

**CITY OF EDINBURGH COUNCIL (PORTOBELLO PARK) BILL
WRITTEN SUBMISSION – STEPHEN McINTYRE**

I would like to make comment on evidence submitted on Traffic and Road Safety to support objectors in the next consideration stage meeting scheduled for March 26th 2014. I apologise for late submission, the evidence was placed in the public domain very recently

My observations focus on two aspects of the evidence presented:

- **A “casualty incident” statistics table which depicts the number of casualties on the stretch of the A1 between Hope Lane North and Duddingston Park during a 5 year period from 2009 to 2013.**
- **“The independent Road Safety Report commissioned by the Local Residents”**

Casualty Table (see appendix)

According to the data provided, which I accept at face value, there were 13 casualties during the five year period in question; 4 were described as serious , the remaining 9 as slight. I ask you to consider the following observations.

- 1) The data refers to casualties not the number of incidents.
- 2) There is no detail supplied regarding the days or timing of the accidents which caused the casualties, day or night, week or weekend day.
- 3) There is no detail supplied as to the nature of the accidents ie; were pedestrians involved.

The “Independent road safety report” by J Mclean Consulting Ltd states the following: “

“At the location of the proposed Portobello High School the Annual Average Daily Traffic is in the region of 18,000 vehicles”

Simple arithmetic (5 years>365 days>18,000 vehicles per day) equates to a total of 32.85 Million vehicle journeys on the stretch of road in question over the 5 year period 2009-2013. 13 casualties, perhaps fewer accidents from almost 33 Million vehicle journeys.

As previously stated, without data on when accidents actually occurred, it could be there was no accidents or casualties on weekdays between 7am and 5pm in the entire 5 year period. There may have been no accidents involving pedestrians.

When using or negotiating roads, ideally there would be no casualties, realistically there always will be. At present around 25% of PHS pupils have to cross the A1 to get to and from school. The evidence provided by the objectors indicates this stretch of the A1 which will mostly be adjacent to the new school, has proved to be safely traversed by almost 100% of 32.85 Million vehicles over 5 years. The objectors have inadvertently proved that contrary to popular myth, this section of the A1 is not a particularly treacherous stretch of road.

Independent Road Safety Assessment- J McLean Consulting Limited

It is beyond my skill set to criticise the content and conclusions of the above report and I have no concerns over the qualifications and experience of the author.

However, I feel I must convey concerns about the following assertion.

“The independent Road Safety Report commissioned by the Local Residents”

It would appear the local residents cast a wide net prior to engaging a Road Safety Assessor; J McLean Consulting Ltd who are based in Kirkcaldy, Fife.

There are dozens of Road Safety Consultants in Scotland. The objectors chose a firm who were incorporated on August 23rd 2013 (see below). A few days prior to the commencement of the preliminary stage of the Bill and around 100 days prior to the date of their first draft report.

As far as I able to establish, at this point in time, the Firm has no public profile, no website or indeed no telephone number. There appears to be no accreditation with industry bodies.

I have been unable to trace any other reports conducted by the Firm. The objectors therefore excelled in locating this start up consultancy business.

I am in no way suggesting there is anything remiss about the appointment of J Mclean Consulting Ltd as an Independent, however they must not be confused with other, more mature consultancies who perhaps have a proven track record in Independent reporting over many years. The J McLean Consulting Ltd report is essentially the opinion of just one person.

Thank you for your consideration.

Stephen McIntyre
25 March 2014

Extracts from objectors submission

A1 Milton Road between Duddingston Park and Hope Lane - Accident & Casualty data
Based on Eastings 330276 - 330868 and Northings 672780 - 672977
Period January 2009 - September 2013

Casualty summary

Year	Killed	Serious	Slight	Total
2009	0	2	3	5
2010	0	0	2	2
2011	0	0	1	1
2012	0	1	1	2
2013	0	1	2	3
Total	0	4	9	13

The table above shows that there have been 13 personal injury accidents on the A199 Milton Road between Hope Lane and Duddingston Park during the period January 2009 to September 2013. This is a significant number of personal injury accidents over a relatively short length of road.

Clearly a number of safety conflicts already exist on this section of the strategic road corridor and the proposed new school with a direct access to Milton Road would generate additional traffic and 1400 pedestrian movements. This would inevitable cause additional conflicts and significantly increase the safety risk to the 1400 pupils going to the proposed school at least twice per day, the local residents and 18000 drivers and passengers who travel on the A1 Milton Road corridor every day.