



T: 0300 244 4000
E: scottish.ministers@gov.scot

Bruce Crawford MSP
Convenor
Finance and Constitution Committee
Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

17 May 2019

Dear Bruce

I am pleased to submit the annual report on inter-governmental relations (attached) in line with the Scottish Government's written agreement with the Scottish Parliament. The report covers the period April 2017 to June 2018.

This is the second such report to be compiled, bringing together in one place a range of information to enable Parliament and the general public to scrutinise more effectively this important aspect of devolved government in Scotland. I am glad to note that the first report was generally regarded as a useful step forward and hope that this second report proves similarly useful.

I also want to apologise for the delay in submitting this report. I know my officials have kept in touch with your clerk to explain that, while ideally this report would have issued last autumn, the pressure of work across the office on Brexit and the sheer quantity of information to be considered has resulted in an unavoidable delay.

The Scottish Government will continue to engage with parliamentarians to ensure that future annual reports provide as much relevant information as possible, whilst respecting the confidence of our counterparts in other administrations. With that in mind, I welcome any response from the Committee and have encouraged my officials to stand ready to continue to engage with parliamentary clerks to enhance the information we provide in that regard.

MICHAEL RUSSELL

Scottish Government

Inter-Governmental Relations

Annual Report

April 2017 – June 2018

presented to

The Convener
Finance and Constitution Committee
Scottish Parliament

Inter-Governmental Relations

Annual Report

April 2017 – June 2018

Contents

Ministerial Foreword	Page 3
Introduction	Page 5
Formal Engagement	Page 6
<u>Memorandum of Understanding and Supplementary Agreements (Devolution)</u>	Page 6
<i>Other Memoranda of Understanding, Concordats and Service Level Agreements</i>	Page 7
<u>Joint Ministerial Committee (JMC)</u>	Page 8
<i>Plenary (JMC(P))</i>	Page 8
<i>Europe (JMC(E))</i>	Page 9
<i>EU Negotiations (JMC(EN))</i>	Page 11
<i>Ministerial Forum (MF(EN))</i>	Page 13
<i>Domestic (JMC(D))</i>	Page 14
<i>Dispute Avoidance and Resolution</i>	Page 14
<u>Finance Ministers' Quadrilateral (FMQ)</u>	Page 15
<u>Joint Exchequer Committee (JEC)</u>	Page 15
<u>Joint Ministerial Working Group on Welfare (JMWGW)</u>	Page 15
<u>Agriculture Ministers' Forum</u>	Page 16
<u>Other – Four Nations Community Cohesion Forum</u>	Page 18
<u>Other – Joint Tourism Ministers UK Government and Devolved Administrations Meeting</u>	Page 19
Informal Engagement (by portfolio)	Page 21
<u>A Note on Informal Engagement</u>	Page 21
<u>First Minister</u>	Page 21
<u>Deputy First Minister and Education and Skills</u>	Page 23
<u>Communities, Social Security and Equalities</u>	Page 25
<u>Culture, Tourism and External Affairs</u>	Page 27
<u>Economy, Jobs and Fair Work</u>	Page 27
<u>Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform</u>	Page 29
<u>Finance and the Constitution</u>	Page 30
<u>Health and Sport</u>	Page 31
<u>Justice</u>	Page 31
<u>Rural Economy and Connectivity</u>	Page 32
<u>Law Officers</u>	Page 33

Ministerial Foreword

In this second annual report on inter-governmental relations, we endeavour to provide the Scottish Parliament with as much information as we can on the interactions we have had with our counterparts across the UK.

I remain committed to ensuring that knowledge and understanding of the terms of our written agreement with Parliament is sufficient across the Scottish Government and recognise that there remains more that we must do to ensure we are abiding by those terms. With that in mind, this year's submission covers some previously unreported formal fora and the Scottish Government commit to keeping Parliament apprised of our engagement in those.



There has possibly never been a time when the engagement between our administrations has been so important and so I welcome and encourage proper scrutiny in this area. It is no secret that we – and numerous external commentators – believe that the current UK inter-governmental relations machinery is not fit for purpose, and that this inadequacy will become intolerable if the demands of a post-Brexit UK are brought to bear.

The Scottish Government's position is well known. The best way to tackle the inherent inequality and inadequacies in Scotland's relationship with the United Kingdom and to protect our place in Europe, is for Scotland to be an independent nation. In my view, the deteriorating relationship between the UK government and the Scottish government is a further sign that equality is needed which can only be secured by being independent.

However, we have worked in good faith, under current constitutional arrangements, consistently setting out our concerns about the on-going lack of meaningful engagement on the part of UK Government. Whilst it has been their approach to negotiations with the EU which have most recently demonstrated UK Government's persistent refusal to respond positively to the wishes of the people of Scotland and the will of the Scottish Parliament, the flaws in inter-governmental machinery have been apparent for far longer.

It is vital that the ongoing quadrilateral review of intergovernmental provisions and mechanisms takes an ambitious approach to developing the sorts of robust provisions and mechanisms that will be necessary if they are to bear the weight of the discussions that must be had between our administrations on negotiations on our continuing relationship with the European Union and on the domestic consequences of the UK leaving.

MICHAEL RUSSELL

Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations

April 2019

Introduction

1. This report details the formal and informal ministerial-level engagement between the Scottish Government (SG) and the UK Government (UKG) and other devolved administrations over the reporting period April 2017 to June 2018. The reporting period spans 15 months, by agreement with the Scottish Parliament's Finance and Constitution Committee. This was done in order to advance the reporting period in subsequent years, to take better account of Parliamentary recess dates.
2. The report does not cover the Scottish Government's international engagement, such as with the European Union or within the context of the British-Irish Council.
3. It takes account of the reporting that ministers have already engaged in on those formal fora highlighted in the agreement between the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament and consolidates this with detail of other informal meetings held throughout the year.

Formal Engagement

Memorandum of Understanding and Supplementary Agreements (Devolution)

4. The Memorandum of Understanding and Supplementary Agreements on Devolution have been under review since 2014. The previous Annual Report details the circumstances of the commissions falling from the Plenary Sessions of the Joint Ministerial Committee in December 2014 and October 2016. The January 2017 Plenary directed officials to continue this work and the Plenary in March 2018, instructed officials to review and report to Ministers on the existing inter-governmental structures, to ensure they are fit for purpose in light of the UK's exit from the EU. This work has become known as 'the Joint Review of IGR'.
5. Officials have been examining and analysing the numerous and varied recommendations made by commentators, academics, parliamentarians and other observers, on how our current inter-governmental provisions might be improved. However, new challenges brought about by the UK's exit from the EU force us to not only take account of but also look beyond the practical experience of the past two decades, to plan and provide for future relations in a post-Brexit environment.
6. The Scottish Government is therefore of the view that the Joint Review of IGR review must be comprehensive. It must provide entirely fresh consideration of the practicalities and possibilities of our inter-governmental engagement under these fundamentally altered circumstances. The review cannot simply amend the existing MoU, which has remained largely unaltered since its original draft as UK Government Command Paper Cm 4444 (October 1999). The MoU belongs to a period when devolution was in its infancy and the scope for political and policy divergence between the administrations of the UK was neither anticipated nor planned for.
7. Further provisions for fora like the Joint Ministerial Committee on EU Negotiations are contained within specifically agreed terms of reference that are underpinned by, but sit separately from, the provisions of the MoU. Again, the review presents an opportunity to consolidate what has become a piecemeal approach to the governance and development of these new avenues for inter-governmental engagement. There has been suggestion that various new, portfolio-specific, inter-governmental fora should be established to allow collaborative policy exchange and formulation in the coming years. In instances where such fora are established, there must be some consistency in the approach to them and their governance.
8. The Joint Review is ongoing and officials are expected to provide collective observations and recommendations to the Plenary Session of the Joint Ministerial Committee when it next convenes.
9. For the present therefore, as in previous reviews to date, the October 2013 version of the MoU remains in place.

Other Memoranda of Understanding, Concordats and Service Level Agreements

10. In line with our written agreement with the Scottish Parliament, the Scottish Government has sought to provide relevant committees with due notice of new inter-governmental agreements in the preparatory stages of their development and when agreements are completed and signed.

11. The following table presents all written agreements signed in this reporting period.

Agreement	Signed
<p><u>Service Level Agreement between the Scottish Government and HM Revenue and Customs</u></p> <p><i>This Service Level Agreement (Agreement) sets down the requirements and performance measures for the operation of Scottish income tax which will ensure a consistent quality of service to Scottish taxpayers and allow HMRC and the Scottish Government to meet their respective responsibilities in respect of operating Scottish income tax.</i></p>	02 November 2017
<p><u>Working Level Agreement between the Department for Work and Pensions and the Scottish Government in respect to Universal Credit Scottish Flexibilities between the Scottish Government and the Department for Work and Pensions</u></p> <p><i>The agreement sets out the provisions of the relationship between DWP and SG in relation only to the delivery by DWP of the Universal Credit Scottish Flexibilities (Scottish Choices). The Universal Credit Scottish Flexibilities (Scottish Choices) are powers which Scottish Government Ministers can exercise, through the making of regulations, and are defined in Sections 29 and 30 of the Scotland Act 2016.</i></p>	09 November 2017
<p><u>Memorandum of Understanding between the Scottish Government and Cabinet Office (Government Digital Service).</u></p> <p><i>An agreement between the Scottish Government and the Government Digital Service (Cabinet Office, UK Government) on the principles for collaborative development and delivery of digital government.</i></p>	30 April 2018
<p><u>Service Level Agreement between the Department for Work and Pensions and the Scottish Government in respect of Carers Allowance Supplement.</u></p> <p><i>An agreement setting out the provisions of the relationship between DWP and Scottish Ministers in relation to the Carer's Allowance Supplement and the services DWP will provide to support this.</i></p>	10 August 2018

Joint Ministerial Committee (JMC)

Plenary (JMC(P))

12. A period of 13 months elapsed between the Plenary meeting on 30 January 2017 (last reporting year) and the next on 14 March 2018, bringing the frequency of these meetings closer to an annual cycle. The March meeting was the only Plenary to take place in this reporting period.
13. Events around the UK General Election, announced on 18 April and held on 8 June 2017, precluded an informally mooted meeting of the forum in the Summer.
14. The 14 March meeting reverted back to Downing Street, hosted by the UK Government and chaired by the Prime Minister, the Rt Hon Theresa May, MP as is usual. Details are set out in letters sent by Scottish Ministers to the Convener of relevant Committees in the Scottish Parliament, but for completeness are included here.
15. The First Minister, Rt Hon Nicola Sturgeon, MSP had received briefing directly from the National Security Adviser on the incident which took place in Salisbury. In the plenary discussion she told the Prime Minister that she supported her initial steps and that the matter demanded a proportionate but very firm response. She agreed that attacks of this nature simply cannot be allowed to take place on the streets of this country with impunity. She welcomed the close cooperation that exists on this and other aspects of national security and indicated the Scottish Government's willingness to engage with the development of measures that contribute to the UK's response to the attack but that, as would be expected, proposals for further action and legislation would be scrutinised closely and judged on their merits.
16. In discussing the UK exiting the EU and negotiations on future relations, the First Minister set out the Scottish Government's clear position that membership of the single market and the customs union would be the least damaging future relationship with the European Union and her concerns that the approach the Prime Minister had set out would not be acceptable to the European Union. She also queried how much detail the UK Government expected to be contained in any agreement on the future relationship.
17. On the UK Government's engagement with the devolved administrations on negotiations with the EU, the First Minister made very clear that the arrangements hitherto have been insufficient. Citing the examples of agriculture and fisheries, heavily devolved in nature and of great importance to Scotland, she noted the lack of input Scottish Ministers had been afforded in formulating a position for the UK. She made clear that UK Government would need to demonstrate a substantial change in its approach to engaging devolved administrations.
18. The second part of the discussion on exiting the EU concerned the UK Government's EU (Withdrawal) Bill. The First Minister explained that she could not recommend that the Scottish Parliament give its consent to the Bill without the changes that had been set out jointly by the Scottish and Welsh Governments being incorporated into the bill.

In particular, she stressed that any constraints upon devolved competence, no matter how temporary, must be agreed by the Scottish Parliament. She assured the Prime Minister that the Scottish Government was ready to agree common frameworks where those would be in the interests of Scotland, but that these must be agreed and not imposed.

19. Following the meeting, the First Minister and the First Minister of Wales, Rt Hon Carwyn Jones, AM wrote to the Lords' Speaker to set out the views of the Scottish and Welsh Governments on the replacement clause 11 tabled by the UK Government, describing our alternative proposals.
20. The Plenary also discussed the need to review our inter-governmental structures, including the Memorandum of Understanding, to ensure they are fit for purpose in light of the UK's exit from the EU. Officials were asked to review the current provisions and to report back to Ministers on their findings. However no findings were reported during the reporting period [and a further plenary session to consider findings is yet to take place at the time of publishing this report].

Europe (JMC(E))

21. The Concordat on Co-ordination of European Union Policy Issues stipulates that the JMC(E) should, at least, meet in advance of each scheduled ordinary meeting of the European Council in March, June, October and December. Between April 2017 – June 2018, there were five meetings of the JMC(E). The March 2018 meeting was not held prior to Council due to difficulties in co-ordinating the availability of Ministers.
22. There are no official communiques issued from these meetings.
23. The Article 50 process on EU exit has led to an increased overlap between items of on-going EU business and matters under active consideration in respect of Brexit negotiations. Assessing to what extent engagement lies within the remit of the JMC(E) and what lies within JMC(EN) is becoming more challenging for each of the UK's administrations, with the risk that meaningful discussion of current EU priorities intersects with long-term interests in the Brexit process.
24. Of the five JMC(E) meetings during the reporting period, the Minister for International Development and Europe, Dr Alasdair Allan, MSP was only able to attend in person on two of these occasions. Calendar conflicts with parliamentary business and the convention of holding meetings in London have frustrated availability for attendance. The fact that the June 2018 meeting took place in Edinburgh – the first time it had not been held in London – was a welcome innovation in that context.
25. The first JMC(E) of the reporting period took place on 21 June 2017, with Baroness Anelay replacing Rt Hon David Jones, MP as chair as Minister of State for Exiting the EU. Dr Alasdair Allan, the then Minister for International Development and Europe, and Paul Wheelhouse, the then Minister for Business, Innovation and Energy represented the Scottish Government via video conference. Dr Allan stressed the value that the Scottish Government places on the JMC(E) as a forum and reiterated dissatisfaction with the late sharing of papers, which prevented the Scottish Government being able to offer detailed positions on the UK Government's offensive

and defensive priorities for the upcoming European Council. Dr Allan also made clear that it was unsatisfactory to hold the JMC(E) one day prior to the European Council as this did not allow the devolved administrations to influence UK positions before Council. Mr Wheelhouse challenged the lack of ambition in the UK Government's circular economy targets, calling on the UK Government to follow the Scottish Government's example and align more closely with the most ambitious EU Member States.

26. Dr Allan represented the Scottish Government at the second meeting of the year, on 21 October 2017, in London. The Minister reiterated the importance of the JMC(E) forum to influencing EU policy. On UK Government priorities for on-going EU business, he affirmed that the Scottish Government's priorities and interests broadly align with those of the EU, giving the example of research and innovation and environmental matters. He also put on record Scotland's commitment to being a constructive EU partner in meeting our obligations and that we will continue to engage constructively to mitigate any risk to the timely transposition of EU legislation. The Minister reiterated the Scottish Government's views on the standard JMC(E) item on the UK Government's European Council priorities shared via correspondence prior to the meeting. As part of this, he made clear that completion of the Digital Single Market was a priority, stated the importance of the UK continuing to co-operate on cyber security matters and welcomed the language around digital skills and infrastructure proposed by the UK Government.

27. Following Baroness Anelay's resignation, the chair of the JMC(E) passed to the new Minister of State for Exiting the European Union, Lord Callanan for the third meeting, held on 6 December 2017. Dr Allan joined the meeting via teleconference and began by welcoming the improved quality of the papers. The Minister also highlighted that the papers on December Council agenda items and European Pillar of Social Rights demonstrated the benefits of EU membership, and sought a view as to whether the UK would adhere to the Social Scoreboard post-Brexit. On the first agenda item, Priorities for the December Council, the Minister highlighted Dundee being ruled ineligible to bid to become European City of Culture as a vivid example of missing out on the benefits of EU membership. The Minister sought a view from the UK Government on the Permanent Structured Co-operation (PESCO) and whether Member States would allow third countries to participate in efforts to deepen defence co-operation across Europe. The Minister also reiterated that Scotland's migration needs differ significantly from the rest of the UK and stressed the importance of ensuring that Scotland has a migration system which meets the country's needs. On the Bulgarian Presidency agenda item, the Minister highlighted that the Scottish Government needed to be engaged in shaping the justice agenda as Scotland has a separate justice system predating the Act of Union. He also enquired about subsidiarity principles on Common Agricultural Policy schemes and highlighted Scotland's differing needs from the rest of the UK on agriculture, particularly with regards to the prevalence of less-favoured areas in Scotland.

28. There were particular difficulties finding a suitable date for the March JMC(E). It eventually took place on 29 March 2018, after the European Council meeting. The Minister for Europe wrote to Lord Callanan prior to the Council to outline the Scottish Government's views on agenda items, including international trade, European Capital Markets, digital taxation and the Social Pillar. Due to the late rescheduling the Minister participated via teleconference. He reiterated the critical nature of more meaningful

input from the devolved administrations in shaping the UK's European policy positions in advance of JMC(E) meetings. Single use plastics were discussed and the Minister called on the UK Government to be as ambitious as the Scottish Government on waste reduction targets and offered to work with the UK and the other devolved administrations on a bottle return scheme. With regards to the next Multi-annual Funding Framework (2021-2027), the Minister stressed that – in line with our position for continued EU and Single Market membership – the Scottish Government does not want to be limited on what EU funding streams and programmes we can access and have influence over as a consequence of the UK's decision to leave the EU. He also sought clarity on the UK Government's priorities in relation to future participation on EU programmes. In discussion of EU legislative obligations during the transition period, the Minister asked how the UK Government will assess what is in the national interest, manage risk and how the devolved administrations will form part of this process.

29. The JMC(E) held on 21 June 2018 was hosted by the Scottish Government in Edinburgh, making it the first JMC(E) to be held outside London. During discussions on the June European Council agenda, the Minister for Europe reiterated the positive case for migration that the Scottish Government has been making and stressed that considerations on refuge and asylum to be based on humanitarian grounds. He also highlighted the risk for Scotch whisky of any retaliatory measures as a result of the US-EU trade dispute on steel and aluminium. He also highlighted that, completion of the Digital Single Market was a priority area for the Scottish Government and shared concerns on specific legislative measures within the Digital Single Market under negotiation which could reduce or undermine existing consumer protections; and requested clarity from the UK Government on their plans to progress on the completion of the Digital Single Market package during the transition period. The Minister also spoke in favour of work to scope out how the role of the JMC(E) should be developed in order to improve its effectiveness as a forum and to prepare for any period of transition to UK third country status.

30. The Scottish Government places significant value on the JMC(E) process as a means of securing input from the Devolved Administrations into on-going EU business. The Scottish Government will continue to work positively and constructively with the devolved administrations and the UK Government to better reflect both our distinct and shared priorities, and to collaborate effectively to influence on-going EU business.

EU Negotiations (JMC(EN))

31. The JMC (EU Negotiations) - JMC(EN) - was established as a new forum within the JMC machinery in response to the EU referendum result. Its agreed Terms of Reference are:

Working together in EU Negotiations

Through the JMC(EN) the governments will work collaboratively to:

- *discuss each government's requirements of the future relationship with the EU;*
- *seek to agree a UK approach to, and objectives for, Article 50 negotiations; and*

- *provide oversight of negotiations with the EU, to ensure, as far as possible, that outcomes agreed by all four governments are secured from these negotiations; and,*
- *discuss issues stemming from the negotiation process which may impact upon or have consequences for the UK Government, the Scottish Government, the Welsh Government or the Northern Ireland Executive.*

32. The forum operates in addition to existing forums, including the JMC(E), which will continue to meet to manage on-going business on EU issues, and the Finance Ministers' Quadrilateral. The JMC(EN) reports to, and is overseen by, the JMC(P).
33. The first four meetings of the JMC(EN) took place in the last year's reporting period. It was agreed that the Committee should convene monthly. The first meeting of the JMC(EN) which took place in the current reporting period was on 16 October 2017. This meeting ended an eight month hiatus between 8 February 2017 and 16 October 2017. Since October 2017, the JMC(EN) has met more regularly, with 5 meetings taking place between October 2017 and June 2018 (inclusive). However, this still falls short of the agreed intention for the JMC(EN) to meet monthly.
34. The fifth meeting of the JMC(EN) took place on 16 October 2017. The meeting was hosted by the UK Government in London and chaired by the First Secretary of State, Rt Hon Damian Green, MP. The then Minister for the UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell, MSP attended. The Committee discussed progress in the UK-EU negotiations and UK frameworks. The Minister reiterated the Scottish Government's view that the only means of mitigating the damage of leaving the EU is to remain in the European Single Market and EU Customs Union and asked for urgent clarity on the rights of EU citizens in the UK following exit. The Committee agreed general principles designed to ensure that devolution is respected in considering any UK or GB wide frameworks which may be necessary in the future. However, the Minister also pressed for the UK Government to accept the amendments proposed to the EU (Withdrawal) Bill.
35. The sixth JMC(EN) took place on 12 December 2017. The meeting was hosted by the UK Government in London and chaired by the First Secretary of State, Damian Green. The Minister for the UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe attended. At the meeting the Committee discussed progress in the UK-EU negotiations, and the role of the DAs in the second phase of negotiations. The Committee also considered UK Frameworks, the EU (Withdrawal) Bill and migration.
36. The seventh JMC(EN) took place on 22 February 2018. The meeting was hosted by the UK Government in London and chaired by the Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster and Minister for the Cabinet Office, the Rt Hon David Lidington MP. The Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe attended. At the meeting the Committee considered negotiations with the EU, including the proposed transition period, as well as UK Frameworks and the EU (Withdrawal) Bill. It was agreed that a paper on the involvement of the Devolved Administrations in the negotiations would be brought forward at the next JMC(EN) by the UK Government.
37. It was agreed that a further Ministerial meeting would be held to discuss domestic issues, namely the EU (Withdrawal) Bill and common (UK) frameworks. That eighth meeting of the JMC(EN) took place on 8 March 2018. The meeting was hosted by the

UK Government in London and chaired by the Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster and Minister for the Cabinet Office, David Lidington. The Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe attended. Discussion focused on reaching agreement on the amendment of clause 11 of the EU Withdrawal Bill and the repatriation of powers to the devolved legislatures. Ministers discussed the UK Government's proposed amendment to clause 11 and the timings for the Committee Stage debate in the House of Lords. Although agreement was not reached at this meeting, all administrations remained committed to continued dialogue and discussions. The Scottish Government made clear that if agreement was not possible, there remained the option of the Continuity Bill, which received overwhelming backing across the Scottish Parliament on 7 March. The UK Government produced for the meeting a list of areas for potential UK Frameworks, which had not been shared or discussed previously. The Scottish Government did not object to it being published.

38. The ninth JMC(EN) took place on 2 May 2018. The meeting was hosted by the UK Government in London and chaired by the Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster and Minister for the Cabinet Office, Rt Hon David Lidington, MP. The Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe attended. The Committee noted the UK Government's paper on the Devolved Administrations' role in negotiations. On the EU Withdrawal Bill, the Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe made clear the need for the Bill to be changed in order to protect devolution. The Committee also noted the need for continued engagement on common frameworks through multilateral official level discussions. The Minister ensured that the Culture, Tourism, Europe and External Relations Committee will be kept updated on the progress of these discussions.

39. The tenth JMC(EN) meeting took place on 22 June 2018 in Guernsey. The meeting was chaired by the Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster and Minister for the Cabinet Office, David Lidington. The Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe attended. The Committee discussed the latest negotiations between the UK-EU and looked ahead to the June European Council. The Committee also discussed the Department for Exiting the EU's planned White Paper on the Future Framework with the EU and the Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe repeated his call for the paper to be shared with the devolved administrations, and for the Scottish Government to be given the opportunity to feed in to the drafting process. The UK Government brought forward a paper on operational readiness, which the Committee considered and noted. The Minister also raised, under AOB, the disregard of the Sewel Convention over the EU (Withdrawal) Bill.

Ministerial Forum (EU Negotiations)

40. The creation of the Ministerial Forum was agreed at the JMC(EN) on 2 May 2018. The Forum sits beneath and feeds into discussions at the JMC(EN) specifically in relation to UK positions for the EU-UK Future Relationship. It is intended that the Forum will meet on a monthly basis. Since the first meeting of the Forum in May, the Forum has met on a monthly basis apart from July. Two meetings of the Ministerial Forum have taken place in the current reporting period.

41. The first meeting of the Ministerial Forum (EU Negotiations) took place on 24 May 2018. The meeting was hosted by the Scottish Government in Edinburgh and co-chaired by the Parliamentary Secretary (Minister for the Constitution) in the Cabinet

Office, Chloe Smith, MP and the Parliamentary Under Secretary of State at the Department for Exiting the EU, Robin Walker, MP. The Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell MSP, and the Minister for Community Safety and Legal Affairs, Annabelle Ewing MSP, attended on behalf of the Scottish Government. The Forum considered the role of the Ministerial Forum and a forward plan for meetings over the coming months. The Forum also provided an opportunity to discuss the UK Government's forthcoming White Paper on the future relationship with the EU, Mr Russell and Ms Ewing pressed for more detail on the paper and on how the devolved administrations would be involved in its preparation. Mr Russell stated he would like to have a further discussion on the UK Government's White Paper in the Joint Ministerial Committee (EU Negotiations) in the coming weeks, and requested that in advance of such a meeting the devolved administrations are given a confidential draft of the paper to enable a meaningful and substantive discussion.

42. The second meeting of the Forum took place on 27 June 2018. The meeting was hosted by the UK Government and co-chaired by the Parliamentary Secretary (Minister for the Constitution) in the Cabinet Office, Chloe Smith, and the Parliamentary Under Secretary of State at the Department for Exiting the EU, Robin Walker. The Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations, Michael Russell MSP, attended on behalf of the Scottish Government. The Forum discussed some specific policy areas expected to be included in the UK Government's forthcoming White paper on the future relationship with the EU. The Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations pressed the UK Government on the need for the paper to be shared, and for the devolved administrations to have influence over it. The Minister also made clear his expectation that a full copy of the draft paper would be shared before the next meeting of the JMC(EN), scheduled for 5 July. The Forum also discussed the sequencing of meetings for the Ministerial Forum (EU Negotiations) going forward.

Domestic (JMC(D))

43. The JMC(D) has not had cause to meet since March 2013 although the option remains open to ministers to reconvene as necessary.

Dispute Avoidance and Resolution

44. While the UK Government has not agreed to acknowledge the issue as a dispute, the Scottish and Welsh Governments continue to believe that Wales, Scotland and England should have received additional funding as a result of the £1bn allocation to Northern Ireland which underpinned the Conservative Party's confidence and supply arrangement with the Democratic Unionist Party (DUP) of Northern Ireland. As a means to make progress, a working group of HMT and DA officials was set up to consider the issues raised from the disagreement. The intention is that any amendments to the Statement of Funding Policy – which sets out how UK government funding for the Scottish government, Welsh government and Northern Ireland Executive is determined – could be adopted in the next version of the policy that will accompany the anticipated 2019 UK Spending Review.

Finance Ministers' Quadrilateral (FMQ)

45. The Finance Ministers' Quadrilateral (FMQ) is primarily used as a forum to bring forward finance issues that are common across the devolved administrations. The FMQ met once in the course of this reporting period. Normally there would be at least three FMQs in a reporting year, but due to the UK Parliament elections in May 2017 a meeting did not take place until October 2017 and there have been no further meetings since, with finance issues instead discussed in informal bilateral exchanges between the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work (Derek Mackay) and the Chief Secretary to the Treasury (Elizabeth Truss).
46. The location of each FMQ meeting rotates between London, Edinburgh, Cardiff and Belfast, with the meeting on 26 October 2017 held in London. The meeting was chaired by the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, and the Cabinet Secretary for Finance represented the Scottish Government. The agenda for the meeting included the UK economic outlook and UK budget, interactions between the administrations' budget timetables and tax policies, EU funding and the UK Government's guarantees, and the Northern Ireland financial agreement.
47. At the meeting, the Cabinet Secretary called on the UK Government to choose an alternative to austerity, invest in public services by lifting the 1% public sector pay cap, and reverse planned cuts in expenditure. He also raised concerns over the ongoing lack of clarity on future funding arrangements following the UK's exit from the EU and the need for more detail about how the UK Government's EU funding guarantees would operate in practice.

Joint Exchequer Committee (JEC)

48. The Joint Exchequer Committee (JEC) is a bilateral forum between the Scottish Government and UK Government. It was formed to ensure the smooth devolution of certain fiscal powers to the Scottish Government.
49. The (JEC) did not meet in the reporting period. As set out in the terms of reference agreed in Annex D of the Fiscal Framework, the Committee would normally be expected to meet twice annually, subject to there being substantive business to discuss. In this case, progress on Fiscal Framework implementation was made through Ministerial correspondence and did not require a Ministerial meeting.

Joint Ministerial Working Group on Welfare (JMWGW)

50. The Joint Ministerial Working Group for Welfare (JMWGW) is a bilateral inter-governmental forum, set up in February 2015 between the UK Government (Scotland Office and Department for Work and Pensions) and the Scottish Government to ensure the smooth devolution of social security and employability powers. Chairing of individual meetings alternate between the two Governments.
51. The forum is supported by a Joint Senior Officials' Group. The JMWGW has met on an ad-hoc basis, at meaningful points during the implementation of the devolution of welfare powers, in keeping with its Terms of Reference.

52. The group met three occasions within the reporting period April 2017 to June 2018. The first meeting, held on 14 September 2017, was hosted by Scottish Government and chaired by Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, Angela Constance. The meeting held 22 January 2018, was hosted by UK Government and was chaired by the Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell. The meeting held on 14 June 2018 was hosted by the Scottish Government in Edinburgh and was chaired by the Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, Angela Constance.
53. The JMWGW remains an effective forum for ministers to discuss important matters regarding the safe transfer and devolution of social security and employability powers, as well as their implementation. SG and UKG Ministers agreed to meet quarterly.

Agriculture Ministers' Forum

54. This Ministerial group agreed to aim to meet monthly to discuss the impact of the EU referendum result on agriculture, animal and plant health, environment, fisheries, marine, food and drink and the rural economy.
55. Within the reporting period, the group first met on 20 April 2017. A meeting scheduled for June 2017 was cancelled by Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra) following the announcement of the UK general election. The next meeting did not take place until 25 September 2017 and was followed by meetings on 6 November, 14 December, 26 February 2018, 26 March and 14 May.
56. There are no official communiqués issued from these meetings.
57. The group met in London on 20 April 2017 and attendees included Fergus Ewing, Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Scottish Government; George Eustice, Minister of State for Farming, Fisheries and Food (in the chair), and Guto Bebb, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Wales, UK Government; Lesley Griffiths, Cabinet Secretary for Environment and Rural Affairs, Welsh Government (by telephone); and the Permanent Secretary for the Department for Agriculture, Environment and Rural Affairs, Noel Lavery, representing the Northern Ireland Executive. The key points raised were an update from Defra on the Article 50 letter and the UK Government's Great Repeal Bill White Paper; the progress of Defra/Devolved Administrations working groups; and an opportunity to hear case studies from each administration on the complexity of product supply chains, trade flows and the potential impact of EU exit.
58. The meeting on 25 September 2017 in London was attended by Fergus Ewing, Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Connectivity and Roseanna Cunningham, Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Scottish Government; Michael Gove (in the chair), Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, UK Government; and Lesley Griffiths, Cabinet Secretary for Energy, Planning and Rural Affairs, Welsh Government. The Northern Ireland Executive was represented by officials. Discussions covered the Prime Minister's speech in Florence on 22 September and the reference to a proposed transition period; funding guarantees in regard to CAP Pillar 1 and Pillar 2 support up to 2022; and environmental ambitions.

59. The meeting on 6 November 2017 in London was attended by Fergus Ewing, Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Connectivity, and Roseanna Cunningham, Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Scottish Government; Rt Hon Michael Gove (in the chair) Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, UK Government; Lesley Griffiths, Cabinet Secretary for Energy, Planning and Rural Affairs, Welsh Government. The Northern Ireland Executive was represented by officials. Discussions covered trade preparations, frameworks, planned legislation, operational readiness, future funding and environmental ambitions.
60. The meeting on 14 December 2017 in London was attended by Roseanna Cunningham, Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Scottish Government; Rt Hon Michael Gove, Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (in the chair), George Eustice, Minister of State for Food and Farming, Lord Duncan, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Scotland and Northern Ireland and Guto Bebb, Parliamentary Under Secretary for Wales, UK Government; Lesley Griffiths, Cabinet Secretary for Energy, Planning and Rural Affairs, Welsh Government; and the Permanent Secretary, Department of Agriculture, Environment and Rural Affairs, Noel Lavery, representing the Northern Ireland Executive. Discussions covered operational readiness, sectoral readiness, environmental outcomes and Defra plans for EU exit related primary legislation.
61. The meeting on 26 February 2018 was held in Cardiff and attendees included Fergus Ewing, Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Connectivity, and Roseanna Cunningham, Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Scottish Government; Michael Gove, Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (in the chair), Shailesh Vara, Parliamentary Under-Secretary (Northern Ireland Office), UK Government; and Lesley Griffiths, Cabinet Secretary for Energy, Planning and Rural Affairs, Welsh Government. The Northern Ireland Executive was represented by officials. The main items discussed were frameworks, Defra's proposals for Agriculture and Fisheries Bills, environmental ambitions, environmental governance and funding. Scottish ministers expressed on-going commitment to a four-nation approach and noted concern at the lack of action by the UK Government, the continued lack of certainty over future funding, and Scottish Ministers' desire to work collaboratively to set a high ambition across the UK over future environmental standards. Scottish Ministers also asked for information sharing on joint interests to be improved.
62. The meeting on 26 March 2018 was in London and attendees included Fergus Ewing, Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Scottish Government; George Eustice, Minister of State for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, UK Government (in the chair); and Lesley Griffiths, Cabinet Secretary for Energy, Planning and Rural Affairs, Welsh Government. The Northern Ireland Executive was represented by officials. The main items discussed were the European Council meeting on 22-23 March; the UK Government's proposed Fisheries Bill; environmental ambitions; and frameworks and funding.
63. The final meeting for this reporting year was held on 14 May 2018 in Edinburgh, attended by Roseanna Cunningham, Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, (in the chair) and Fergus Ewing, Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Connectivity, Scottish Government; Michael Gove, Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs; Lesley Griffiths, Cabinet Secretary for

Energy, Planning and Rural Affairs, and Hannah Blythyn, Minister for Environment, Welsh Government. The Northern Ireland Executive was represented by officials. At the meeting, a range of priority issues were discussed relating to Brexit including, but not limited to: the potential role of the Devolved Administrations in negotiations with the EU; progress made by officials in relation to exploratory discussions on possible UK frameworks; operational and legislative preparations for Brexit (including updates on draft UK Government primary and secondary legislation); and future funding.

Other – Four Nations' Community Cohesion Forum

64. This forum was established with the aim of strengthening the working relationship between the UK Government and the Devolved Administrations, exploring any areas of common interest, and identifying opportunities to share best practice.
65. This has become an increasingly regular and formalised Ministerial-level inter-governmental forum, and so the Scottish Ministers will now report on it under the terms of our written agreement with the Scottish Parliament.
66. The hosting and chairing of meetings rotate between the four administrations. Whilst the forum was initially expected to meet at least once per year, the current frequency has seen meetings take place every 6-8 months. There have been two meetings within the reporting period.
67. There are no official communiques issued from these meetings.
68. At the meeting held on 12 October, hosted in Edinburgh and chaired by Ms Constance, Ministers discussed issues facing the Gypsy/Traveller community, along with the UK Government's Race Disparity Audit and interfaith dialogue. The Parliamentary Under Secretary of State (Lords) for Integration and Faith, Lord Bourne, attended representing UK Government; the Cabinet Secretary for Communities and Children, Carl Sargeant, attended representing the Welsh Government and the Northern Ireland Executive was represented by officials. Ms Constance outlined the high level of interest from the Scottish Parliament in addressing the inequalities faced by Gypsy/Travellers and highlighted the guidance the Scottish Government has produced for local authorities on providing support to these communities and the specific funding available. With regard to the UKG Race Disparity Audit, Ms Constance confirmed that the Scottish Government recently published its Equality Evidence Strategy detailing mechanisms to strengthen Scotland's equality evidence base, filling evidence gaps in Scotland to improve policy formulation and service provision. Interfaith Scotland also attended this meeting to update the group on their work in Scotland.
69. The second meeting this reporting period took place on 19 April 2018, hosted in Cardiff and chaired by the Welsh Government's Julie James, Leader of the House and Chief Whip. The Parliamentary Under Secretary of State (Lords) for Integration and Faith, Lord Bourne, attended representing UK Government; Ms Constance attended representing the Scottish Government and the Northern Ireland Executive was represented by officials. Ministers discussed the UK Government's Integration Strategy Green Paper Consultation and Ms Constance committed to providing a Scottish Government response to that. Ministers also discussed issues faced by

Asylum Seekers and Refugees and agreed that UK Government should explore establishing a similar Four Nations forum to discuss migration and asylum issues.

Other – Joint Tourism Ministers UK Government and Devolved Administrations Meeting

70. There is no specific convention in terms of regular meetings of the Tourism Ministers of the UK Government and Devolved Administrations. Meeting timings are determined largely by Ministerial availability. The Group has met twice during this reporting period.
71. The forum has been in operation, in its current form, since November 2015 and, as a formalised Ministerial-level inter-governmental forum, the Scottish Ministers will report on it under the terms of our written agreement with the Scottish Parliament.
72. There are no official communiques issued from these meetings.
73. The first meeting in this reporting period took place on 26 October 2017, hosted by the Welsh Government in Cardiff and chaired by Ken Skates AM, Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure. John Glen MP, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Arts, Heritage and Tourism attended representing UK Government; the Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs, Fiona Hyslop, attended representing the Scottish Government and the Northern Ireland Executive was represented by Dr. Andrew McCormick, Permanent Secretary, Department for the Economy. Key items raised by Ms Hyslop during the meeting included a request to review the membership of the UK Government's Tourism Industry Council to include greater Scottish representation; to seek further discussion on VAT rates in relation to tourism, particularly in light of the consideration given to Northern Ireland, and to ensure that visas do not become a barrier to existing, and new, visitor markets following Brexit. The Cabinet Secretary also sought clarity on the UK Government's approach to ensuring mobile companies improve connectivity within Scotland and stressed the importance of all nations continuing to work together to maximise the impact of the tourist industry to Scotland, with a joined-up approach to tourism elements of city and region deals.
74. The second meeting in this reporting period took place on 19 April 2018 and was hosted by the Scottish Government in Edinburgh and chaired by Ms Hyslop. Michael Ellis MP, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Arts, Heritage and Tourism attended representing UK Government; Lord Daffyd Elis-Thomas AM, Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure attended representing the Welsh Government and the Northern Ireland Executive was represented by Noel Laverty, Permanent Secretary, Department for the Economy. At the meeting Ms Hyslop highlighted the continued lack of clarity on the impacts of Brexit for Scotland's tourism industry and confirmed that key industry concerns were still centred on freedom of movement for visitors and employees, skills and rising import costs. She stressed that Scotland's interests must be reflected in the implementation of any proposed Tourism Sector Deal, with effective engagement between BEIS and the Devolved Administrations. Although tourism is a devolved area, there are an increasing number of issues of relevance to all parts of the United Kingdom. For strategic planning and to maximise the benefits to Scotland, it is important that there is regular, and effective collaboration on areas of mutual interest – particularly where these are reserved to the UK Government.

75. It is hoped that ongoing regular engagement of Tourism Ministers from the UK Government and the Devolved Administrations will serve to ensure that the benefits of the visitor economy support a level of inclusive growth that will reach all parts of the United Kingdom, including Scotland and, in particular, its most fragile, rural communities. This will be especially important as we face the uncertainty of Brexit and its potential impact on the tourism sector.

Informal Engagement (by portfolio)

A Note on Informal Engagement

76. The written agreement on inter-governmental relations also commits the Scottish Government to report on the range of broader inter-governmental engagement that has taken place during the year. The following pages provide information on the less-formal meetings that have taken place between Scottish Ministers and their counterparts in the UK Government, Welsh Government and Northern Ireland Executive in this reporting period.
77. It should be noted that ministers and portfolio remits were reorganised, between 26 and 27 June 2018, at the end of the period covered in this report. The information in this section therefore details the engagement under former portfolios by those Cabinet Secretaries and Ministers in-post prior to the reshuffle. There is no further engagement to report, under refreshed portfolios, within the short remainder of the reporting period.
78. Events, such as changes to ministerial positions in the Scottish Government and in our counterpart administrations may have precluded engagement at points throughout the year. However, those portfolios that are most heavily devolved, generally see lower levels of engagement at the Ministerial level. Apparent levels of ministerial-level engagement may not reflect the frequency and regularity of engagement and exchange at the informal official level.

First Minister

79. First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
22/08/2017	First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon	First Minister of Wales, Carwyn Jones	WG	SG/WG Relations
14/11/2017	First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon	Prime Minister, Theresa May	UKG	EU Exit, the Budget, and Political Culture.
12/03/2018	First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon	First Minister of Wales, Carwyn Jones	WG	EU Exit
14/03/2018	First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon	Prime Minister, Theresa May	UKG	Security and EU Exit.

22/06/2018	First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon	First Minister of Wales, Carwyn Jones	WG	EU Exit
------------	------------------------------------	---	----	---------

80. Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
20/04/2017	Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell <i>Also STUC, & Business Leaders</i>	UKG	Implications of EU Exit
27/07/2017	Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell	Cabinet Secretary for Finance & Local Government, Mark Drakeford	WG	EU (Withdrawal) Bill
09/08/2017	Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell	First Secretary of State, Damian Green	UKG	EU (Withdrawal) Bill
11/09/2017	Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell	Cabinet Secretary for Finance & Local Government, Mark Drakeford	WG	Implications of Brexit
25/09/2017	Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell	First Secretary of State, Damian Green	UKG	EU (Withdrawal) Bill

30/11/2017	Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell	First Secretary of State, Damian Green	UKG	EU (Withdrawal) Bill and UK Frameworks
------------	--	---	-----	--

Deputy First Minister and Education and Skills

81. Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
15/06/2017	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell	UKG	Education
27/07/2017	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	Secretary of State for the Home Department, Amber Rudd	UKG	Education
09/08/2017	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	First Secretary of State, Damian Green Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell	UKG	Education
12/09/2017	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	Cabinet Secretary for Education, Kirsty Williams	WG	Education

14/09/2017	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell	UKG	Education
25/09/2017	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	First Secretary of State, Damian Green	UKG	EU Exit
30/11/2017	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	First Secretary of State, Damian Green	UKG	EU Exit
01/02/2018	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	Minister for the Cabinet Office and Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster, David Lidington	UKG	EU Exit
23/03/2018	Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, John Swinney	Minister of State for Schools, Nick Gibb	UKG	Education

82. Minister for Childcare and Early Years, Maree Todd.

To note: The office was held by Mark McDonald until November 2017, when Ms Todd took on the role. We could identify no informal face-to-face, ministerial-level, engagement between Mr McDonald and UK or Devolved Administrations counterparts in this reporting period.

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
19/04/2018	Minister for Childcare and Early Years, Maree Todd	Minister for Children and Social Care, Huw Irranca-Davies	WG	Discussion on looked-after children.

83. Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science, Shirley-Ann Somerville.

To note: We could identify no informal face-to-face, ministerial-level, engagement between Ms Somerville and UK or Devolved Administrations counterparts in this reporting period.

84. Minister for Employability and Training, Jamie Hepburn

To note: We could identify no informal face-to-face, ministerial-level, engagement between Mr Hepburn and UK or Devolved Administrations counterparts in this reporting period.

Communities, Social Security and Equalities

85. Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, Angela Constance

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
12/07/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, Angela Constance	Minister for Immigration, Brandon Lewis	UKG	Refugees / Asylum
12/07/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, Angela Constance	Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, David Gauke	UKG	Social Security

12/10/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, Angela Constance	Cabinet Secretary for Communities and Children, Carl Sargeant	WG	Refugees / Asylum
18/12/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, Angela Constance	Minister for Immigration, Brandon Lewis	UKG	Refugees / Asylum

86. Minister for Social Security, Jeane Freeman

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
22/01/2018	Minister for Social Security, Jeane Freeman	Minister for Disabled People, Health and Work, Sarah Newton	UKG	Social Security
07/06/2018	Minister for Social Security, Jeane Freeman	Minister for Disabled People, Health and Work, Sarah Newton	UKG	Social Security

87. Minister for Local Government and Housing, Kevin Stewart

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
19/06/2017	Minister for Local Government and Housing, Kevin Stewart	Cabinet Secretary for Communities & Children, Carl Sargeant	WG	Local Government
27/11/2017	Minister for Local Government and Housing, Kevin Stewart	Minister of State for Housing and Planning, Alok Sharma	UKG	Housing

Culture, Tourism and External Affairs

88. Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs, Fiona Hyslop

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
19/04/2018	Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs, Fiona Hyslop	Minister for Culture, Tourism and Sport, Lord Elis-Thomas	WG	Culture and the Arts, Heritage, Broadcasting, Creative Industries, and Tourism

89. Minister for International Development and Europe, Alasdair Allan

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
14/07/2017	Minister for International Development and Europe, Alasdair Allan	Roundtable with WG Ministers?	WG	EU Exit
06/12/2017	Minister for International Development and Europe, Alasdair Allan	Minister of State for Exiting the European Union, Lord Callanan	UKG	Introductory

Economy, Jobs and Fair Work

90. Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
11/04/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Secretary of State for Business, Energy & Industrial Strategy, Greg Clark MP	UKG	UK Government's Industrial Strategy Green paper

20/04/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown Minister for UK Negotiations on Scotland's Place in Europe, Michael Russell	Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell <i>Also STUC, & Business Leaders</i>	UKG	Implications of EU Exit
03/07/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Secretary of State for Transport, Chris Grayling	UKG	Portfolio interests
03/07/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	UK Minister for Defence People and Veterans, Tobias Ellwood	UKG	Portfolio interests
07/09/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Parliamentary under Secretary of State for Scotland, Lord Duncan	UKG	Introductory meeting
06/10/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Economic Secretary to the Treasury, Stephen Barclay	UKG	Future of European Social Fund
16/11/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Secretary of State for Business, Energy & Industrial Strategy, Greg Clark MP	UKG	Industrial Strategy
07/12/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell	UKG	City deals

19/12/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Parliamentary under Secretary of State for Scotland, Lord Duncan	UKG	MOD Basing Review
01/02/2018	Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work, Keith Brown	Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell	UKG	Growth deals and partnership working between SG and the UKG

91. Minister for Business, Innovation and Energy, Paul Wheelhouse

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
10/04/2017	Minister for Business, Innovation and Energy, Paul Wheelhouse	Secretary of State for Business, Energy & Industrial Strategy, Greg Clark MP	UKG	Introductory Meeting

Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform

92. Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Roseanna Cunningham

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
21/06/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Roseanna Cunningham	Cabinet Secretary for Environment and Rural Affairs, Lesley Griffiths	WG	Environment / EU Exit
16/11/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Roseanna Cunningham	Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government, Mark Drakeford	WG	Introductory

14/05/2018	Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Roseanna Cunningham	Minister for Environment, Hannah Blythyn	WG	Environment
------------	--	--	----	-------------

Finance and the Constitution

93. Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution, Derek Mackay

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
31/08/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution, Derek Mackay	Financial Secretary to the Treasury, Mel Stride	UKG	Finance Issues / Air Passenger Duty
07/09/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution, Derek Mackay	Chief Secretary of the Treasury, Elizabeth Truss	UKG	Finance Issues / including UK Budget
11/09/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution, Derek Mackay	Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government, Mark Drakeford	WG	Inter-Governmental Business
21/06/2018	Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution, Derek Mackay	Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government, Mark Drakeford	WG	Inter-Governmental Business

94. Minister for Parliamentary Business, Joe Fitzpatrick

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
26/09/2017	Minister for Parliamentary Business, Joe Fitzpatrick	Parliamentary under Secretary of State for Scotland, Lord Duncan	UKG	Introductory

Health and Sport

95. Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport, Shona Robison

To note: We could identify no informal face-to-face, ministerial-level, engagement between Ms Robison and UK or Devolved Administrations counterparts in this reporting period.

96. Minister for Mental Health, Maureen Watt

To note: We could identify no informal face-to-face, ministerial-level, engagement between Ms Watt and UK or Devolved Administrations counterparts in this reporting period.

97. Minister for Public Health and Sport, Aileen Campbell

To note: We could identify no informal face-to-face, ministerial-level, engagement between Ms Campbell and UK or Devolved Administrations counterparts in this reporting period.

Justice

98. Cabinet Secretary for Justice, Michael Matheson

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
27/07/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Justice, Michael Matheson	Secretary of State for the Home Department, Amber Rudd Cabinet Secretary for Communities and Children, Carl Sargeant	UKG WG	National Police Memorial Day Event Cardiff
23/04/2017	Cabinet Secretary for Justice, Michael Matheson	Secretary of State for Justice, David Lidington	UKG	
24/04/2018	Cabinet Secretary for Justice, Michael Matheson	Secretary of State for Justice, David Gauke	UKG	

99. Minister for Community Safety and Legal Affairs, Annabelle Ewing

To note: We could identify no informal face-to-face, ministerial-level, engagement between Ms Ewing and UK or Devolved Administrations counterparts in this reporting period.

Rural Economy and Connectivity

100. Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Fergus Ewing

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
06/11/2017	Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Fergus Ewing	Minister of State for Digital and Culture, Matt Hancock MP	UKG	Connectivity
06/11/2017	Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Fergus Ewing	Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, Michael Gove	UKG	Rural Economy
28/11/2017	Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Fergus Ewing	Minister of State for Digital and Culture, Matt Hancock MP	UKG	Connectivity
05/02/2018	Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Fergus Ewing	Minister for Environment, Hannah Blythyn	WG	Forestry
26/02/2018	Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy and Connectivity, Fergus Ewing	Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, Michael Gove	UKG	Agriculture / EU Exit

101. Minister for Transport and the Islands, Humza Yousaf

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Description
22/01/2018	Minister for Transport and the Islands, Humza Yousaf	Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Transport, Baroness Sugg	UKG	Discussion on Aviation
12/06/2018	Minister for Transport and the Islands, Humza Yousaf	Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Transport, Baroness Sugg	UKG	Discussion on Aviation

Law Officers

102. Lord Advocate, James Wolffe and Solicitor General, Alison Di Rollo

Date	SG Minister	External Minister	Admin	Event
30/06/2017	Lord Advocate, James Wolffe Solicitor General Alison di Rollo	Welsh Counsel General, Mick Antoniw, H.M. Procureur for Guernsey, Megan Pullum. Attorney General for Jersey, Robert Macrae Attorney General for Gibraltar, Michael Llamas	WG Guernsey Jersey Gibraltar	Law Officer conference
27/07/2017	Lord Advocate, James Wolffe	Welsh Counsel General, Mick Antoniw and Welsh Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Mark Drakeford.	WG	Civil legal matters
30/11/2017	Lord Advocate, James Wolffe Solicitor General, Alison Di Rollo	Welsh Counsel General, Jeremy Miles	WG	Introductory meeting
14/12/2017	Lord Advocate, James Wolffe	Secretary of State for Scotland, David Mundell MP	UKG	Prosecution matters

01/06/2018	Lord Advocate James Wolffe Solicitor General Alison di Rollo	Welsh Counsel General, Mick Antoniw, Attorney General for Northern Ireland, John Larkin. H.M. Procureur for Guernsey, Megan Pullum. Attorney General for Jersey, Robert Macrae Attorney General for the Isle of Man, John Quinn	WG NI Guernsey Jersey Isle of Man	Law Officer Conference
------------	---	--	--	---------------------------