



# The Scottish Parliament Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Parliamentary Year 3, No. 95, Session 5

Meeting of the Parliament

Wednesday 27 March 2019

Note: (DT) signifies a decision taken at Decision Time.

The meeting opened at 1.30 pm.

**1. Ministerial Statement:** The Minister for Health and Sport (Jeane Freeman) made a statement and answered questions on Infection incident at Royal Infirmary Edinburgh.

**2. Portfolio Questions:** Questions on Communities and Local Government and then on Social Security and Older People were answered by Cabinet Secretaries and Ministers.

**3. Revoking Article 50:** Patrick Harvie moved S5M-16554—That the Parliament commends the more than five million signatories to the UK Parliament petition to revoke Article 50, and believes that, unless the UK secures a sufficient extension to the Brexit process to organise and conduct a People’s Vote with an option to remain in the EU, the UK’s notification under Article 50 of the Treaty on European Union should be revoked immediately.

Fiona Hyslop moved amendment S5M-16554.4—

As an amendment to motion S5M-16544 in the name of Patrick Harvie (Revoking Article 50), insert at end “, and calls on the UK Government to stop ignoring the views of this Parliament and the overwhelming majority of people in Scotland who wish to remain in the EU.”

After debate, the amendment was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 89, Against 28, Abstentions 1).

Adam Tomkins moved amendment S5M-16554.1—

As an amendment to motion S5M-16554 in the name of Patrick Harvie (Revoking Article 50), leave out from “commends” to end and insert “considers that the result of the referendum held across the UK in June 2016 should be respected and delivered, and that the best way of achieving this is to leave the EU with a withdrawal agreement.”

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 28, Against 89, Abstentions 1).

Neil Findlay moved amendment S5M-16554.3—

As an amendment to motion S5M-16554 in the name of Patrick Harvie (Revoking Article 50), leave out from “People’s” to “EU” and insert “public vote with an option to remain in the EU, and the UK be faced with a choice of no deal or revoke, then”.

After debate, the amendment was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 84, Against 33, Abstentions 1).

The motion, as amended, was then agreed to ((DT) by division: For 89, Against 28, Abstentions 1).

Accordingly, the Parliament resolved—That the Parliament commends the more than five million signatories to the UK Parliament petition to revoke Article 50; believes that, unless the UK secures a sufficient extension to the Brexit process to organise and conduct a public vote with an option to remain in the EU, and the UK be faced with a choice of no deal or revoke, then, the UK’s notification under Article 50 of the Treaty on European Union should be revoked immediately, and calls on the UK Government to stop ignoring the views of this Parliament and the overwhelming majority of people in Scotland who wish to remain in the EU.

**4. Climate Emergency:** Alison Johnstone moved S5M-16555—That the Parliament recognises that the world is entering a climate emergency and supports the goal to limit global warming to 1.5 degrees Celsius; further supports the actions of the 1.4 million young people around the world, including in Scotland, who absented themselves from school to demand urgent and radical action; recognises the moral duty on the Parliament to act in the interests of young people and future generations, as well as communities on the front line of climate breakdown around the world, and calls on the Scottish Government to recognise that the policy of maximum economic recovery of oil and gas is incompatible with addressing the climate emergency, and to introduce a legislative ban on the extraction of unconventional oil and gas reserves.

Mairi Gougeon moved amendment S5M-16555.4—

As an amendment to motion S5M-16555 in the name of Mark Ruskell (Climate Emergency), leave out from “further supports” to end and insert “recognises the concerns expressed by the 1.4 million young people around the world, including in Scotland, who chose to strike in order to seek urgent and radical action to

prevent the damaging effects of climate change; acknowledges the moral duty on the Parliament to act in the interests of young people and future generations, as well as communities on the front line of climate breakdown around the world; understands that the Just Transition Commission is presently exploring how to maximise the social and economic opportunities offered by moving to a carbon-neutral economy while ensuring no one is left behind; welcomes the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee's stage 1 report on the Climate Change (Emissions Reduction Targets) (Scotland) Bill, and notes the Scottish Government's commitment to act on the advice of its statutory advisers, the Committee on Climate Change, should it conclude that an even higher target ambition is now credible."

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 58, Against 59, Abstentions 0).

Maurice Golden moved amendment S5M-16555.1—

As an amendment to motion S5M-16555 in the name of Mark Ruskell (Climate Emergency), leave out from "further supports" to end and insert "recognises the moral duty on the Parliament to act in the interests of young people and future generations, as well as communities suffering most from climate change around the world, and welcomes the support given to them to mitigate and adapt to the effects of climate change from both the UK and Scottish governments."

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 28, Against 90, Abstentions 0).

Claudia Beamish moved amendment S5M-16555.3—

As an amendment to motion S5M-16555 in the name of Mark Ruskell (Climate Emergency), leave out from ", and calls on" to end and insert "; calls on the Scottish Government to consider putting the Just Transition Commission on a statutory and fully funded footing to support workers in all sectors, including the oil and gas industry, and their communities; recognises the mandate from the public and the Parliament for a legislative ban on unconventional onshore oil and gas extraction; calls on the Scottish Government to help drive forward a green jobs revolution that will support the development of public and co-operative ownership models with the focus of delivering the energy that communities need, and understands the crucial need to address the climate change challenges impacting the natural world and ecosystems on which people depend."

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 22, Against 96, Abstentions 0).

The motion was then disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 6, Against 111, Abstentions 0).

**5. Business Motion:** Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S5M-16579— That the Parliament agrees—

(a) the following programme of business—

Tuesday 2 April 2019

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

*followed by* Topical Questions (if selected)

*followed by* Stage 1 Debate: Climate Change (Emissions Reduction Targets) (Scotland) Bill

*followed by* Standards Procedures and Public Appointments Committee Debate – Changes to Code of Conduct Rule

*followed by* Committee Announcements

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Wednesday 3 April 2019

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform; Rural Economy

*followed by* Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party Business

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Thursday 4 April 2019

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

*followed by* Members' Business

2.30 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions: Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity

*followed by* Stage 1 Debate: Transport (Scotland) Bill

*followed by* Financial Resolution: Transport (Scotland) Bill

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

Tuesday 23 April 2019

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

*followed by* Topical Questions (if selected)

*followed by* Social Security Committee Debate: In Work Poverty

*followed by* Committee Announcements

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Wednesday 24 April 2019

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Justice and the Law Officers; Government Business and Constitutional Relations

*followed by* Scottish Government Business

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Thursday 25 April 2019

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

*followed by* Members' Business

2.30 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions: Culture, Tourism and External Affairs

*followed by* Final stage: Hutchesons' Hospital Transfer and Dissolution (Scotland) Bill

*followed by* Scottish Government Debate

5.00 pm Decision Time

(b) that, in relation to any debate on a business motion setting out a business programme taken on Wednesday 3 April 2019, the second sentence of rule 8.11.3 is suspended and replaced with "Any Member may speak on the motion at the discretion of the Presiding Officer";

(c) that, in relation to First Minister's Questions on Thursday 4 April 2019, in rule 13.6.2, insert at end "and may provide an opportunity for Party Leaders or their representatives to question the First Minister"; and

(d) that, for the purposes of Portfolio Questions in the week beginning 1 April 2019, in rule 13.7.3, after the word "except" the words "to the extent to which the Presiding Officer considers that the questions are on the same or similar subject matter or" are inserted.

The motion was agreed to.

**6. Parliamentary Bureau Motions:** Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved—

**S5M-16580**—That the Parliament agrees that the Forestry and Land Management (Scotland) Act 2018 (Consequential Amendments) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

**S5M-16581**—That the Parliament agrees that the Services of Lawyers and Lawyer's Practice (EU Exit) (Scotland) (Amendment etc.) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

**S5M-16582**—That the Parliament agrees that the Plant Health (EU Exit) (Scotland) (Amendment etc.) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

**S5M-16583**—That the Parliament agrees that the Forestry (Exemptions) (Scotland) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

**S5M-16584**—That the Parliament agrees that the Forestry (EU Exit) (Scotland) (Amendment etc.) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

**S5M-16585**—That the Parliament agrees that the Cross-border Health Care (EU Exit) (Scotland) (Amendment etc.) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

The motions were agreed to (DT).

**7. Decision Time:** The Parliament took decisions on items 3, 4 and 6 as noted above.

**8. The Impact from Celebrity Endorsements of Diet Products:** The Parliament debated S5M-16069 in the name of Shona Robison—That the Parliament recognises the petition, “LET’S STOP influencers and celebrities working with products promoting speedy weight loss”, which has been organised by the founder of the Empowered Women Project, Mandy Jones, and can be found on [change.org](https://change.org); understands that Mandy has launched the petition to highlight the dangers of advertising products that encourage rapid weight loss; believes that many celebrities have stated that weight loss companies require a before and after photo when promoting their products, often taken on the same day, which can construct an inaccurate portrayal of healthy weight loss as a result of using a product; acknowledges the potentially significant damaging effects that portrayals of unrealistic body expectations, which are often perpetuated by, and shared widely across, social media, can have on the mental health of young people and adults; notes that Wellbeing Works, Dundee supports the petition stating that the inaccurate portrayal of healthy weight loss as a result of using a product is just one of many messages that young people might be vulnerable to, and that will impact negatively on their confidence and self-esteem and on the relationship that they have with their bodies, and considers that, in some cases, these negative perceptions and poor self-image could potentially go on to affect young women in their life choices, relationships and career opportunities, and ultimately impact on their mental health and wellbeing as they move into adulthood.

The meeting closed at 5.54 pm.

**P E Grice**  
Clerk of the Parliament  
27 March 2019

**Appendix**  
**(Note: this Appendix does not form part of the Minutes)**



---

Published by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

---

All documents are available on  
the Scottish Parliament website at:  
[www.scottish.parliament.uk/documents](http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/documents)

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact  
Public Information on:  
Telephone: 0131 348 5000 or 0800 092 7500  
Email: [sp.info@parliament.scot](mailto:sp.info@parliament.scot)  
Live chat on [parliament.scot](http://parliament.scot)  
You can write to us in any language or contact us  
using the Text Relay service or in British Sign  
Language through [contactScotland-BSL](http://contactScotland-BSL).

---

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

The Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - [www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot) or by  
contacting Public Information.