

MINUTE OF THE CROSS- PARTY GROUP ON MUSIC

Online

9 June, 2020

Tom Arthur, MSP
Claire Baker, MSP
Rab Noakes (MU)
Matthew Whiteside (The Night With)
Olaf Furniss (Born to be Wide)
Lisa Whytock (Active)
Shonagh Stevenson (HITS)
Celia Duffy (Red Note)
Lois Fitch (RCS)
Caroline Sewell (MU)
Kenneth Taylor (St Mary's)
Alison Reeves (Making Music)
David Cameron (Bob Doris MSP)
Judy Okely (Edinburgh University)
Andrew Cruickshank (MU)
Nick Zekulin (NYOS)
Katja Armknecht (Red Note)
David Lee (Dunedin Consort)
Michael Lambert (A Modern Way)
Paul MacAlindin (Glasgow Barons)
David Francis (TMF)

Andy Wightman, MSP
Beatrice Wishart, MSP
Kirk Richardson (EIS)
Gill Maxwell (Scottish Music Centre)
Francis Cummings (RCS)
Robert Kilpatrick (SMIA)
Pete Sparkes (Drake Music Scotland)

John Wallace (MEPG)
Dougal Perman (SMIA)
Jo Buckley (Dunedin Consort)
Louise Pow (MU)
Jenny Reeve (Beatroute Arts)
Allan Dumbreck (UWS)
Nick Stewart (Sneaky Pete's)
Adam Behr (Newcastle Univ.)

Ray Black (Craft Management)
Alan Morrison (Creative Scotland)

HITS = Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland; RCS = Royal Conservatoire of Scotland; MU = Musicians' Union; NYOS = National Youth Orchestras of Scotland; TMF = Traditional Music Forum; EIS = Educational Institute of Scotland; SMIA = Scottish Music Industry Association; MEPG = Music Education Partnership Group; UWS = University of the West of Scotland; NYCOS = National Youth Choirs of Scotland; ABRSM = Associated Board of Royal Schools of Music;

Apologies:

Rick Bamford (Drake Music Scotland), Tam Coyle (SMIA), Ed Milner (NYCOS), Luke McCullough (BBC); Carol Main (Live Music Now), Graeme Smillie; Mae Murray (MEPG); Amy Geddes; Jenna Main (ABRSM); Matt Brennan (Glasgow University)

1. Minutes of Previous Meeting

Proposed by Alison Reeves, Seconded by John Wallace

2. Matters Arising

None

3. Glasgow Barons/ Food of Love

Paul MacAlindin gave a short presentation on the Glasgow Barons' Food of Love project in Govan, supporting local agencies (food banks etc) response to the Covid emergency with (socially distanced) live music.

4. Covid Matters

Caroline Sewell: MU has been aiming to quantify losses to musicians. At the end of April losses had been calculated at c. £20m.

Lisa Whytock: The situation is incredibly serious, yet people are not looking at the whole picture. Shows I had scheduled for this November have now been cancelled and are being re-scheduled for November next year, which means those artists have no work from November 2020 till November

2021. The real concern is that there are no new gigs in 2021. Venues and festivals are simply replicating their programme for this year. If you were busy with live gigs this year, you'll have shows next year. However, if you were taking time out to record an album, have a baby – whatever reason – there is no work available for you in 2021. We need to look at how we create new opportunities and new work for musicians when lockdown is eventually lifted.

On the international side, we have delivered an online version of The Visit, one of our Showcase export initiatives. Very positive: post-event survey revealed that 63% of attending promoters likely to book Scottish artists post-lockdown. 100% of the participating acts wanted digital showcasing to continue. 80% said it contributed to their sense of well-being and mental health during lockdown. We are setting up a project with 13 other international showcasing organisations called Global Music Match, which will share the social media fan-bases of 10 international acts. This is something that could be rolled out in other genres.

Rab Noakes: Has been through FEU and MU making the point to Ministers and civil servants that so many people do not qualify for government assistance. The main issue is getting support for them. Practical measures to help could include skills development – performing online (current practice is very variable in quality), which will help people to get some income, but in the meantime they need support now. Asked that the Chair might monitor those conversations happening with Government.

Matthew Whiteside: What has had little attention is the knock-on effect of the current situation on composers. Composers are currently working on commissions that they may have got, say, six months ago or just before the shut down. One of my concerns is whether people will still be commissioning in six months time. If concert programmes are pushed back a year, as Lisa was describing, will that have a knock-on for composers? There's also the question of the lack of PRS payments as composers' work isn't performed. My other issue is the unfairness of streaming payments. It's not something the Scottish Parliament can intervene on, but it's something that affects everyone in the music business. I would still advocate a user-centric approach where a listener's subscription is paid only to the artists they listen to. Royalties should also be paid to PPL as well as PRS and the labels. Would urge everyone to sign the MU's 'Fix Streaming' petition.

Claire Baker, MSP: Scotland hasn't gone for a sector-specific approach to support, unlike in Wales and London. Trying to find out if enough money is reaching the sector in Scotland through the general funds. Another issue is around the Route Map. It will be Phase 3 before even limited live performances will be allowed. MSPs are pushing for a more sector-specific route map with more detail. Over the next period we need to gather as much information as possible to allow us to think through solutions, and what support packages might look like. The music sector is likely to need support packages longer than other sectors. Finally, there is concern about how online performance can be monetised, given the amount of material that is being made available for free.

Tom Arthur: Packages of support are going to have to be 'second-wave resistant'. There will be very few people and businesses that will be able to survive two lockdowns.

Andy Wightman, MSP: The Economy Committee is conducting a rolling enquiry into the effects of Covid, so stats, perspectives, evidence should be sent to them. You can submit as many times as you like, and there is no deadline. The Committee has not had anything from the culture sector as a whole.

Olaf Furniss: Things that need to be addressed quickly are skills in performing without an audience, how to make online presentations look more professional, virtual touring. I would like to take issue with the music that is currently being played on Radio Scotland. I appreciate broadcasting is reserved, but would like to investigate whether there is a way in which Scottish acts can be prioritised, which would at least generate some kind of income through royalties. Also if the Scottish Government is commissioning music for public service advertising, for example, it would help to use Scottish musicians.

TA: the idea of using public procurement to support musicians is a strong one. I would like to pull together a lot of the material from this meeting into a letter to the Cabinet Secretary.

Dougal Perman: The Visit was a very successful project, positive example of how a commercially led project can stimulate new business. Re music workforce falling through the gaps for support, SMIA has done some research and collected anecdotal evidence, and is about to do more. We'd appeal to people on the CPG and their networks to pass on information about individuals and businesses who are still lacking support. I have a lot of experience through Inner Ear on monetising online, live streaming events and creating high value production, and have been involved in discussions about new platforms and models for doing this effectively. Propose a round table discussion about this in future. Finally, the SMIA is about to embark on a strategy for diversifying the music industry's revenue models in Scotland. At the moment there's live performance, recording, licensing, and monetisation of an artist's brand. The industry has been so dependent on live revenue for the past twenty years that its disappearance is catastrophic. We've been considering how to make the industry more robust by shoring up the weaker parts of the ecosystem, but that's now crucial. We'll be looking to consult with people on that, and are happy to listen to any ideas.

Ray Black: Our clients have seen between 75 and 95% of their expected revenue disappear. Would like to pay credit to the government for some of their schemes which have been crucial in providing support. Music managers and musicians are looking at how we can get back to work, and some kind of recovery fund for the music business for musicians and their creative supply teams to enable them to get back to work.

Alan Morrison: Creative Scotland has been actively working with a lot of the people and projects already covered. One of the first things we did on lockdown was contact clients to see how funding could be re-purposed where necessary. We encouraged people to pay freelancers who had already been contracted, for example. One of the things we're seeing is that people are using the money saved by cancelling an event to commission musicians to create work that can then be programmed next year. The jazz festivals have been thinking along these lines. We've paid out just over 2,000 bursaries across all arts, including 550 music-related bursaries in a three week period.

The Open Fund is now more reoriented to research and development in the short term. We've been collecting data on furloughing, lost income, having weekly meetings with industry bodies, and CS chair and CEO have been meeting regularly with the Cabinet Secretary. At the moment no money has been put aside for culture in totality, never mind music. The case that we are making, having taken all this information from the last ten weeks into account, is for a package that's not just about short-term emergency funding but a commitment over at least two years that gives us a transition period into re-growth. The more information we have the better we can make the case to Government. It's the only way we can get out of this. We're looking at having only £7.5m in the Open Fund for all applications in every sector. That's Lottery money which has dropped at least 30% in the last few months. So we've got less money at a time when people are looking for more, when match funding is hard to come by. Our only way is to get a specific culture award from the Government.

TA: It's going to be important that we coordinate our actions with the Cross-Party Group on Culture and others. That will be an action point from this meeting.

Allan Dumbreck: We only have anecdotal evidence at the moment, but we have heard that almost all of our graduates who got jobs in the last 12 months have been furloughed or laid off, with no guarantees of being taken back. Within HE we're fortunate that we can operate online and will do so in the autumn. We're looking to extend the number of places, but are unclear about how people will take up opportunities. We're pushing accreditation of prior learning to encourage people to come into education.

David Francis: The Government's Economic Advisory Group is drawn from a very narrow representation of Scottish public and business life, with no representation from the creative industries, despite their value to the Scottish economy. Culture Counts has put in proposals to the Cabinet Secretary for a Creative and Culture Infrastructure Fund, emphasising venues, redeployment of creative practitioners into other areas of community life. There is no figure on that but worth noting that the Scottish Community Alliance has proposed a New Deal of £200 million for community

resilience. The response has to come from the public sector, but there is a problem that the Scottish Government has no money of its own and will have to advocate to the government in Westminster.

TA: Agree that the 'New Deal' approach is the right one, not just because it's the right thing, but because an economic crisis can easily tip into a social and political crisis, which is a very real threat given the tensions in Western society at the moment. The Scottish fiscal framework was already under strain, and it is under review next year. But for any meaningful stimulus to be injected into the economy and for Barnett consequential there needs to be more clarity over the UK government's intentions in the medium term.

Michael Lambert: Ray Black and I have been taking part in regular meetings with other music managers. Supporting artists keeps the other parts of the supply chain alive, and there is a worry that the entire ecosystem could collapse. A lot of people are not accessing the available support for various reasons, which is problematic in a sector which has 72% self-employment.

CS: We are heading for a cliff edge here. 20% of the people who responded to a recent MU poll felt that they would not be able to continue as professional musicians. 38% said they didn't qualify for either the Job Retention Scheme or SEISS, the self-employed support scheme. We're going to be one of the last industries to get back up and running, so the need for sector-specific support has never been more crucial.

Alison Reeves: Making Music has been moving a lot of amateur music-makers online, but digital literacy and digital inclusion is a real challenge. Choirs and orchestras are going to have to wait a long time to get back to normal.

LW: Has concerns about the lack of planning for the range of venues and festivals re-starting. Is there anyone in Scotland specifically looking at how events can restart in 2021? We need to be realistic about re-opening. It's likely that artists will have to do two shows a day, matinee and evening, and that still won't be enough in terms of revenue. It will need to be complemented by paid-for streaming if it can work financially, and the capacity for that needs to be supported. Investment in that would be worth it because streaming isn't going to go away. We're hoping to pilot virtual touring, working in partnership with venues that have mailing lists, who will have exclusive access to a virtual show via a code for one designated date only. Venues will retain 30% of revenue, with artists getting the rest. It'll be October 2021 before things get back to normal.

CS: The MU has been developing guidance, and would like to see the emergence of pop-up gigs and gigs in open spaces like car parks, pressing local authorities to provide the relevant permissions and licences.

DP: DF Concerts are working with Festivals Republic on feasibility of large festivals. It will be very difficult to have live events without distancing, but that has all kinds of policy implications. I have a blueprint for how large-scale streaming can work, in partnership with other organisations around Europe that's almost ready to go. Hybrid events are going to be the future, but the question is how to monetise that, especially for venues and promoters. Traditionally venues would have earned from the bar, but that obviously doesn't work for virtual. Agree that it will at least be a year before normality returns.

David Lee: In the classical sector there have been discussions about monetising which haven't really got anywhere. At Dunedin Consort we've been having direct communication with our audiences and supporters by phone, and few of them, who tend to be older, have engaged with our online content. A lot of them have said that they would be willing to come back to venues in the autumn, provided safeguards were in place. We do have summer concerts that haven't yet been cancelled, in France, and colleagues in Germany and Denmark have started putting on concerts. Maybe we're in danger of being too pessimistic.

TA: Historically plagues have two ends, a medical one and a social one, the latter when people decide they've had enough of restrictions and reassess their attitude to risk. Ultimately governments can

only operate with the consent of the population. If it looks towards the end of the summer that a vaccine is imminent then people's attitudes might start to change. Having said that, my attitude is that public health and well-being has to come first, but it's not certain how the public at large will feel as time goes on. It's the uncertainty that is the worst part of it.

5. Music Education (Standing Item)

Shonagh Stevenson: At the moment HITS is recommending continuing online learning from August. There has been a large shift in attitudes, and people have been looking for solutions. Nothing takes away from a one to one lesson, but we're encouraging people to embrace a new style of learning. RCS and Sistema have been quick off the mark. Local authorities are a bit more restricted (none of them allow Zoom, for example, and don't allow the video to be used on MS Teams), but in South Ayrshire we're enjoying something like 70% engagement with very positive reactions from the young people.

John Wallace: It's a multi-speed situation. Some areas like Western Isles and Highlands have been ahead of the game, and the likes of RCS, Sistema and Tinderbox have ironed out a lot of the problems on everyone else's behalf. MEPG has been busy with webinars, research and focus groups. We're looking at the possibilities of blended learning. The online experience is not going away, but will never really replace the live situation.

OF: Born to be Wide did a panel with Fèis Rois and Fèisean nan Gàidheal, and the work of these organisations in education is worth emphasising. They're like a Gaelic version of Sistema, and I'd like to have minuted the great work that they do.

FE and HE have a role to play in sustaining music industry talent. They should be bringing in all kinds of industry professionals to do guest lectures (and pay them).

I'd like to commend Creative Scotland for their support in helping us to adjust our programme. Their reaction has been very quick, and is really appreciated.

Beatrice Wishart, MSP: This has been a very useful and informative meeting. I'm on the Education and Skills Committee as well as the Culture Committee, and it's been good to hear about developments in music education.

TA: Looking forward to having you as a regular contributor to the group.

AD: We do have a network of guest lecturers that we bring in regularly, with a priority given to graduates of the university. Re: Zoom and security, we are in a similar boat, and are trialling MS Teams, which doesn't seem to be so user-friendly. We are pushing back modules which work best face-to-face to the second term to have a better chance of organising those. I can relate to the challenges for schools. I have class groups of 40 to 60 which will have to take place in lecture theatres with 200 seats to have any hope of distancing.

Francis Cummings: Not to have access to video is highly problematic. At the RCS we already had rigorous risk assessment in place for one-to-one lessons in particular and we have carried that approach to risk into our online work. It's really important that we don't lose ground at this stage, and that young people's pathways into HE are not restricted, so I hope that local authorities can find a reasonable and safe solution.

Kirk Richardson: Local authorities need to invest in the right equipment if (as I believe) online is here to stay. However, a lot of young people are experiencing barriers to accessing online lessons. Many don't have computers, only a phone, which maybe doesn't have enough memory or data to download a pdf or a backing track.

ML: Off the Record was intended to be an event, funded by YMI, which gives young people practical information about the music industry, and we're planning to put that online. We'd like to hear from people across the education sector.

TA: This may have been our first online meeting but probably one of our best. I am proposing to draft some correspondence to the Government, on the substantive items we've discussed this evening, the general Covid-related matters on live performance and touring, and music education. Is the group content with that?

6. Other Business

OF: A lot of the issues for music and events also apply to tourism. Would someone with an interest in tourism be able to come and speak to the next meeting?

TA: Fergus Ewing is the current tourism minister, and it would be worth cc-ing him into any correspondence.

AM: Would like to minute something positive. The Edinburgh band Vistas' album is number one on the independent album charts, and the classical guitarist, Sean Shibe, was number one in the classical music charts. So while the outlook in general is bleak, Scottish musicians are doing well.

Robert Kilpatrick: The Scottish Album of the Year will be going ahead this year. £29,000 worth of prize money is available. It'll be a positive way to celebrate Scottish music this year.

KR: Could a letter go to Education Scotland about the video issue?

TA: No objection.

AR: Reminded the group about Make Music Day on June 21st, which will be entirely digital, with Scottish content from 2.30 to 3.30. Thanks to Creative Scotland

TA: Would like to commend MEPG for the Over the Rainbow project.

JW: Make Music day will also feature an ambitious project, a Symphony for a Thousand.

TA: Thanks to everyone for their attendance and contributions this evening.

7. Date of Next Meeting

September 8, 2020

ADDENDA: Links from Meeting Chat facility

Olaf Furniss: This discussion on streaming is the best one I have heard and covers pretty much every angle. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1y0-p4ynKdc>

Matthew Whiteside: This is the [Fix Streaming] petition link as well
<https://www.change.org/p/the-rt-hon-oliver-dowden-cbe-mp-secretary-of-state-for-digital-culture-media-and-sport-it-s-time-to-fixstreaming>

Andy Wightman: You should find all details of Economy Committee Covid-19 inquiry here
<https://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/CurrentCommittees/114924.aspx>

Claire Baker: Similarly the Culture committee has a rolling inquiry into Covid - we have had some submissions from music sector but would be good to have more
<https://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/CurrentCommittees/115008.aspx>

David Francis: Virtual touring: Do the artists record one performance for distribution or do a separate performance for each venue?

Lisa Whytock: Record one but do a live q &A for each individual audience afterwards. The codes are specific to the box office of that venue, so can't be shared and specific to that particular email address.

LW: Importantly it needs to be new performances

DF: yes, specifically for that tour.

LW: Yes

Raymond Black: Interesting, different but parallels definitely with what Laura Marling has been doing recently <https://www.musicweek.com/live/read/laura-marling-s-management-on-why-livestream-gigs-are-here-to-stay/080016>

LW: Yes!

Gill Maxwell: At Scottish Music Centre we are now using G Suite Education to deliver our out of school MusicPlus and MusicCARE mentoring and tuition programmes for young people. Chosen for security of data, child protection issues.

Shonagh Stevenson, HITS: Yes Gill, a few authorities are using Google classrooms and G Suite with great results

GM: it is also free of charge for non-profit organisations!

Adam Behr: Here's the report Olaf is referring to:

<http://livemusicexchange.org/wp-content/uploads/Facilitating-Music-Tourism-for-Scotland%E2%80%99s-Creative-Economy-Behr-Ord.pdf>

Olaf Furniss: Vistas showcased at Wide Days! Here they are in action.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OU8A_cKAjU