



Our reference WATTE/358022-19

3 March 2020

Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee
FAO: Clerk to the Committee, Steve Farrell

by email only: rec.committee@parliament.scot

Dear Mr Farrell

Inquiry into construction and procurement of ferry vessels in Scotland

Thank you for your letter dated 27 February 2020.

As requested, I am asked by my client CMAL to confirm as follows.

The unsuccessful bidders following the responses to the Invitation to Tender (CMAL0060) for these vessels were (in alphabetical order):

1. Cammell Laird, England
2. Flensburger Schiffbau-Gesellschaft, Germany
3. Nordic Yards, Germany
4. Remontowa Shipbuilding, Poland
5. Sefine Shipyard, Turkey

The bid proposals from the 6 companies (including FMEL) were received at CMAL offices on 31 March 2015. One of the bidders submitted two designs, giving a total of 7 designs to be evaluated. In the evaluation, the names of the bidders were anonymised and the 7 designs were identified as Ship A, Ship B, Ship C, Ship D, Ship E, Ship F and Ship G.

Within the tripartite working relationship between Transport Scotland, CMAL and CalMac the "RACI" sets out the roles and responsibilities and the evaluation steps for vessel replacement. On the day when the tenders were received and opened CMAL and CalMac checked the tender documents for completeness, following which both CMAL and CalMac representatives reviewed the tender documents over a 2 month period in CMAL offices. Further clarifications took a further 2 months.

The essential requirements determining the design of the vessel and hull form were the requirements for: length, beam, draught, speed and propulsion power, LNG power plant and LNG storage, 900 tonnes deadweight and 1000 passengers. This initial review identified 3 designs as potential candidates, based on the basic statement of requirements provided as [Annex 1](#) to this letter, namely: Ship B, Ship D and Ship F.

Active-17351142-6/358022-19

Addleshaw Goddard LLP, Exchange Tower, 19 Canning Street, Edinburgh EH3 8EH
Tel +44 (0)131 228 2400 Fax +44 (0)131 222 9800 DX ED27 Edinburgh
www.addleshawgoddard.com

Addleshaw Goddard LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales (with registered number OC318149) and is authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority and the Law Society of Scotland. A list of members is open to inspection at our registered office, Milton Gate, 60 Chiswell Street, London EC1Y 4AG. The term partner refers to any individual who is a member of any Addleshaw Goddard entity or association or an employee or consultant with equivalent standing and qualifications.

A naval architect practice named OST-IMT was also engaged by CMAL to consider the bids from a detailed technical perspective, also on an anonymous basis and using the same lettering identifiers for each of the 7 bid designs. A report was issued by OST-IMT on 1 June 2015 in which the following criteria were assessed:

- Length
- Beam
- Depth
- Draught
- Total Lightship Weight
- Lightship Component Weights
- Lightship VCG
- Deadweight
- Block Coefficient
- Hull Form
- Stability Information
- Propulsion Power Prediction
- Subdivision Operations
- General Arrangement Observations

A report to the CMAL Board was prepared, dated 17 August 2015, presenting the findings of the evaluation on the compliance and quality of the various tender submissions. In this report, the following criteria were assessed:

- Basic Statement of Requirements
- Principal Dimensions
- Length
- Beam
- Draught
- Depth
- Double Bottom height
- Hoistable Car Decks Clear Heights
- Displacement
- Lightship Weight
- Deadweight estimate
- Block Coefficient
- Speed/Power
- Engines
- Engine Loadings
- Vehicle Carrying Capacities
- Vehicle Deck Width
- Passengers Arrangements
- General Arrangement Drawings
- Environmental Noise
- Station Holding Capability
- Electrical system / electrical load balance
- RoRo Equipment

Shipyards A, C, E and G were judged not to be potential candidates due to the following:

Shipyards A: Exceeds the maximum specified beam of 17m and the deadweight at 3.4m draft is less than the required deadweight of 900 tonnes.

Shipyards C: Does not meet requirements for: machinery arrangement (does not meet baseline requirements), environmental noise, station holding, and has least car carrying capacity.

3 March 2020

Shipyard E: The propulsion power at service speed of 16.5 knots is over 1000 kW higher than the other designs and hence uses more fuel increasing emissions and gives higher operational costs.

Shipyard G: The lightship weight is significantly less than the other designs and other vessels in the Calmac fleet and considered to be underestimated and therefore gives very significant degree of concern and presents very high risk.

Shipyard B was identified as the leading bid. Shipyard B was FMEL.

Please let me know if there is any further information that the Committee may find useful.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Ed Watt', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Ed Watt
Partner

Addleshaw Goddard LLP

Direct line 0131 222 9843
Email ed.watt@addleshawgoddard.com

Annex 1

Basic statement of requirements	
Area of operation	Unrestricted domestic Class B EU directive 2009/45/EC
Principal Dimensions	Length Overall 102.40 m Breadth Moulded 17.0 m Normal Operational Draught 3.40 m Design Draught 3.60 m Scantling Draught 3.70 m Frame Spacing 600 mm
Classification Notation	Lloyd's Register of Shipping LRS +100 A1, Roll On-Roll Off Cargo and Passenger Ship,+LMC, PCAC 2, UMS, IFP, IWS, SCM, NAV1, ECO, LI, IHM, EU (B) GF, Green Passport Alternatively, the following DNV equivalent notation may be accepted. To be discussed with Buyer prior to contract; DNV X1A1, ICE-1A, Car Ferry A, MCDK, PWDK, COMF-V(2), E0, F-M, BIS, TMON, NAUT-AW, CLEAN, LCS-DC, VIBR, GAS FUELLED, Recyclable
Environmental Operating Conditions	Sea temperature range 0°C to 24°C Air temperature range -10°C to +30°C
Environmental Noise	The Builder shall guarantee a noise level outside of the vessel of 65 dB (A) 1 m from the noise source. This translates as a rough guidance to 30 dB (A) in a distance of 65 m from the vessel for a maximum of 6 noise sources (measurement procedure acc. to ISO 2922). The vessel shall also comply with WHO document Night Noise Guidelines for Europe 2009 and EU and proposed FP 7 SILENTV Green Label limits.
Ports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uig • Tarbert • Lochmaddy • Ardrossan • Brodick • Oban I • Oban II • Coll • Tiree • Castlebay • Lochboisdale • Colonsay • Gourrock • Ullapool (relief) • Stornoway (relief)
Manoeuvring	Unassisted berthing ability of the vessel in minimum 50 knots beam winds. Three (3) tunnel thrusters shall be fitted forward for manoeuvring and holding station Two off (2) Wartsila Energopac or equivalent, efficiency bulb, hinged flap type rudders

Basic statement of requirements															
Service speed	16.5 knots and 14.5 knots														
Tank capacities	<table> <tr> <td>Marine Gas Oil</td> <td>approx 120 to 130 m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>LNG (1 x 120 m³)</td> <td>approx 120 m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Potable Water</td> <td>approx 100 m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Water Ballast (to be finalised during design)</td> <td>approx 400 m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Technical Water</td> <td>approx 10 m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Lub Oil</td> <td>approx 20 m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Food Waste</td> <td>approx 12 m³</td> </tr> </table>	Marine Gas Oil	approx 120 to 130 m ³	LNG (1 x 120 m ³)	approx 120 m ³	Potable Water	approx 100 m ³	Water Ballast (to be finalised during design)	approx 400 m ³	Technical Water	approx 10 m ³	Lub Oil	approx 20 m ³	Food Waste	approx 12 m ³
Marine Gas Oil	approx 120 to 130 m ³														
LNG (1 x 120 m ³)	approx 120 m ³														
Potable Water	approx 100 m ³														
Water Ballast (to be finalised during design)	approx 400 m ³														
Technical Water	approx 10 m ³														
Lub Oil	approx 20 m ³														
Food Waste	approx 12 m ³														
Deadweight, number of passengers, cars and HGVs	<table> <tr> <td>Deadweight:</td> <td>900 tonnes at 3.4 m draught</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Deadweight:</td> <td>1180 tonnes at 3.6 m draught</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Number of Passengers:</td> <td>1000</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Number of Cars:</td> <td>83 cars on vehicle deck, 44 cars on hoistable car decks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Number of HGVs</td> <td>16</td> </tr> </table>	Deadweight:	900 tonnes at 3.4 m draught	Deadweight:	1180 tonnes at 3.6 m draught	Number of Passengers:	1000	Number of Cars:	83 cars on vehicle deck, 44 cars on hoistable car decks	Number of HGVs	16				
Deadweight:	900 tonnes at 3.4 m draught														
Deadweight:	1180 tonnes at 3.6 m draught														
Number of Passengers:	1000														
Number of Cars:	83 cars on vehicle deck, 44 cars on hoistable car decks														
Number of HGVs	16														
Crew accommodation	<p>Crew sleeping, recreational and operational facilities shall be arranged for up to 30 crew plus 2 cadets.</p> <p>Cabins:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Captain suite • Chief engineer suite • Two (2) Senior officer suites, • Four (4) officers cabins, • and Two (2) cadets cabins • 22 crew cabins 														