lois Fitch, Paul MacAlinden, Caroline Sewell, Gordon Lindhurst, MSP, Allan Dumbreck, Rab Noakes, Nick Zekulin, John Harris, Sharon Mair, Andrew Cruickshank, Jenna Main

2. Minutes of Previous Meeting

The previous meeting was not quorate (a quorum requires a minimum of two MSPs). Acceptance of minutes proposed Kenneth Taylor, seconded John Wallace

3. Music by Numbers

Tom Arthur introduced *Music by Numbers*, the report by UK Music which showed that music tourism brought £431m to the Scottish economy last year, with numbers rising from 800,000 to 1.1 million, sustaining 4,300 jobs. TA asked for comments on the report from the group.

Olaf Furniss: The increase in revenue is not reflected by the interest shown by VisitScotland. Neither VisitScotland nor Event Scotland were present at a recent conference on music

tourism in Liverpool, for example. Golf tourism brings in less but has its own category in VisitScotland marketing.

TA: Are there any examples of good practice?

OF: Iceland, Hamburg, Georgia

TA: We should ask someone from VisitScotland to come to a future meeting of the group.

Alan Morrison: VisitScotland is active in the Scotland Australia 2020 initiative. They paid for an Australian PR company to get coverage for the music in order to drive tourism to Scotland.

OF: It is true that VisitScotland is more open to traditional music, but the growth referred to in the report is being driven by festivals. Music should be in there with walking, golf, and whisky. The country's main Destination Management Organisation should be more proactive.

Matthew Whiteside: Surprised that there is no Music Export Office for Scotland. Finland has one.

Dougal Perman: This is something that is being worked towards. A proposal on its feasibility is currently under discussion.

MW: Would be interesting to know who is being represented in those discussions. Classical and contemporary classical music should be included.

DP: would be happy to circulate the top line methodology to the Group.

MW: What would be the definition of commercial?

DP: Anything that makes money is commercial.

Mark Pemberton: Orchestras don't get funding towards exporting their work. It's worth pointing out that the data in the report only comes from UK Music members. Classical music, and small labels, for example, are not featured.

OF: Agree that this is a flaw. The 2016 report for example only included gigs with audiences over 1500, to a value of £100m. Dougal Perman found another £50m in value by looking beyond that category.

DP: The methodology is robust, but it only tells part of the story. SMIA with the University of Glasgow are embarking on a 3-year funded PhD on mapping the music industry in Scotland. They will be looking for contributions, case studies and so on. I am looking forward to a piece of work that goes beyond the UK Music work, good as it is.

Carol Main: It will be important to ensure that the national companies are included in that project.

TA: Should music export be a cross-departmental approach. It doesn't only have a cultural value. It should be seen as a commercial commodity.

AM: Any sense of music export has fallen to Creative Scotland, which has been aiming to work towards a strategy. A lot of the targeted funds go towards this. The entire budget for music export is £250k. Norway's is £2m.

OF: Scottish Enterprise doesn't want to get involved with music.

DP: That is changing. The new leadership at Scottish Enterprise makes me optimistic.

TA: Further discussion would be welcome.

Andy Wightman: It would be worth sending a formal letter to Scottish Enterprise seeking information on their approach, with a copy sent to the Economy Committee.

TA: Staying with the recommendations in the report, that takes us to touring post-Brexit.

DP: Several SMIA members have reported that they can still negotiate to do deals, but can't sign the contracts until there is more clarity. It's definitely having a negative impact.

MP: In the orchestral sector contracts are being signed, but any Brexit-related costs are being put back on to the orchestras. What are the risks? Immigration controls, for one. Each

of the EU 27 determines what its own immigration rules are. The cost of work permits will be put on to the orchestras. There will be vast amount of carnets, CITES controls. The cost of a tour will be much more difficult.

TA: It would be useful if the Group was able to reflect on what it would like to do. A letter to the Government to request that these concerns are addressed should be drafted.

MP: There is one element of CITES controls which discriminates against Scotland. There are no designated ports for endorsing CITES certificates in Scotland. They are all in South East England. Airports are set up, but not every port. Globally, CITES tends to be fairly loosely enforced, but the UK has decided it will enforce CITES strictly.

OF: Wide Days has been accepted as part of a European Showcase network. We should be lobbying to remain as part of Creative Europe.

Jenny Jamison: One third of Creative Europe projects have a UK partner. The last round was the most successful for Scotland.

MW: As a classical composer I have a lot of export capacity. It's not the ensembles that are moving, it's the music itself.

TA: I would invite everyone to feed in ideas, and we could get something signed off at the next meeting. Next recommendation – business rates.

Nick Stewart: I haven't had a chance to look at the bill dealing with non-domestic rates. Any update:

AW: It will be finishing Stage 2 tomorrow. Reliefs can be dealt with through secondary legislation. The power of Ministers to create reliefs is still allowed for.

TA: Next thing is shared parental leave. The Scottish Parliament's powers are limited in their ability to address this. We are piloting Universal Basic Income and looking at learning from that.

Hilary Brooks: Without proper encouragement to men to take up parental leave we'll get nowhere. It affects freelance women in particular.

OF: We want to introduce the option of childcare at Wide Days next year and would welcome advice on providers.

TA: The SNP manifesto seeks to increase parental leave to 64 weeks, with 12 weeks ring-fenced.

HB: It's social attitudes that need to change, to encourage men to take up the opportunity.

Stuart Fleming: We're seeing a tail-off of women in late 20s, early 30s in the music business. Once women come back to work in the business it can take 3-4 years to get back to where you were.

TA: There are systemic barriers in place. Childcare and care in general fall upon women. How does that work if you have to be on the road?

Kirk Richardson: Do orchestras have childcare facilities?

MP: I don't know.

TA: Carers Scotland looks to encourage employers to have an understanding of carers' circumstances, to become carer-positive employers. Is anyone in the music industry aware of this scheme?

Rick Bamford: What about the SCO's new venue? Does it have childcare facilities? If you make it part of the infrastructure it's more likely to be used.

MW: Before we leave the discussion on this report can I point out that there are incentives of 25% if you record in Iceland. Something to think about for Scotland.

TA: Iceland, like New Zealand, is promoting the idea of the well-being economy, as is Scotland. The First Minister met the Prime Minister of Iceland recently. There might be opportunities there.

4. Music Education Update

JW: Instrumental Music budgets are currently under scrutiny, and we're seeing variations, from Fife, which is touching its budget, to Dumfries and Galloway, which is considering cutting entirely, except for students taking SQA exams.

Mae Murray's secondment to Education Scotland is coming to an end, so we will have to find new ways to fund MEPG.

Shonagh Stevenson: The Instrumental Music workforce remains demoralised. It's a continuous job to support it.

TA: The Scottish budget has still to be set, but we don't know what the situation will be till after the election. The Scottish Government might have to make a budget blind if there is another hung Parliament, or another General Election early in 2020.

KR: We need to sell the possibilities of a career in music to parents, especially given the figures from the UK Music report.

DP: It is important to make it clear that there are careers to be had in the creative industries. Heard a story recently about a careers talk on music at a primary school. It was the first time that someone had spoken about music as a possible career. Skills Development Scotland did a roadshow recently on digital work. I'm concerned about the promotion of STEM, which has been to the detriment of the promotion of creative subjects. The Creative Industries Advisory Group has communicated its concerns to the Scottish Funding Council, which has started to listen.

OF: I have tried to get across that there are careers in the music business in fields like law and accountancy.

JW: Changing perceptions is in the top line of MEPG strategies.

SF: I'm asked to speak to heads of music and heads of careers in Northern Ireland. Their local councils obliged them to be there and listen. I was able to offer a day and a half of input into opportunities in the music industry.

HB: SWIM has been working along these lines.

DP: The SDS is the model for how it could be done, with their road shows on digital careers and gender balance in digital industries. There are the beginnings of a coherent strategy from education through to employment.

KR: If we had a National Scotland's Music Day a careers fair could be part of that.

SF: Dundee has done something along these lines, a week of music.

TA: Going back to well-being as the measure of a successful economy. If someone is doing something they love that should be seen as a success. Parental attitudes can be a barrier to young people realising their ambitions. This is a minority view in the Chamber, but this group is evidence of how people can make good careers in music.

RB: Neuroscience backs up the value of music to individual well-being.

TA: Support for music is part of the State's commitment to its citizens to create a society enriched by culture.

5. Party Manifestos 2021

JW: There is support across parties for music education. Would it be feasible to get parties to commit to abolishing tuition fees across the lifetime of the next Parliament?

TA: You have to take into account the balance between local government and central government powers.

AW: Education is one of the areas of tension in making manifesto promises. Education is a statutory requirement but how it is delivered is a matter for local government. If central government want to make something universal it has to make a law or pay for it.

TA: Rather than ring-fencing a nationally mandated agreement we have to persuade local authorities of the benefits of adopting a particular line of action. The 2022 elections are also important.

If there was to be universal provision is there a consensus on how that should be done?

Local government autonomy is held dear.

JW: Graduated proposals have already been worked on. We have guidelines between central government and COSLA. I haven't met one Director of Education or Council Leader that doesn't value music education.

TA: All parties should set out what their position is. Now is the time to approach parties about this. Many have started to select candidates.

6. Scottish Music Industry Fair

JW: Does anyone know if there is anything like this already happening?

DP: Expo North is probably the closest thing. It doesn't have a lot to do with education but would be open to it. It's probably a good idea to start with an existing event. I mentioned the SDS model earlier – something like that, or tag on to Expo North (which is for the wider creative industries). The downside of that is preaching to the converted.

HB: Combine a National Music Day with a Music Industry Fair.

MW: There is scope for more collaboration. Resonate, for example, had little classical music input, apart from myself.

DP: We need to know more about what each other does. There is a role for the CPG here, although there's always the question of who pulls that together.

7. Other Business

a) MW: I've asked the MU to look at lobbying for Spotify to move to a user-centric system.

NS: Any research on who might benefit from a user-centric system?

MW: The higher echelons might lose out a bit, but middle earners might do better.

b) NS: For information: Arts Council England has a £1.5m fund for Grassroots Music Venue infrastructure. Creative Scotland are currently unable to make a ringfenced fund for GMVs. So far £650k has been approved, with another £600k in the pipeline. 69% of successful applicants were limited companies, which has not been a hindrance to applications. Creative Wales will make Grassroots Music Venues a priority, adopting something similar to the ACE scheme, which means that Scotland may well be alone soon in not having a ringfenced fund for GMVs.

8. Next Meeting

Tuesday, 3 March, 2020.

