



The Scottish Parliament Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Parliamentary Year 5, No. 74 Session 4

Meeting of the Parliament

Wednesday 27 January 2016

Note: (DT) signifies a decision taken at Decision Time.

The meeting opened at 2.00 pm.

1. Portfolio Questions: Questions on Education and Lifelong Learning were answered by the Cabinet Secretary and a Minister.

2. Education: Liam McArthur moved S4M-15430—That the Parliament believes that the introduction of a pupil premium in Scotland would help enable every child to fulfil their potential, close the attainment gap and ensure a world-class education system; believes that it would give schools thousands of pounds of extra funding that they could spend to raise standards and increase attainment in every classroom; notes that it could provide practical support such as one-to-one tuition, extra staff and equipment, breakfast clubs and outreach programmes to help engage parents; recalls that Liberal Democrats in the previous UK administration successfully made the case for, and introduced, the pupil premium in England in 2011, now worth £2.5 billion a year, and that the party also subsequently secured its introduction in Wales; notes that Ofsted has said that the pupil premium “is making a difference” and that the National Audit Office observed that the gap between disadvantaged and other pupils narrowed by 4.7% in primary schools and 1.6% in secondary schools between 2011 and 2014, following its introduction; notes that, in comparison, the Attainment Scotland Fund only makes a difference in those areas and schools selected by Scottish ministers, currently ignoring the additional needs of disadvantaged children in 11 out of 32 local authorities; believes that tying funding to those children who need extra help the most, wherever they may live, through the pupil premium, would be fairer and more effective, and calls for it to be urgently introduced to help propel Scottish schools back to the top of the class.

The Minister for Learning, Science and Scotland's Languages (Dr Alasdair Allan) moved amendment S4M-15430.3 to motion S4M-15430—

Leave out from “the introduction of” to end and insert—

“the £100 million Attainment Scotland Fund, which is additional to the almost £5 billion invested in education every year through local authorities, is rightly targeted at the primary schools that serve the most deprived communities in Scotland, with over 300 primary schools, which together support 54,399 pupils from deprived backgrounds, 64% of the total number of such pupils, benefitting from the funding; notes that this funding is providing a wide range of support to close the attainment gap including additional teaching and other specialist staff, support for parents to engage in their children's learning, literacy and numeracy tools and extra training for teachers; further believes that the package of universal support that has been drawn together through the Scottish Attainment Challenge, including the appointment of attainment advisors for every local authority, the introduction of the Attainment Challenge Innovation Fund and the continued progress of the Raising Attainment for All programme will help ensure that there is support for every local authority to close the poverty-related attainment gap; recognises that the Scottish Government will continue to work with key stakeholders to explore and consider further approaches that will support schools to close the attainment gap, and acknowledges that the OECD's review of Scottish education recognised the Scottish Government's determination to focus on achieving both excellence and equity in the education system and that the national improvement framework has the potential to be a key means of driving work to close the attainment gap and strengthen formative assessment approaches.”

Iain Gray moved amendment S4M-15430.2 to motion S4M-15430—

Leave out from first “pupil premium” to end and insert—

“fair start fund for children from poorer families in nursery and primary education would ensure that every child from poorer families gets the required support to catch up with the rest, no matter where they live or go to school; notes that Scottish Labour's proposed fair start fund would link funding to children and ensure that every school has an attainment fund equal to its needs; further notes that it would be used to tackle the attainment gap by allocating £1,000 for each primary school pupil and £300 for each nursery school pupil from a deprived background, with decisions on how this money should be spent taken by head teachers; is deeply concerned that currently in Scotland more than 6,000 children leave primary school unable to read properly, more than one quarter of three and four-year-olds at nursery do not have access to a qualified teacher and that the OECD found that the achievement gap between the most and least deprived is growing; understands that the Scottish Government's flagship Attainment Challenge Fund misses the vast majority of pupils who need support, with at least 1,500 schools in Scotland and one third of local authorities not receiving any of this funding at all, and believes that the half a billion pounds of cuts to local services such as

schools coming from the Scottish Government's budget means there is a real risk that pupils already at a disadvantage will get left even further behind.

Liz Smith moved amendment S4M-15430.1 to motion S4M-15430—

Leave out from "Liberal Democrats" to end and insert—

"in 2007, the Conservatives led by David Cameron proposed the introduction of the pupil premium, after which, along with the Liberal Democrats in the previous UK administration, they successfully made the case for, and introduced, the pupil premium in England in 2011, now worth £2.5 billion a year, and that the pupil premium has been successfully introduced in Wales; notes that Ofsted has said that the pupil premium 'is making a difference' and that the National Audit Office observed that the gap between disadvantaged and other pupils narrowed by 4.7% in primary schools and 1.6% in secondary schools between 2011 and 2014, following its introduction; notes that, in comparison, the Attainment Scotland Fund only makes a difference in those areas and schools selected by Scottish ministers, currently ignoring the additional needs of disadvantaged children in 11 out of 32 local authorities; believes that tying funding to those children who need extra help the most, wherever they may live, through the pupil premium, would be fairer and more effective, and calls for it to be urgently introduced to help propel Scottish schools back to the top of the class."

After debate, amendment S4M-15430.3 was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 60, Against 39, Abstentions 14). As a result, amendments S4M-15430.2 and S4M-15430.1 were pre-empted.

The motion, as amended, was then agreed to ((DT) by division: For 60, Against 39, Abstentions 14).

Accordingly, the Parliament resolved—That the Parliament believes that the £100 million Attainment Scotland Fund, which is additional to the almost £5 billion invested in education every year through local authorities, is rightly targeted at the primary schools that serve the most deprived communities in Scotland, with over 300 primary schools, which together support 54,399 pupils from deprived backgrounds, 64% of the total number of such pupils, benefitting from the funding; notes that this funding is providing a wide range of support to close the attainment gap including additional teaching and other specialist staff, support for parents to engage in their children's learning, literacy and numeracy tools and extra training for teachers; further believes that the package of universal support that has been drawn together through the Scottish Attainment Challenge, including the appointment of attainment advisors for every local authority, the introduction of the Attainment Challenge Innovation Fund and the continued progress of the Raising Attainment for All programme will help ensure that there is support for every local authority to close the poverty-related attainment gap; recognises that the Scottish Government will continue to work with key stakeholders to explore and consider further approaches that will support schools to close the attainment gap, and acknowledges that the OECD's review of Scottish education recognised the Scottish Government's determination to focus on achieving both excellence and equity in the education system and that the national

improvement framework has the potential to be a key means of driving work to close the attainment gap and strengthen formative assessment approaches.

3. Fuel Poverty: Jim Hume moved S4M-15432—That the Parliament believes that there is cross-party recognition of the social, economic and environmental damage that is caused by fuel poverty and energy-inefficient homes; is deeply concerned that national statistics published in December 2015 stated there had been “no real change” in the level of fuel poverty in 2014, with more than one-in-three households in fuel poverty and one-in-10 in extreme fuel poverty; believes that, with 845,000 households currently affected, the Scottish Government will miss its statutory target to eradicate fuel poverty by November 2016; considers that this will be even harder to achieve should, as proposed in the draft budget, spending on fuel poverty programmes be reduced in 2016-17, and demands that the Scottish Government reverse this cut, revise its 2016 fuel poverty target, examine whether its definition of fuel poverty needs to be updated and commit to additional measures to lift people out of fuel poverty in order to lead to warmer homes, lower energy bills, improved health and reduced carbon emissions.

The Minister for Housing and Welfare (Margaret Burgess) moved amendment S4M-15432.3 to motion S4M-15432—

Leave out from “is deeply concerned” to end and insert—

“recognises the Scottish Government’s commitment to eradicate fuel poverty as far as reasonably practicable through support and funding within the powers available to the Scottish Ministers, but notes that the Scottish Government has no control over the above-inflation price increases by energy companies that have pushed up fuel bills; notes the latest fuel poverty statistics published in the *Scottish House Condition Survey*, which show that the efforts of the Scottish Government have helped to contain fuel poverty levels in Scotland that would have been around 9.5%, instead of 35%, if fuel prices had only risen in line with inflation between 2002 and 2014; calls on energy companies to pass on wholesale cost savings to customers at the earliest opportunity and to the fullest extent possible for both gas and electricity customers; welcomes the Scottish Government’s continued investment in energy efficiency and fuel poverty and the contrast with the UK Government’s withdrawal of any taxpayer-funded support for fuel poverty in England since 2013; recognises that the Scottish Government has allocated over half a billion pounds since 2009 to fuel poverty and energy efficiency programmes, helping the most vulnerable people in society heat their homes affordably, reducing greenhouse gas emissions and supporting jobs; welcomes that the Scottish Government has maintained current budgets in 2016-17 by allocating more than £103 million to tackle fuel poverty and climate change next year in the face of ongoing spending pressures and UK Government cuts; welcomes that this funding will be used to help install energy efficiency measures in 14,000 homes, building on the more than 900,000 measures delivered since 2008 and that this record investment is reflected in the big improvements in the energy efficiency of Scotland’s housing, with the share of homes rated EPC band C and above having increased by 71% since 2010; further welcomes that the Scottish Government has designated energy efficiency as a National Infrastructure Priority, supported

by a commitment to multiyear funding and new powers to design and implement Energy Company Obligations in Scotland, and is therefore providing a long-term commitment to tackling fuel poverty head on.”

Ken Macintosh moved amendment S4M-15432.2 to motion S4M-15432—

Insert at end—

“; recognises the particular fuel poverty challenges faced by rural communities, and commits to delivering a Scottish warm homes bill that will create jobs, tackle fuel poverty and mean that Scotland lives up to its aspirations to be a world leader in tackling climate change”.

Gavin Brown moved amendment S4M-15432.1 to motion S4M-15432—

Leave out from “demands” to end and insert—

“calls on the Scottish Government to publish as soon as possible a comprehensive and credible action plan for tackling fuel poverty.”

After debate, amendment S4M-15432.3 was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 60, Against 53, Abstentions 0) and as a result, amendment S4M-15432.1 was pre-empted. Amendment S4M-15432.2 was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 40, Against 73, Abstentions 0).

The motion, as amended, was then agreed to ((DT) by division: For 60, Against 53, Abstentions 0).

Accordingly, the Parliament resolved—That the Parliament believes that there is cross-party recognition of the social, economic and environmental damage that is caused by fuel poverty and energy-inefficient homes; recognises the Scottish Government’s commitment to eradicate fuel poverty as far as reasonably practicable through support and funding within the powers available to the Scottish Ministers, but notes that the Scottish Government has no control over the above-inflation price increases by energy companies that have pushed up fuel bills; notes the latest fuel poverty statistics published in the *Scottish House Condition Survey*, which show that the efforts of the Scottish Government have helped to contain fuel poverty levels in Scotland that would have been around 9.5%, instead of 35%, if fuel prices had only risen in line with inflation between 2002 and 2014; calls on energy companies to pass on wholesale cost savings to customers at the earliest opportunity and to the fullest extent possible for both gas and electricity customers; welcomes the Scottish Government’s continued investment in energy efficiency and fuel poverty and the contrast with the UK Government’s withdrawal of any taxpayer-funded support for fuel poverty in England since 2013; recognises that the Scottish Government has allocated over half a billion pounds since 2009 to fuel poverty and energy efficiency programmes, helping the most vulnerable people in society heat their homes affordably, reducing greenhouse gas emissions and supporting jobs; welcomes that the Scottish Government has maintained current budgets in 2016-17 by allocating more than £103 million to tackle fuel poverty and climate change next year in the face of ongoing spending pressures and UK Government cuts; welcomes that this

funding will be used to help install energy efficiency measures in 14,000 homes, building on the more than 900,000 measures delivered since 2008 and that this record investment is reflected in the big improvements in the energy efficiency of Scotland's housing, with the share of homes rated EPC band C and above having increased by 71% since 2010; further welcomes that the Scottish Government has designated energy efficiency as a National Infrastructure Priority, supported by a commitment to multiyear funding and new powers to design and implement Energy Company Obligations in Scotland, and is therefore providing a long-term commitment to tackling fuel poverty head on.

4. Bankruptcy (Scotland) Bill: The Minister for Business, Energy and Tourism (Fergus Ewing) moved S4M-15415—That the Parliament agrees to the general principles of the Bankruptcy (Scotland) Bill.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

5. Business Motion: Joe FitzPatrick, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S4M-15437—That the Parliament agrees the following programme of business—

Tuesday 2 February 2016

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)

followed by Stage 3 Proceedings: Education (Scotland) Bill

followed by Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee: Code of Conduct Revisions

followed by Scottish Parliamentary Nomination: Scottish Human Rights Commissioner

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Wednesday 3 February 2016

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions
Social Justice, Communities and Pensioners' Rights;
Fair Work, Skills and Training

followed by Stage 1 Debate: Budget (Scotland) (No. 5) Bill

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time
followed by Members' Business

Thursday 4 February 2016

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

12.30 pm Members' Business

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Stage 3 Proceedings: Carers (Scotland) Bill

followed by Stage 1 Debate: Alcohol (Licensing, Public Health and Criminal Justice) (Scotland) Bill

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

Tuesday 9 February 2016

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)

followed by Scottish Government Business

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Wednesday 10 February 2016

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions
Finance, Constitution and Economy

followed by Scottish Government Business

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Thursday 11 February 2016

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

12.30 pm Members' Business

2.30 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.30 pm Stage 3 Proceedings: Community Justice (Scotland) Bill

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

The motion was agreed to.

6. Business Motion: Joe FitzPatrick, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S4M-15436—That the Parliament agrees that consideration of the Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill at stage 2 be completed by 12 February 2016.

The motion was agreed to.

7. Approval of SSI: Joe FitzPatrick, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S4M-15438—That the Parliament agrees that the Microchipping of Dogs (Scotland) Regulations 2016 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

8. Substitution on Committee: Joe FitzPatrick, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S4M-15439—That the Parliament agrees that Gil Paterson be appointed to replace James Dornan as the SNP substitute on the Infrastructure and Capital Investment Committee.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

9. Decision Time: The Parliament took decisions on items 2, 3, 4, 7 and 8 as noted above.

10. 10 Million Missing Voters: The Parliament debated S4M-15307 in the name of Claire Baker—That the Parliament notes with concern the report by the Smith Institute, *10 million missing voters!: a briefing report on the failings of the new electoral registration system*, which claims that as many as 10 million people may not be registered to vote across the UK; understands that recent changes to voter

registration toward a system of individual electoral registration could have seen as many as 230,000 voters in Scotland, including in Mid Scotland and Fife, lost from the electoral register, making it one of the worst affected regions in the UK; believes that this will have an adverse impact and will create a democratic deficit in the lead up to the 2016 Scottish election and the referendum on EU membership; understands also that the Boundary Commission for Scotland is due to begin reviewing constituency boundaries in 2016; believes that such a large number of unregistered voters will result in distorted electoral maps and underrepresentation of urban areas and young people, renters, certain ethnic minorities and students, and notes the view that the number of unregistered voters in Scotland and throughout the UK is something that all political parties should work to address.

The meeting closed at 5.47 pm.

P E Grice
Clerk of the Parliament
27 January 2016

Appendix

(Note: this Appendix does not form part of the Minutes)

Other Documents

The following document was laid before the Parliament on 27 January 2016 and is not subject to any Parliamentary procedure—

HMICS Audit and Assurance Review of the use of the Facial Search functionality within the UK Police National Database (PND) by Police Scotland (HMICS/2016/01)

laid under section 79(3) of the Police and Fire Reform (Scotland) Act 2012

Published in Scotland by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

All documents are available on
the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.scottish.parliament.uk/documents

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000
Textphone: 0800 092 7100
Email: sp.info@scottish.parliament.uk

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

The Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - www.scottish.parliament.uk
or by contacting Public Information.